

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

JAMES REILLY DOLAN  
Acting General Counsel  
  
ROBERT J. QUIGLEY, SBN 302879  
rquigley@ftc.gov  
BARBARA CHUN, SBN 186907  
bchun@ftc.gov  
MILES D. FREEMAN, SBN 299302  
mfreeman@ftc.gov  
MATTHEW H. FINE, SBN 300808  
mfine@ftc.gov  
Federal Trade Commission  
10990 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 400  
Los Angeles, CA 90024  
Tel: (310) 824-4300  
Fax: (310) 824-4380

Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission  
  
[Additional Attorneys for Plaintiffs and Defendants Listed on Signature Pages]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION and  
THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF  
CALIFORNIA,  
  
Plaintiffs,  
  
v.  
  
FRONTIER COMMUNICATIONS  
CORPORATION, *et al.*,  
  
Defendants.

Case No. 2:21-cv-4155 RGK-MAA  
  
STIPULATION AS TO ENTRY  
OF ORDER FOR  
PERMANENT INJUNCTION,  
MONETARY JUDGMENT, AND  
OTHER RELIEF

Plaintiffs, the Federal Trade Commission (“Commission” or “FTC”) and the

1 People of the State of California (“California,” or the “People”), by and through the  
2 District Attorneys of Los Angeles County and Riverside County (collectively,  
3 “Plaintiffs”) filed their Complaint for Preliminary Injunction, Permanent Injunction,  
4 Monetary Relief and Other Relief (“Complaint”), in this matter, pursuant to Section  
5 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and  
6 California Unfair Competition Law (“UCL”), Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200 *et seq.*, and the  
7 California False Advertising Law (“FAL”), Bus. & Prof. Code § 17500, *et seq.* On or  
8 about April 30, 2021, Defendant Frontier Communications Corp. dissolved and  
9 substantially all of its assets vested in Defendant Frontier Communications Holdings,  
10 LLC, which in turn is wholly owned by Defendant Frontier Communications  
11 Intermediate, LLC, which in turn is wholly owned by Frontier Communications Parent,  
12 Inc. (hereinafter collectively referred to as “Defendants”). Plaintiffs and Defendants  
13 stipulate to the entry of a Stipulated Order for Permanent Injunction, Monetary  
14 Judgment, and Other Relief (“Stipulated Order”) to resolve all matters in dispute in this  
15 action between them.

16 Plaintiffs and Defendants have agreed to entry of the Stipulated Order (lodged  
17 concurrently with this Stipulation) to resolve all claims against Defendants in this action.  
18 Plaintiffs and Defendants have consented to entry of the Stipulated Order without trial or  
19 adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein.

20 Plaintiffs and Defendants hereby stipulate to entry of a Stipulated Order for  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Permanent Injunction, Monetary Judgment, and Other Relief with the following terms:

2 **FINDINGS**

3 1. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this matter.

4 2. The Complaint charges that Defendants participated in deceptive and unfair acts  
5 or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and Sections 17500  
6 and 17200 of California Business and Professions Code, Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code  
7 and 17200 of California Business and Professions Code, Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code  
8 §§ 17500, 17200, in connection with the marketing and sale of residential digital  
9 subscriber line (“DSL”) Internet service and the billing, charging, or collecting for that  
10 DSL Internet service.

11 3. Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the claims or allegations in the  
12 Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order. Only for purposes of this action,  
13 Defendants admit the facts necessary to establish personal jurisdiction.

14 4. Defendants waive any claim that they may have under the Equal Access to Justice  
15 Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action through the date of this  
16 Order, and agrees to bear its own costs and attorney fees.

17 5. Defendants and Plaintiffs waive all rights to appeal or otherwise challenge or  
18 contest the validity of this Order.  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **DEFINITIONS**

2 For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions apply:

3 A. **“Advertised Speed”** means the download speed advertised or offered, including  
4 at point of sale, in association with a specific Internet Service Plan, such as “18 Mbps,”  
5 “As Fast As 18 Mbps,” “Max Speeds As Fast As 18 Mbps,” or “9 to 18 Mbps.”

7 B. **“Clear(ly) and Conspicuous(ly)”** means that a required disclosure is difficult to  
8 miss (*i.e.*, easily noticeable) and easily understandable by ordinary consumers, including  
9 in all of the following ways:  
10

11 1. In any communication that is solely visual or solely audible, the disclosure  
12 must be made through the same means through which the communication is  
13 presented. In any communication made through both visual and audible means,  
14 such as a television advertisement, the disclosure must be made visually or  
15 audibly.  
16

17 2. A visual disclosure, by its size, contrast, location, the length of time it  
18 appears, and other characteristics, must stand out from any accompanying text or  
19 other visual elements so that it is easily noticed, read, and understood.  
20

21 3. An audible disclosure, including by telephone or streaming video, must be  
22 delivered in a volume, speed, and cadence sufficient for ordinary consumers to  
23 easily hear and understand it.  
24

25 4. In any communication using an interactive electronic medium, such as the  
26 Internet or software, the disclosure must be unavoidable.  
27  
28

1 5. The disclosure must use diction and syntax understandable to ordinary  
2 consumers and must appear in each language in which the representation that  
3 requires the disclosure appears.  
4

5 6. The disclosure must comply with these requirements in each medium  
6 through which it is received, including all electronic devices and face-to-face  
7 communications.  
8

9 7. The disclosure must not be contradicted or mitigated by, or inconsistent  
10 with, anything else in the communication.  
11

12 8. When the representation or sales practice targets a specific audience, such  
13 as children, the elderly, or the terminally ill, “ordinary consumers” includes  
14 reasonable members of that group.  
15

16 C. **“Close Proximity”** means that the disclosure is very near the triggering  
17 representation. For example, a disclosure made through a hyperlink, pop-up, interstitial,  
18 or other similar technique is not in close proximity to the triggering representation.  
19

20 D. **“Congestion Report”** means Frontier’s “Monthly DSLAM Congestion Report,”  
21 which provides congestion information for all DSLAM uplinks and the circuits that  
22 affect more than one DSLAM, including Host, Aggregator, and BRAS uplinks.  
23

24 E. **“Customer”** means a consumer who subscribes to an Internet Service Plan with  
25 an Advertised Speed.  
26  
27  
28

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.