

1 Mark Selwyn (SBN 244180)
2 mark.selwyn@wilmerhale.com
3 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
4 HALE AND DORR LLP
5 2600 El Camino Real, Suite 400
6 Palo Alto, California 94306
7 Telephone: (650) 858-6031
8 Facsimile: (650) 858-6100

9 *Attorney for Plaintiffs*

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
FRESNO DIVISION

UNITED FARM WORKERS and UFW
FOUNDATION,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
LABOR and MARTIN J. WALSH, in his
official capacity as United States Secretary of
Labor,¹

Defendants.

Case No. 1:20-cv-01690-DAD-JLT

**PLAINTIFF'S REPLY IN FURTHER
SUPPORT OF THEIR
MOTION TO ENFORCE
COMPLIANCE WITH THE COURT'S
PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION**

Motion Date: April 20, 2021

¹ Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 25(d), Secretary Martin J. Walsh has been automatically substituted for former Acting Secretary Milton Al Stewart.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

1

2

3 INTRODUCTION 1

4 ARGUMENT 3

5 I. The Court Never Excused Defendants From Their Duty to Publish Timely 2021

6 AEWRs 3

7 II. The Court Is Authorized to Order Wage Adjustments 6

8 III. The Equities Favor Ordering Wage Adjustment 8

9 CONCLUSION 14

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

1
2
3
4 *County of Los Angeles v. Shalala*,
192 F.3d 1005 (D.C. Cir. 1999)7
5
6 *Democratic Central Committee of D.C. v. Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Commision*,
485 F.2d 786 (D.C. Cir. 1973) (DCC)2, 6, 13
7
8 *Frederick County Fruit Growers Ass’n, Inc. v. McLaughlin*,
709 F. Supp. 242 (D.D.C. 1989)11
9
10 *Frederick County Fruit Growers Ass’n, Inc. v. McLaughlin*,
703 F. Supp. 1021 (D.D.C. 1989) (FCFGA I)8
11
12 *Frederick County Fruit Growers Ass’n v. Martin*,
968 F.2d 1265 (D.C. Cir. 1992) (FCFGA II).....6, 9, 11, 13
13
14 *Hsiao v. Stewart*,
No. 18-cv-502-JAO-KJM, 2021 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 54402 (D. Haw. Mar. 23, 2021)8
15
16 *Immigrant Legal Resource Center v. Wolf*,
No. 20-cv-05883-JSW, 2020 WL 5798269 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 29, 2020).....8
17
18 *Morrison v. U.S. Department of Labor*,
713 F. Supp. 664 (S.D.N.Y. 1989).....7, 11
19
20 *NAACP v. Donovan*,
558 F. Supp. 218 (D.D.C. 1982) (NAACP I)5, 10, 12, 13
21
22 *NAACP, Jefferson County Branch v. Donovan*,
566 F. Supp. 1202 (D.D.C. 1983) (NAACP II)5, 6
23
24 *Palisades General Hospital Inc. v. Leavitt*,
426 F.3d 400 (D.C. Cir. 2005)7, 8

DOCKETED CASES

25 *Bragg v. Donovan*, No. 82-2361 (D.D.C.).....5
26
27 *United Farm Workers v. Dep’t of Labor*, No. 1:20-cv-1690-DAD-JLT (E.D. Cal.).....1, 4, 9, 13
28
29 *United Farm Workers v. Perdue*, No. 1:20-cv-1452-DAD-JLT (E.D. Cal.).....1

STATUTES, RULES, AND REGULATIONS

5 U.S.C.

§ 705.....8
 § 706.....8

20 C.F.R.

§ 655.120(b)(2)3
 § 655.120(c)6
 § 655.122(l).....3, 6

60 Fed. Reg. 45,778 (Sept. 1, 1995)7

*Adverse Effect Wage Rate Methodology for the Temporary Employment of H-2A Nonimmigrants
 in Non-Range Occupations in the United States*, 85 Fed. Reg. 70,445 (Nov. 5, 2020).....13

Employment and Training Administration, 84 Fed. Reg. 69,774 (Dec. 19, 2019).....3

OTHER AUTHORITIES

U.S. Dep’t of Labor, Employment and Training Administration – Announcements (Jan. 15,
 2021), <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/eta/foreign-labor/news>11

U.S. Dep’t of Labor, Employment and Training Administration – Performance Data – H-2A
 Disclosure Data FY2020, https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ETA/oflc/pdfs/H-2A_Disclosure_Data_FY2020.xlsx (last visited Mar. 10, 2021).....1

U.S. Dep’t of Labor, Employment and Training Administration – Performance Data – H-2A
 Disclosure Data FY2021 Q1,
https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ETA/oflc/pdfs/H2A_Disclosure_Data_FY2021_Q1.xlsx (last visited Mar. 10, 2021)1

INTRODUCTION

1
2 H-2A workers and U.S. farmworkers in corresponding employment were denied the wage
3 increases to which they were entitled for the first two months of 2021, likely costing the typical
4 California farmworker \$325 and farmworkers nationwide more than \$10 million in aggregate.² For
5 farmworkers and their families already struggling to survive on subsistence incomes, this is a significant
6 loss. And they suffered that loss solely because the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL), in coordination
7 with the U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA), unlawfully sought to alter the H-2A program to
8 transfer billions of dollars from farmworkers to growers through an unpermitted freeze of DOL's
9 Adverse Effect Wage Rates (AEWRs). Had the Government complied promptly with this Court's
10 injunction in *United Farm Workers v. Perdue*, No. 1:20-cv-1452-DAD-JLT (E.D. Cal. Oct. 28, 2020)
11 (*Perdue* Injunction), DOL would have been able to promulgate updated 2021 AEWRs before the end of
12 calendar year 2020, as the H-2A program regulations require, and rates would have increased
13 accordingly. But DOL nonetheless failed to timely publish updated AEWRs as the law requires.
14 Plaintiffs now respectfully request that the Court order Defendants to direct growers to reimburse
15 farmworkers for the wages lost between January 1, 2021 and February 23, 2021, to prevent farmworkers
16 from bearing the costs of the Government's illegal administrative actions, as contemplated by the
17 Court's preliminary injunction and supplemental order of January 12, 2021. *See* Order, *United Farm*
18 *Workers v. Dep't of Labor*, No. 1:20-cv-1690-DAD-JLT (E.D. Cal. Dec. 23, 2020), ECF No. 37 (PI
19 Order); Suppl. Order Regarding Prelim. Inj. Relief, *United Farm Workers v. Dep't of Labor*, No. 1:20-
20 cv-1690-DAD-JLT (E.D. Cal. Dec. 23, 2020), ECF No. 39 (Suppl. Order).

21 Defendants contest relatively little of Plaintiff's motion. They dispute neither the likely amounts
22 due to qualifying farmworkers nor the Government's sole responsibility for those lost wages. Nor does
23 DOL suggest that Plaintiffs' proposed remedy would be administratively impracticable.

24
25
26 ² See U.S. Dep't of Labor, Employment and Training Administration – Performance Data – H-2A Disclosure Data
27 FY2021 Q1, https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ETA/oflc/pdfs/H2A_Disclosure_Data_FY2021_Q1.xlsx (last visited
28 Mar. 10, 2021); U.S. Dep't of Labor, Employment and Training Administration – Performance Data – H-2A Disclosure Data
FY2020, https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/ETA/oflc/pdfs/H-2A_Disclosure_Data_FY2020.xlsx (last visited Mar. 10,
2021).

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.