

THE LAW OFFICE OF JACK FITZGERALD, PC

JACK FITZGERALD (SBN 257370)

jack@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

TREVOR M. FLYNN (SBN 253362)

trevor@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

MELANIE PERSINGER (SBN 275423)

melanie@jackfitzgeraldlaw.com

Hillcrest Professional Building

3636 Fourth Avenue, Suite 202

San Diego, California 92103

Phone: (619) 692-3840

Fax: (619) 353-0404

JACKSON & FOSTER, LLC

SIDNEY W. JACKSON, III (*pro hac vice*)

75 St. Michael Street

Mobile, Alabama 36602

Phone: (251) 433-6699

Fax: (251) 433-6127

Counsel for Plaintiffs

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

STEPHEN HADLEY, MELODY DIGREGORIO,
ERIC FISHON, KERRY AUSTIN, and
NAFEESHA MADYUN, on behalf of themselves,
all others similarly situated, and the general public,

Plaintiffs,

v.

KELLOGG SALES COMPANY,

Defendant.

Case No. 5:16-cv-04955-LHK

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF MOTION AND
MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL**

[Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)]

Judge: Hon. Lucy H. Koh

Date: May 20, 2021

Time: 1:30 p.m.

Location: Courtroom 8 – 4th Floor

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIESiii

NOTICE OF MOTION..... 1

ISSUES TO BE DECIDED 1

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS & AUTHORITIES..... 1

 I. INTRODUCTION 1

 II. PROCEDURAL HISTORY..... 2

 III. THE SETTLEMENT 3

 A. The Settlement Class..... 3

 B. Benefits for the Settlement Class..... 4

 1. Kellogg will Establish a \$13 Million Non-Reversionary Settlement
 Fund 4

 2. Kellogg Will Make Substantial Labeling Commitments..... 5

 C. Class Notice and Claims Administration..... 6

 D. The Settlement’s Release..... 6

 E. Opting Out 7

 F. Objecting..... 7

 G. Attorneys’ Fees, Costs, and Service Awards 7

 H. Timeline 8

 IV. ARGUMENT 9

 A. The Court Should Certify the Settlement Class..... 9

 1. The Requirements of Rule 23(a) are Satisfied..... 9

1 a. Numerosity..... 9

2 b. Commonality..... 9

3 c. Typicality 10

4 d. Adequacy 10

5

6 2. The Requirements of Rule 23(b)(3) are Satisfied 11

7 a. Predominance..... 11

8 b. Superiority..... 14

9

10 B. The Court Should Approve the Proposed Settlement 14

11 1. The Settlement is the Product of Serious, Informed, Non-Collusive

12 Negotiations 15

13 2. The Settlement Does Not Grant Preferential Treatment Improperly 17

14 3. The Settlement Falls within the Range of Possible Approval 17

15 a. The *Churchill Village* Factors Favor Preliminary Approval 17

16 b. The Monetary Relief is Fair in Relation to Potential

17 Damages..... 22

18 c. The Injunctive Relief is Appropriate and Meaningful 23

19 d. The Court will Determine Reasonable Fees, Costs, and

20 Service Awards 23

21

22 4. The Settlement has No Obvious Deficiencies 24

23

24 C. The Court Should Approve the Class Notice and Notice Plan 25

25 V. CONCLUSION..... 25

26

27

28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

1

2

3 *Allen v. Hyland’s, Inc.,*
 No. 12-cv-1150 DMG (MANx) (C.D. Cal.) 17

4

5 *Amchem Prods., Inc. v. Windsor,*
 521 U.S. 591 (1997)..... 11, 12

6

7 *Bradach v. Pharmavite, LLC,*
 735 Fed. Appx. 251 (9th Cir. 2018)..... 12

8

9 *Briseno v. ConAgra Foods, Inc.,*
 844 F.3d 1121 (9th Cir. 2017)..... 25

10

11 *Broomfield v. Craft Brew Alliance, Inc.,*
 2020 WL 1972505 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 5, 2020)..... 13

12

13 *Bruno v. Quten Research Inst., LLC,*
 2013 WL 990495 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 13, 2013) 23

14

15 *Butler v. Porsche Cars N. Am., Inc.,*
 2017 WL 1398316 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 19, 2017) 13

16

17 *Campbell v. Facebook, Inc.,*
 951 F.3d 1106 (9th Cir. 2020)..... 15, 16

18

19 *Castro v. Paragon Indus., Inc.,*
 2020 WL 1984240 (E.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2020)..... 12

20

21 *Chavez v. PVH Corp.,*
 2015 WL 12915109 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 6, 2015)..... 24

22

23 *Chevron Envt’l. Mgmt. Co. v. BKK Corp.,*
 2013 WL 5587363 (E.D. Cal. Oct. 10, 2013) 22

24

25 *Churchill Village v. Gen. Elec.,*
 361 F.3d 566 (9th Cir. 2004)..... 17

26

27 *Custom LED, LLC v. eBay, Inc,*
 2014 WL 2916871 (N.D. Cal. June 24, 2014) 23

28

29 *Delgado v. MarketSource, Inc.,*
 2019 WL 4059850 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 28, 2019)..... 22

30

31 *Dennis v. Kellogg Co.,*
 697 F.3d 858 (9th Cir. 2012)..... 5

1 *Deposit Guar. Nat'l Bank v. Roper*,
445 U.S. 326 (1980) 14

2 *Dickey v. Advanced Micro Devices, Inc.*,
3 2019 WL 4918366 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 4, 2019)..... 24

4 *Edwards v. Nat'l Milk Producers Fed'n*,
5 2017 WL 3623734 (N.D. Cal. June 26, 2017) 19, 25

6 *Farar v. Bayer AG*,
7 Case No. 14-cv-4601 (N.D. Cal.)..... 17

8 *Gaudin v. Saxon Mortg. Servs., Inc.*,
2015 WL 4463650 (N.D. Cal. July 21, 2015)..... 22

9 *Guifu Li v. A Perfect Franchise, Inc.*,
10 2011 WL 4635198 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 5, 2011)..... 19

11 *Hadley v. Kellogg Sales Co.*,
12 2020 WL 836673 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 20, 2020)..... 2, 4, 20

13 *Hadley v. Kellogg Sales Co.*,
324 F. Supp. 3d 1084 (N.D. Cal. 2018) passim

14 *Hale v. Manna Pro Prod., LLC*,
15 2020 WL 3642490 (E.D. Cal. July 6, 2020) 16

16 *Hanlon v. Chrysler Corp.*,
17 150 F.3d 1011 (9th Cir. 1998)..... 10, 13, 15

18 *Haralson v. U.S. Aviation Servs. Corp.*,
19 383 F. Supp. 3d 959 (N.D. Cal. 2019) 24

20 *Harris v. Vector Mktg. Corp.*,
2011 WL 1627973 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 29, 2011) 16, 17

21 *Harvey v. Morgan Stanley Smith Barney LLC*,
22 2020 WL 1031801 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 3, 2020)..... 15

23 *Heim v. Heim*,
24 2014 WL 1340063 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 2, 2014) 22

25 *Hendricks v. Ference*,
26 754 Fed. App'x 510 (9th Cir. 2018)..... 24

27 *Hendricks v. Starkist Co.*,
2016 WL 5462423 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 29, 2016)..... 24

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.