

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P.  
REBECCA A. PETERSON (241858)  
100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200  
Minneapolis, MN 55401  
Telephone: (612) 339-6900  
E-mail: rapeterson@locklaw.com

LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG & AFANADOR, LLC  
SUSANA CRUZ HODGE, *Pro Hac Vice*  
570 Broad Street, Suite 1201  
Newark, NJ 07102  
Telephone: (973) 623-3000  
E-mail: scruzhodge@litedepalma.com

**Co-Lead Interim Class Counsel**

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
OAKLAND DIVISION**

IN RE PLUM BABY FOOD  
LITIGATION

---

This Document Relates to:  
  
ALL ACTIONS

) Case No. 21-cv-00913-YGR

) Hon: Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

) **PLAINTIFFS' MEMORANDUM IN  
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS'  
MOTION TO DISMISS OR, IN THE  
ALTERNATIVE, TO STAY;  
MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND  
AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT  
THEREOF**

) Date: January 11, 2022

) Time: 2:00 PM

) Courtroom: 1

---

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

STATEMENT OF ISSUES TO BE DECIDED ..... 1

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

II. SUMMARY OF THE CASE ..... 1

    A. Plum Omitted Material Information on Heavy Metals and Other Toxins ..... 1

    B. The Truth is Revealed Relating to Plum’s Material Omissions ..... 2

III. ARGUMENT ..... 4

    A. Plaintiffs’ Claims Premised on Perchlorate Should Proceed ..... 4

    B. Article III Standing is Satisfied ..... 4

        1. Plaintiffs suffered an injury in fact..... 4

        2. Plaintiffs have standing to seek injunctive relief..... 7

    C. Plaintiffs’ Claims Are Not Preempted..... 9

    D. The Court Should Not Invoke Primary Jurisdiction..... 13

    E. Deception is Sufficiently Pled..... 19

        1. Ubiquity of Heavy Metals Does Not Absolve Plum ..... 20

        2. Plaintiffs’ Allegations of Contamination and Risk Are Sufficient..... 21

    F. Breach of Implied Warranty Is Properly Pled ..... 23

    G. Request for Judicial Notice and Response ..... 24

    H. In the Alternative, Leave to Amend Should Be Granted ..... 25

IV. CONCLUSION ..... 25

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**Page(s)**

**CASES**

*Abrantes v. Northland Grp., Inc.*,  
2015 WL 1738255 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 13, 2015) .....17

*Allen v. Hyland’s Inc.*,  
300 F.R.D. 643 (C.D. Cal. 2014) .....6

*Anderson v. Holder*,  
673 F.3d 1089 (9th Cir. 2012) .....24

*Astiana v. Hain Celestial Grp., Inc.*,  
783 F.3d 753 (9th Cir. 2015) .....13, 17

*Axon v. Citrus World, Inc.*,  
354 F. Supp. 3d 170 (E.D.N.Y. 2018) .....22

*Backus v. General Mills*,  
122 F. Supp. 3d 909 (N.D. Cal. 2015) .....18

*Backus v. Nestlé USA, Inc.*,  
167 F. Supp. 3d 1068 (N.D. Cal. 2016) .....13

*Beaty v. Ford Motor Co.*,  
854 F. App’x. 845 (9th Cir. 2021) .....23

*Bell v. Publix Super Markets, Inc.*,  
982 F.3d 468 (7th Cir. 2020) .....19, 21

*Berke v. Whole Foods Mkt.*,  
2020 WL 5802370 (C.D. Cal. Sep. 18, 2020).....6

*Boysen v. Walgreen Co.*,  
2012 WL 2953069 (N.D. Cal. July 19, 2012).....6

*Brazil v. Dole Food Co., Inc.*,  
935 F. Supp. 2d 947 (N.D. Cal. 2013) .....6

*Brazil v. Dole Packaged Foods LLC*,  
660 F. App’x. 531 (9th Cir. 2016) .....6

*Capaci v. Sports Rsch. Corp.*,  
445 F. Supp. 3d 607 (C.D. Cal. 2020) .....16

*Chavez v. Blue Sky Nat. Beverage Co.*,  
340 F. App’x. 359 (9th Cir. 2009) .....5, 7

1	<i>Chem. Specialties Mfrs. Ass’n, Inc., v. Allenby,</i> 958 F.2d 941 (9th Cir. 1992) .....	9
2	<i>Cimoli v. Alacer Corp.,</i>	
3	2021 WL 2711770 (N.D. Cal. July 1, 2021).....	8
4	<i>Clark v. Time Warner Cable,</i>	
5	523 F.3d. 1110 (9th Cir. 2008) .....	19
6	<i>Cohen v. Apple Inc.,</i>	
7	497 F. Supp. 3d 769 (N.D. Cal. 2020) .....	12
8	<i>Cohen v. ConAgra Brands, Inc.,</i>	
9	16 F.4th 1283 (9th Cir. 2021) .....	11, 12, 13
10	<i>Colangelo v. Champion Petfoods USA, Inc.,</i>	
11	2020 WL 777462 (N.D.N.Y. Feb. 18, 2020) .....	23
12	<i>Cole v. Asurion Corp.,</i>	
13	2008 WL 5423859 (C.D. Cal. Dec. 30, 2008) .....	5
14	<i>Colette v. CV Sciences, Inc.,</i>	
15	2020 WL 2739861 (C.D. Cal. May 22, 2020) .....	19
16	<i>Corbett v. Pharmacare U.S., Inc.,</i>	
17	2021 WL 4866124 (S.D. Cal. Oct. 19, 2021) .....	10, 11
18	<i>Cortina v. Goya Foods, Inc.,</i>	
19	94 F. Supp. 3d 1174 (S.D. Cal. 2015).....	9, 13
20	<i>Curtis v. Philip Morris Cos.,</i>	
21	2004 WL 2776228 (Minn. Dist. Ct. Nov. 29, 2004).....	19
22	<i>Davidson v. Kimberly-Clark Corp.,</i>	
23	889 F.3d 956 (9th Cir. 2018) .....	7
24	<i>Doss v. Gen. Mills, Inc.,</i>	
25	816 F. App’x. 312 (11th Cir. 2020). .....	7
26	<i>Farina v. Nokia Inc.,</i>	
27	625 F.3d 97 (3d Cir. 2010).....	12
28	<i>Fla. Lime &amp; Avocado Growers, Inc. v. Paul,</i>	
29	373 U.S. 132 (1963).....	11
30	<i>Geier v. Am. Honda Motor Co.,</i>	
	529 U.S. 861 (2000).....	12
	<i>Green v. Pepsico, Inc.,</i>	
	2019 WL 8810364 (S.D. Fla. Apr. 12, 2019) .....	7

1 *Hadley v. Kellogg Sales Co.*,  
243 F. Supp. 3d 1074 (N.D. Cal. 2017) .....25

2 *Hawyuan Yu v. Dr Pepper Snapple Grp., Inc.*,  
3 2019 WL 2515919 (N.D. Cal. June 18, 2019) .....22

4 *Herrington v. Johnson & Johnson Consumer Cos., Inc.*,  
5 2010 WL 3448531 (N.D. Cal. Sep. 1, 2010) .....5

6 *Hough v. Big Heart Pet Brands, Inc.*,  
7 2020 WL 7227198 (N.D. Cal. Dec. 5, 2020) .....6

8 *Humetrix, Inc. v. Gemplus S.C.A.*,  
9 268 F.3d 910 (9th Cir. 2001) .....15

10 *Hunter v. Philip Morris USA*,  
11 582 F.3d 1039 (9th Cir. 2009) .....10

12 *In re 5-Hour ENERGY Mktg. and Sales Practices Litig.*,  
13 2017 WL 385042 (C.D. Cal. Jan. 24, 2017) .....24

14 *In re Gen. Mills Glyphosate Litig.*,  
15 2017 WL 2983877 (D. Minn. July 12, 2017) .....22

16 *In re JUUL Labs, Inc., Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prod. Liab. Litig.*,  
17 497 F. Supp. 3d 552 (N.D. Cal. 2020) .....15, 17

18 *In re KIND LLC “Healthy & All Natural” Litig.*,  
19 209 F. Supp. 3d 689 (S.D.N.Y. 2016) .....17

20 *In re KIND LLC “Healthy & All Natural” Litig.*,  
21 287 F. Supp. 3d 457 (S.D.N.Y. 2018) .....17, 18

22 *In re Tobacco Cases II*,  
23 240 Cal. App. 4th 779 (2015) .....6

24 *In re Valsartan, Losartan, and Irbesartan Prods. Liab. Litig.*,  
25 2020 WL 7418006 (D.N.J. Dec. 18, 2020) .....11

26 *Isip v. Mercedes-Benz USA, LLC*,  
27 155 Cal. App. 4th 19 (2007) .....24

28 *Jackson v. Gen. Mills, Inc.*,  
29 2020 WL 5106652 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 28, 2020) .....8

30 *Joslin v. Clif Bar & Co.*,  
2019 WL 5690632 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 26, 2019) .....8

*Kane v. Chobani, LLC*,  
645 F. App’x. 593 (9th Cir. 2016) .....17

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.