

1 Karen P. Hewitt (State Bar No. 145309)
2 kphewitt@jonesday.com
3 Kelly V. O'Donnell (State Bar No. 257266)
4 kodonnell@jonesday.com
5 JONES DAY
6 4655 Executive Drive, Suite 1500
7 San Diego, CA 92121-3134
8 Telephone: 858.314.1200

9 Rajeev Muttreja (*admitted pro hac vice*)
10 rmuttreja@jonesday.com
11 JONES DAY
12 250 Vesey Street
13 New York, NY 10281
14 Telephone: 212.326.3939

15 Eric Tung (State Bar No. 275063)
16 etung@jonesday.com
17 JONES DAY
18 555 South Flower Street, 50th Floor
19 Los Angeles, CA 90071
20 Telephone: 213.489.3939

21 Attorneys for Defendants Abbott Laboratories,
22 Inc., Abbott Cardiovascular Systems Inc., and
23 Abbott Vascular Inc.

24 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
25 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

26 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, *et*
27 *al.*; *ex rel.* EVEREST PRINCIPALS,
28 LLC,

Plaintiffs and Relator,

v.

ABBOTT LABORATORIES, INC.
a/k/a ABBOTT LABORATORIES,
ABBOTT CARDIOVASCULAR
SYSTEMS INC., and ABBOTT
VASCULAR INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 3:20-cv-0286-W-AGS

**MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND
AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF
DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO
DISMISS SECOND AMENDED
COMPLAINT**

Date: November 14, 2022
Ctmm: 3C – Hon. Thomas J. Whelan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
1		
2		
3		
4	INTRODUCTION	1
5	BACKGROUND	4
6	I. Abbott Develops a Groundbreaking Medical Device.....	4
7	II. Relator’s Lawsuit and the Court’s Dismissal Order.	5
8	ARGUMENT.....	7
9	I. Relator Must Plausibly Plead the State FCA Claims with Particularity.....	7
10	II. Relator’s State FCA Allegations Fail Under Rule 9(b).	8
11	A. Conclusory allegations of a “nationwide” scheme cannot support	
12	Relator’s state-law claims.	8
13	B. Relator’s allegations of a nationwide marketing strategy fail to	
14	support the State FCA claims with particularity.....	10
15	C. Relator’s new allegations of supposed practice-building events	
16	likewise fail to support the State FCA claims.....	13
17	III. Relator’s State FCA Claims Should Be Dismissed with Prejudice.	16
18	CONCLUSION.....	17
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**Page(s)****CASES**

<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009)	8
<i>Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007)	11, 16
<i>Ebeid ex rel. U.S. v. Lungwitz</i> , 616 F.3d 993 (9th Cir. 2010)	8
<i>Foglia v. Renal Ventures Mgmt.</i> , 830 F. Supp. 2d 8 (D.N.J. 2011)	3, 12, 15
<i>Hart v. Publicis Touchpoint Sols., Inc.</i> , 821 F. App'x 557 (6th Cir. 2020)	2
<i>Health Choice All., LLC, ex rel. U.S. v. Eli Lilly & Co., Inc.</i> , No. 17-CV-123, 2018 WL 4026986 (E.D. Tex. July 25, 2018)	7
<i>Health Choice Group, LLC v. Bayer Corp.</i> , No. 17-cv-126, 2018 WL 3637381 (E.D. Tex. June 29, 2018)	3, 15
<i>Hericks v. Lincare Inc.</i> , No. 07-387, 2014 WL 1225660 (E.D. Pa. Mar. 25, 2014)	9
<i>Metroflex Oceanside LLC v. Newsom</i> , 532 F. Supp. 3d 976 (S.D. Cal. 2021)	16
<i>U.S. ex rel. Acad. Health Ctr., Inc. v. Hyperion Found., Inc.</i> , No. 10-cv-552, 2014 WL 3385189 (S.D. Miss. July 9, 2014)	9
<i>U.S. ex rel. Buth v. Walmart, Inc.</i> , No. 18-cv-840, 2019 WL 3802651 (E.D. Wis. Aug. 13, 2019)	8
<i>U.S. ex rel. Chin v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc.</i> , No. 09-cv-1293, 2017 WL 4174416 (C.D. Cal. Aug. 15, 2017)	8
<i>U.S. ex rel. Devlin v. State of California</i> , 84 F.3d 358 (9th Cir. 1996)	3

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

(continued)

Page(s)

<i>U.S. ex rel. Gough v. Eastwestproto, Inc.,</i>	
No. CV 14-465, 2018 WL 6929332 (C.D. Cal. Oct. 24, 2018)	15
<i>U.S. ex rel. Harris v. Alan Ritchey, Inc.,</i>	
No. C00-2191Z, 2006 WL 3761339 (W.D. Wash. Dec. 20, 2006)	10
<i>U.S. ex rel. Judd v. Quest Diagnostics, Inc.,</i>	
No. 10-cv-4914, 2014 WL 2435659 (D.N.J. May 30, 2014)	16
<i>U.S. ex rel. Kroening v. Forest Pharms., Inc.,</i>	
155 F. Supp. 3d 882 (E.D. Wis. 2016)	12
<i>U.S. ex rel. Nowak v. Medtronic, Inc.,</i>	
806 F. Supp. 2d 310 (D. Mass. 2011)	7, 9, 12
<i>U.S. ex rel. Reilly v. Adventist Health,</i>	
No. 17-CV-00613, 2020 WL 2522114 (E.D. Cal. May 18, 2020)	11, 12, 15
<i>U.S. ex rel. Saldivar v. Fresenius Med. Care Holdings, Inc.,</i>	
906 F. Supp. 2d 1264 (N.D. Ga. 2012)	7, 9, 13
<i>U.S. ex rel. Solis v. Millennium Pharm., Inc.,</i>	
445 F. Supp. 3d 786 (E.D. Cal. 2020)	16
<i>U.S. ex rel. Wall v. Vista Hospice Care, Inc.,</i>	
778 F. Supp. 2d 709 (N.D. Tex. 2011)	7, 10, 12, 13
<i>United States v. Ctr. for Diagnostic Imaging, Inc.,</i>	
787 F. Supp. 2d 1213 (W.D. Wash. 2011)	15
<i>United States v. Medtronic, Inc.,</i>	
No. 15-6265, 2017 WL 2653568 (E.D. Pa. June 19, 2017)	1, 9
<i>United States v. North Am. Health Care, Inc.,</i>	
No. 14-cv-2401, 2015 WL 6871781 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 5, 2015)	8
<i>United States v. Novartis Pharmaceutical Corp.,</i>	
No. 13-cv-3700, 2022 WL 4217749 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 13, 2022)	2, 15, 16
<i>Vess v. Ciba-Geigy Corp. USA,</i>	
317 F.3d 1097 (9th Cir. 2003)	8, 16

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

(continued)

Page(s)**STATUTES**

42 U.S.C. § 1320a-7b(b)(2)(B)..... 7

OTHER AUTHORITIESFed. R. Civ. P. 9(b).....*passim*Gina Kolata, *Tiny Device Is a “Huge Advance” for Treatment of
Severe Heart Failure*, N.Y. Times (Sept. 23, 2018) 4Structural Heart Solutions, *MitraClip TMVr: The Leader in
Transcatheter Mitral Valve Repair Technology*..... 4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.