

BRIAN M. BOYNTON, Principal Deputy Assistant Attorney General
ARUN G. RAO, Deputy Assistant Attorney General
GUSTAV W. EYLER, Director
LISA K. HSIAO, Assistant Director
ZACHARY L. COWAN, Trial Attorney (NCBN 53432)
DEBORAH S. SOHN, Trial Attorney (NYBN 5118096, DCBN 1025098)

U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division
Consumer Protection Branch
450 5th Street NW, Suite 6400-S
Washington, DC 20530
Telephone: (202) 451-7468
Zachary.L.Cowan@usdoj.gov
Deborah.S.Sohn@usdoj.gov

STEPHANIE M. HINDS, United States Attorney (CABN 154284)
MICHELLE LO, Chief, Civil Division (NYBN 4325163)
SHARANYA MOHAN, Assistant United States Attorney (NYBN 5027768)
EMMET P. ONG, Assistant United States Attorney (NYBN 4581369)

Northern District of California
450 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, California 94102
Telephone: (415) 436-7198
sharanya.mohan@usdoj.gov
emmet.ong@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

TWITTER, INC., a corporation,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:22-cv-3070

**JOINT MOTION FOR ENTRY OF
STIPULATED ORDER FOR CIVIL
PENALTY, MONETARY JUDGMENT,
AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

1 Plaintiff the United States of America, acting upon notification and authorization to the Attorney
2 General by the Federal Trade Commission (“FTC” or “Commission”), filed its Complaint for Civil
3 Penalties, Permanent Injunction, Monetary Relief, and Other Equitable Relief, against Defendant
4 Twitter, Inc. for alleged violations of a 2011 FTC Administrative Order and Section 5 of the FTC Act,
5 15 U.S.C. § 45. *See* ECF No. 1. The parties have resolved all issues in this matter through the attached
6 proposed Stipulated Order for Civil Penalty, Monetary Judgment, and Injunctive Relief. Under the
7 terms of the Stipulated Order, Twitter agrees to pay \$150 million in civil penalties, reopen the
8 underlying administrative proceedings in FTC Docket No. C-4316 pursuant to Section 3.72(b) of the
9 Commission’s Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 3.72(b), and modify the Decision and Order in *In re*
10 *Twitter, Inc.*, C-4316, 151 FTC LEXIS 162 (F.T.C. Mar. 2, 2011) with the Decision and Order set forth
11 in Attachment A to the Stipulated Order, and submit to substantial compliance reporting measures to
12 ensure future compliance with the law.

13 “Because of the unique aspects of settlements, a district court should enter a proposed consent
14 judgment if the court decides that it is fair, reasonable and equitable and does not violate the law or
15 public policy.” *Sierra Club, Inc. v. Elec. Controls Design, Inc.*, 909 F.2d 1350, 1355 (9th Cir. 1990)
16 (citing *Citizens for a Better Environment v. Gorsuch*, 718 F.2d 1117, 1125–26 (D.C. Cir. 1983)); *see*
17 *SEC v. Randolph*, 736 F.2d 525, 529 (9th Cir. 1984). In approving a settlement, a court “need not
18 inquire into the precise legal rights of the parties nor reach and resolve the merits of the claims or
19 controversy.” *Gorsuch*, 718 F.2d at 1126 (quoting *Metro. Hous. Dev. Corp. v. Vill. Of Arlington*
20 *Heights*, 616 F.2d 1006, 1014 (7th Cir. 1980)). Rather, “[a]s long as the consent decree comes within
21 the general scope of the case made by the pleadings, furthers the objectives upon which the law is based,
22 and does not violate the statute upon which the complaint was based, the parties’ agreement may be
23 entered by the court.” *Sierra Club*, 909 F.2d at 1355 (quoting *Loc. No. 93, Int’l Ass’n of*
24 *Firefighters, AFL-CIO C.L.C. v. City of Cleveland*, 478 U.S. 501, 525–26 (1986) (quoting *Pacific R. Co.*
25 *v. Ketchum*, 101 U.S. 289, 297 (1880))) (alterations and internal quotation marks omitted).

26 The Stipulated Order is fair, reasonable, and equitable. It addresses the concerns giving rise to
27 the Complaint by modifying the administrative order to require Twitter to undertake multiple measures
28

1 that will improve its protection of consumer data. These measures include prohibiting
2 misrepresentations about the extent to which the company protects the privacy of its users' nonpublic
3 contact information, including any misrepresentations about its use of such information, and requiring
4 Twitter to implement a comprehensive privacy and information security program with extensive
5 procedures to safeguard user information and assess internal and external data privacy risks. To afford
6 consumers these protections as soon as possible, the parties respectfully jointly request that the Court
7 promptly effectuate this resolution and enter the proposed Stipulated Order.

1 Dated: May 25, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

2 **FOR PLAINTIFF**
3 **THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:**

4 *Of Counsel:*

BRIAN M. BOYNTON
Principal Deputy Assistant Attorney General
Civil Division

5 JAMES A. KOHM
Associate Director
6 Division of Enforcement

ARUN G. RAO
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

7 LAURA KOSS
Assistant Director
8 Division of Enforcement

GUSTAV W. EYLER
Director
Consumer Protection Branch

9 REENAH L. KIM
10 Attorney
11 Division of Enforcement

LISA K. HSIAO
Assistant Director

12 ANDREA V. ARIAS
Attorney
13 Division of Privacy and Identity Protection

/s/ Zachary L. Cowan
ZACHARY L. COWAN
DEBORAH S. SOHN
Trial Attorneys
Consumer Protection Branch
U.S. Department of Justice
450 5th Street, N.W. Suite 6400-S
Washington, D.C. 20530
Tel: (202) 598-7566
Fax: (202) 514-8742
Zachary.L.Cowan@usdoj.gov
Deborah.S.Sohn@usdoj.gov

14 Federal Trade Commission
15 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.,
Mail Stop CC-9528
16 Washington, D.C. 20580
Tel: (202) 326-2272 (Kim)
17 Tel: (202) 326-2715 (Arias)
rkim1@ftc.gov
18 aarias@ftc.gov

19 STEPHANIE M. HINDS
20 United States Attorney

21 MICHELLE LO
22 Chief
23 Civil Division

24 SHARANYA MOHAN
EMMET P. ONG
Assistant United States Attorneys
Northern District of California
450 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, California 94102
Tel: (415) 436-7198
sharanya.mohan@usdoj.gov
27 emmet.ong@usdoj.gov
28

FOR DEFENDANT TWITTER, INC.:

LYDIA B. PARNES

Wilson Sonsoni Goodrich & Rosati

1700 K Street N.W., Fifth Floor

Washington, D.C. 20006

Tel: (202) 973-8800

lparnes@wsgr.com

/s/ Anthony J Weibell

ANTHONY J WEIBELL (CABN 238850)

Wilson Sonsoni Goodrich & Rosati

650 Page Mill Road

Palo Alto, CA 94304-1050

Tel: (650) 493-9300

aweibell@wsgr.com

Counsel for Twitter, Inc.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.