

THE LAW OFFICE OF JACK FITZGERALD, PC

JACK FITZGERALD (SBN 257370)

jack@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

TREVOR M. FLYNN (SBN 253362)

trevor@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

MELANIE PERSINGER (SBN 275423)

melanie@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

Hillcrest Professional Building

3636 Fourth Avenue, Suite 202

San Diego, California 92103

Phone: (619) 692-3840

Fax: (619) 362-9555

JACKSON & FOSTER, LLC

SIDNEY W. JACKSON, III (*pro hac vice*)

sid@jacksonfosterlaw.com

75 St. Michael Street

Mobile, Alabama 36602

Phone: (251) 433-6699

Fax: (251) 433-6127

Class Counsel

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

DEBBIE KROMMENHOCK and STEPHEN
HADLEY, on behalf of themselves, all others
similarly situated, and the general public,

Plaintiffs,

v.

POST FOODS, LLC,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:16-cv-04958-WHO

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR
PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS
ACTION SETTLEMENT**

Judge: Hon. William H. Orrick
Hearing Date: Feb. 24, 2021, 2:00 p.m.
Location: Courtroom 2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1

2 TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iii

3

4 NOTICE OF MOTION.....1

5 ISSUES TO BE DECIDED1

6 MEMORANDUM OF POINTS & AUTHORITIES.....1

7

8 I. INTRODUCTION1

9 II. PROCEDURAL HISTORY & SETTLEMENT NEGOTIATIONS2

10 III. THE SETTLEMENT5

11

12 A. The Settlement Class.....5

13 B. Benefits for the Settlement Class.....5

14 1. Post will Establish a \$15 Million Non-Reversionary Settlement

15 Fund5

16 2. Post will Make Substantial Labeling Commitments, Saving the

17 Class Millions6

18 C. Class Notice and Claims Administration.....7

19 D. The Settlement’s Release.....7

20 E. Opting Out8

21 F. Objecting.....8

22 G. Attorneys’ Fees, Costs, and Service Awards8

23 H. Timeline9

24

25 V. ARGUMENT10

26 A. The Court Should Certify the Settlement Class.....10

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1.	The Requirements of Rule 23(a) are Satisfied	10
a.	Numerosity.....	10
b.	Commonality.....	10
c.	Typicality	10
d.	Adequacy	11
2.	The Requirements of Rule 23(b)(3) are Satisfied	11
a.	Predominance.....	11
b.	Superiority.....	15
B.	The Court Should Approve the Proposed Settlement	15
1.	The Settlement is the Product of Serious, Informed, Non-Collusive Negotiations	15
2.	The Settlement Does Not Grant Preferential Treatment Improperly	17
3.	The Settlement Falls within the Range of Possible Approval	17
a.	The <i>Churchill Village</i> Factors Favor Preliminary Approval	18
b.	The Monetary Relief is Fair in Relation to Potential Damages.....	21
c.	The Injunctive Relief is Appropriate and Meaningful	22
d.	The Court will be Empowered to Determine Reasonable Fees, Costs, and Service Awards	23
4.	The Settlement has No Obvious Deficiencies	24
C.	The Court Should Approve the Class Notice and Notice Plan	25
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

1

2

3 *Allen v. ConAgra Foods, Inc.*,

4 2019 WL 5191009 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 15, 2019)..... 19

5 *Alvarez v. Farmers Ins. Exch.*,

6 2017 WL 2214585 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 18, 2017)..... 24

7 *Amchem Prods., Inc. v. Windsor*,

8 521 U.S. 591 (1997)..... 11, 12

9 *Boeing Co. v. Van Gemert*,

10 444 U.S. 472 (1980)..... 23

11 *Bolton v. U.S. Nursing Corp.*,

12 2013 WL 5700403 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 18, 2013)..... 24

13 *Bradach v. Pharmavite, LLC*,

14 735 Fed. Appx. 251 (9th Cir. 2018)..... 13

15 *Briseno v. ConAgra Foods, Inc.*,

16 844 F.3d 1121 (9th Cir. 2017) 25

17 *Broomfield v. Craft Brew Alliance, Inc.*,

18 2020 WL 1972505 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 5, 2020) 13

19 *Bruno v. Quten Research Inst., LLC*,

20 2013 WL 990495 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 13, 2013)..... 23

21 *Butler v. Porsche Cars N. Am., Inc.*,

22 2017 WL 1398316 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 19, 2017) 14

23 *Campbell v. Facebook, Inc.*,

24 951 F.3d 1106 (9th Cir. 2020) 15, 16

25 *Carter v. XPO Logistics, Inc.*,

26 2019 WL 5295125 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 18, 2019)..... 21

27 *Castro v. Paragon Indus., Inc.*,

28 2020 WL 1984240 (E.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2020)..... 12

29 *Chambers v. Whirlpool Corp.*,

30 980 F.3d 645 (9th Cir. 2020) 23

Chevron Env't'l. Mgmt. Co. v. BKK Corp.,

2013 WL 5587363 (E.D. Cal. Oct. 10, 2013)..... 21

1 *Churchill Village v. Gen. Elec.*,
 2 361 F.3d 566 (9th Cir. 2004) 18

3 *Cortes v. Nat’l Credit Adjusters, L.L.C.*,
 4 2020 WL 3642373 (E.D. Cal. July 6, 2020) 12

5 *Custom LED, LLC v. eBay, Inc.*,
 6 2014 WL 2916871 (N.D. Cal. June 24, 2014) 22

7 *Daugherty v. Am. Honda Motor Co.*,
 8 144 Cal. App. 4th 824 (2006) 14

9 *Dennis v. Kellogg Co.*,
 697 F.3d 858 (9th Cir. 2012) 6

10 *Deposit Guar. Nat’l Bank v. Roper*,
 11 445 U.S. 326 (1980) 15

12 *Dickey v. Advanced Micro Devices, Inc.*,
 2019 WL 4918366 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 4, 2019) 25

13 *Edwards v. Nat’l Milk Producers Fed’n*,
 14 2017 WL 3623734 (N.D. Cal. June 26, 2017) 19, 25

15 *Gaudin v. Saxon Mortg. Servs., Inc.*,
 16 2015 WL 4463650 (N.D. Cal. July 21, 2015) 21

17 *Hadley v. Kellogg Sales Co.*,
 324 F. Supp. 1084 (N.D. Cal. 2018) 11

18 *Hale v. Manna Pro Prod., LLC*,
 19 2020 WL 3642490 (E.D. Cal. July 6, 2020) 16

20 *Hanlon v. Chrysler Corp.*,
 21 150 F.3d 1011 (9th Cir. 1998) 11, 12, 14

22 *Haralson v. U.S. Aviation Servs. Corp.*,
 23 383 F. Supp. 3d 959 (N.D. Cal. 2019) 25

24 *Harris v. Vector Mktg. Corp.*,
 2011 WL 1627973 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 29, 2011) 16, 17, 18

25 *Harvey v. Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC*,
 26 2019 WL 4462653 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 5, 2019) 20

27 *Harvey v. Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC*,
 2020 WL 1031801 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 3, 2020) 16, 22

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.