

1 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
 HALE AND DORR LLP
 2 BENJAMIN A. POWELL (SBN 214728)
 Benjamin.Powell@wilmerhale.com
 3 DAVID W. BOWKER (SBN 200516)
 David.Bowker@wilmerhale.com
 4 MOLLY M. JENNINGS (*pro hac vice pending*)
 Molly.Jennings@wilmerhale.com
 5 JULIAN M. BEACH (SBN 312988)
 Julian.Beach@wilmerhale.com
 6 1875 Pennsylvania Ave NW
 7 Washington, DC 20006
 8 Telephone: (202) 663-6000

9 SONAL N. MEHTA (SBN 222086)
 Sonal.Mehta@wilmerhale.com
 10 2600 El Camino Real, Suite 400
 11 Palo Alto, California 94306
 Telephone: (650) 600-5051

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Apple Inc.*

13
 14
 15 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 16 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
 17

18 APPLE INC.,
 19
 Plaintiff,
 20
 v.
 21 NSO GROUP TECHNOLOGIES LIMITED and
 22 Q CYBER TECHNOLOGIES LIMITED,
 23
 Defendants.
 24

Case No. 3:21-cv-09078-JD

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN
 OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS'
 MOTION TO DISMISS**

Hearing Date: June 2, 2022
 Hearing Time: 10:00 a.m.
 Judge: Hon. James Donato

TABLE OF CONTENT

Page

1

2

3 TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ii

4 FACTUAL BACKGROUND.....2

5 ARGUMENT3

6 I. Defendants’ Immunity Defense is Foreclosed by Ninth Circuit Precedent.....3

7 II. This Court is the Proper Venue for this Litigation4

8 III. Defendants’ Unidentified Customers Are Not Indispensable Parties.....9

9 IV. Defendants’ Creation And Use Of Abusive Exploits Violated The CFAA.....10

10 V. Defendants’ CFAA Violations Also Violate The California UCL’s

11 Unlawful Prong.....13

12 VI. Apple Adequately States a Claim in the Alternative for Unjust Enrichment15

13 CONCLUSION.....15

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

1

2

3

4 *Adobe Systems Inc. v. Blue Source Group, Inc.*,
125 F. Supp. 3d 945 (N.D. Cal. 2015) 14

5 *Air Turbine Technology, Inc. v. Atlas Copco AB*, 217 F.R.D. 545 (S.D. Fla. 2003) 7

6 *Allergan, Inc. v. Athena Cosmetics, Inc.*, 738 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 14

7 *Andrews v. Sirius XM Radio Inc.*, 932 F.3d 1253 (9th Cir. 2019) 12

8 *Argoquest Holdings, LLC v. Israel Discount Bank, Ltd.*,
9 228 F. App'x 733 (9th Cir. 2007) 5

10 *Astiana v. Hain Celestial Group, Inc.*, 783 F.3d 753 (9th Cir. 2015) 15

11 *Atlantic Marine Construction Co. v. United States District Court for Western*
12 *District of Texas*, 571 U.S. 49 (2013) 4

13 *AtPac, Inc. v. Aptitude Solutions, Inc.*, 730 F. Supp. 2d 1174 (E.D. Cal. 2010) 12

14 *Beaver v. Tarsadia Hotels*, 816 F.3d 1170 (9th Cir. 2016) 13

15 *Belhas v. Ya'alon*, 515 F.3d 1279 (D.C. Cir. 2008) 4

16 *Benny v. Pipes*, 799 F.2d 489 (9th Cir. 1986) 4

17 *Bloate v. United States*, 559 U.S. 196 (2010) 12

18 *Broidy Capital Management, LLC v. Qatar*, No. 18-cv-2421-JFW,
19 2018 WL 6074570 (C.D. Cal. Aug. 8, 2018) 9

20 *Butters v. Vance International, Inc.*, 225 F.3d 462 (4th Cir. 2000) 4

21 *Carijano v. Occidental Petroleum Corp.*, 643 F.3d 1216 (9th Cir. 2011) 6

22 *Cave Consulting Group, Inc. v. Truven Health Analytics Inc.*,
23 No. 15-cv-02177-SI, 2017 WL 1436044 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 24, 2017) 14

24 *Clarke v. Pacific Gas & Electric Co.*, 501 F. Supp. 3d 774 (N.D. Cal. 2020) 14

25 *Contact Lumber Co. v. P.T. Moges Shipping Co.*,
26 918 F.2d 1446 (9th Cir. 1990) 7

27 *Dawavendewa v. Salt River Project*, 276 F.3d 1150 (9th Cir. 2002) 9

28 *Dole Food Co. v. Watts*, 303 F.3d 1104 (9th Cir. 2002) 6

1	<i>Dongxiao Yue v. Chun-Hui Miao</i> , No. 18-3467-MGL-PJG, 2019 WL 5872142 (D.S.C. June 27, 2019).....	14
2		
3	<i>EEOC v. Peabody Western Coal Co.</i> , 610 F.3d 1070 (9th Cir. 2010).....	9
4	<i>Facebook, Inc. v. Power Ventures, Inc.</i> , 844 F.3d 1058 (9th Cir. 2016).....	12
5	<i>Facebook, Inc. v. Rankwave Co.</i> , No. 19-cv-03738-JST, 2019 WL 8895237 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 14, 2019)	6
6		
7	<i>Facebook, Inc. v. Studivz Ltd.</i> , No. C-08-3468-JF, 2009 WL 1190802 (N.D. Cal. May 4, 2009).....	8
8	<i>Fahrner-Miller Associates, Inc. v. Mars Antennas & RF Systems, Ltd.</i> , No. 14-cv-03668-PSG, 2014 WL 6871550 (N.D. Cal. Dec. 4, 2014).....	6
9		
10	<i>Flextronics International, Ltd. v. Parametric Technology Corp.</i> , No. 13-cv-00034-PSG, 2014 WL 2213910 (N.D. Cal. May 28, 2014).....	12
11		
12	<i>Gates Learjet Corp. v. Jensen</i> , 743 F.2d 1325 (9th Cir. 1984).....	8
13	<i>Gerritsen v. Warner Brothers Entertainment Inc.</i> , 112 F. Supp. 3d 1011 (C.D. Cal. 2015)	10
14	<i>Global Commodities Trading Group, Inc. v. Beneficio de Arroz Choloma, S.A.</i> , 972 F.3d 1101 (9th Cir. 2020)	4, 6, 7
15		
16	<i>In re California Gasoline Spot Market Antitrust Litigation</i> , No 20-cv-03131-JSC, 2021 WL 1176645 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 29, 2021).....	15
17		
18	<i>In re Volkswagen “Clean Diesel” Marketing, Sales Practices, and Products Liability Litigation</i> , MDL No. 15-md-02672-CRB, 2017 WL 66281 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 4, 2017).....	7
19		
20	<i>Israel Discount Bank Ltd. v. Schapp</i> , 505 F. Supp. 2d 651 (C.D. Cal. 2007)	6
21	<i>Kimberlite Corp. v. John Does 1-20</i> , No. C08-2147-TEH, 2008 WL 2264485 (N.D. Cal. June 2, 2008).....	12
22		
23	<i>Lundy v. Facebook Inc.</i> , No. 18-cv-06793-JD, 2021 WL 4503071 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 30, 2021)	15
24	<i>Multiven, Inc. v. Cisco Systems, Inc.</i> , 725 F. Supp. 2d 887 (N.D. Cal. 2010).....	12
25	<i>Nexans Wires S.A. v. Sark-USA, Inc.</i> , 319 F. Supp. 2d 468 (S.D.N.Y. 2004).....	12
26	<i>Nowak v. Xapo, Inc.</i> , No. 20-cv-03643-BLF, 2020 WL 6822888 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 11, 2020)	12
27		
28	<i>Piper Aircraft v. Reyno</i> , 454 U.S. 235 (1981)	6

1 *Roman v. Superior Court*, 172 Cal. App. 4th 1462 (2009).....5

2 *Sajfr v. BBG Communications, Inc.*, No. 10-cv-2341-AJB,
3 2012 WL 398991 (S.D. Cal. Jan. 10, 2012).....14

4 *San Francisco Herring Ass’n v. Pacific Gas & Electric Co.*,
5 No. 14-cv-04393-WHO, 2020 WL 6736930 (N.D. Cal. June 15, 2020).....15

6 *Shierkatz Rllp v. Square, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-02202-JST, 2015 WL 9258082
(N.D. Cal. Dec. 17, 2015).....5

7 *Shular v. United States*, 140 S. Ct. 779 (2020).....13

8 *Silicon Labs Integration, Inc. v. Melman*, No. C-08-0430-RMW,
9 2009 WL 2044663 (N.D. Cal. July 9, 2009).....8

10 *Sullivan v. Oracle Corp.*, 254 P.3d 237 (Cal. 2011).....14

11 *Tahan v. Hodgson*, 662 F.2d 862 (D.C. Cir. 1981).....8

12 *Theofel v. Farey-Jones*, 359 F.3d 1066 (9th Cir. 2004).....1, 10, 11

13 *Ticketmaster L.L.C. v. Prestige Entertainment West, Inc.*,
14 315 F. Supp. 3d 1147 (C.D. Cal. 2018)12

15 *Tompkins v. 23andMe, Inc.*, 840 F.3d 1016 (9th Cir. 2016).....5

16 *United States v. Gomez Lopez*, 62 F.3d 304 (9th Cir. 1995)3

17 *United States v. Nosal*, 676 F.3d 854 (9th Cir. 2012).....13

18 *Van Buren v. United States*, 141 S. Ct. 1648 (2021)1, 12, 13

19 *WhatsApp Inc. v. NSO Group Technologies Ltd.*, 17 F.4th 930 (9th Cir. 2021)3, 4

20 *WhatsApp Inc. v. NSO Group Technologies Ltd.*,
21 472 F. Supp. 3d 649 (N.D. Cal. 2020)7, 9, 10, 11, 12

22 *White Knight Yacht LLC v. Certain Lloyds at Lloyd’s London*,
23 407 F. Supp. 3d 931 (S.D. Cal. 2019).....5

24 *Yes To, Ltd. v. Hur*, 779 F. Supp. 2d 1054 (N.D. Cal. 2011).....5

25 **STATUTES AND RULES**

26 18 U.S.C. § 1030(a)(5).....11

27 18 U.S.C. § 1030(e)(8).....10, 11

28 18 U.S.C. § 1030(e)(11).....12

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.