

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

DISTRICT OF CONNECTICUT

MARK J. PATANE, JULIE HARDING,
HEATHER HARRIGAN, STEPHEN S.
SHAPIRO, CATHERINE PORTER, ERICA
RUSSELL, TINA MORETTI, BRIDGET KOPET,
JENNIFER S. COLE, BENJAMIN A.
FLETCHER and DIANE BOGDAN, and
PARESHKUMAR BRAHMBHATT, Individually
and on Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

NESTLÉ WATERS NORTH AMERICA, INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 17-cv-01381-JAM

ECF Case

CLASS ACTION

PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO COMPEL

Oral Argument Requested

APRIL 23, 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction..... 1

II. Relevant Background..... 1

III. Discovery Disputes 2

 A. Legal Standard..... 3

 B. Argument..... 4

 1. Plaintiffs are Entitled to Discovery Spanning 2003–2013..... 4

 2. Nestlé Must Produce Requested Sales & Pricing Information 8

 3. Nestlé Cannot Evade Financial Document and Deposition Discovery 14

 4. Nestlé’s Communications With Third-Party Regulators Are Not Protected
 By the Work Product Doctrine 16

 5. Nestlé Must Cure Its Deficient Document Investigations 19

 6. A Bilateral Deadline for Substantial Completion of Document Production
 Is Warranted..... 20

IV. Conclusion 22

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>A.M. v. Am. Sch. for the Deaf</i> , No. 3:13 CV 1337 (WWE), 2016 WL 1117363 (D. Conn. Mar. 22, 2016)	4
<i>Audet v. Fraser</i> , No. 3:16cv940(MPS), 2019 WL 285400 (D. Conn. Jan. 22, 2019)	18
<i>Braswell v. Bujnicki</i> , No. 3:16-cv-01431 (JAM), 2018 WL 1293076 (D. Conn. Mar. 13, 2018)	3
<i>Breon v. Coca-Cola Bottling Co. of New Eng.</i> , 232 F.R.D. 49 (D. Conn. 2005).....	4, 16
<i>Cadco, Ltd. v. Doctor’s Assocs., Inc.</i> , 204 A.3d 737 (Conn. Ct. App. 2019).....	15
<i>Coale v. Metro N. R. Co.</i> , No. 3:09–cv–2065 (CSH), 2011 WL 1870237 (D. Conn. May 16, 2011)	13
<i>Coastline Terminals of Conn., Inc. v. U.S. Steel Corp.</i> , 221 F.R.D. 14 (D. Conn. 2003).....	17
<i>Cochran v. City of Huntington</i> , No. 1:05-CV-249, 2006 WL 897443 (N.D. Ind. Mar. 31, 2006).....	21
<i>Compagnie Francaise d’Assurance Pour le Commerce Exterieur v. Phillips Petroleum Co.</i> , 105 F.R.D. 16 (S.D.N.Y. 1984)	4
<i>Daval Steele Prods. v. M/V Fakredine</i> , 951 F.2d 1357 (2d Cir. 1991).....	3
<i>Electrified Discounters, Inc. v. MI Techs., Inc.</i> , No. 3:13cv1332(RNC), 2015 WL 2383618 (D. Conn. May 19, 2015)	6
<i>Estate of Dabela v. Town of Redding</i> , No. 3:16cv534(RNC), 2018 WL 7458278 (D. Conn. Dec. 18, 2018).....	6
<i>Fairchild Heights Residents Ass’n, Inc. v. Fairchild Heights, Inc.</i> , 310 Conn. 797 (2014)	15
<i>Fed. Housing Fin. Agency v. Nomura Holding Am., Inc.</i> , No. 11cv6201 (DLC), 2014 WL 4412388 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 8, 2014)	22

<i>Fleisher v. Phoenix Life Ins. Co.</i> , No. 11 Civ. 8405(CM)(JCF), 2012 WL 6732905 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 27, 2012).....	22
<i>Hadley v. Kellogg Sales Co.</i> , 324 F. Supp. 3d 1084 (N.D. Cal. 2018)	8
<i>Hilsley v. Ocean Spray Cranberries, Inc.</i> , No. 3:17-cv-02335-GPC-MDD, 2018 WL 4502348 (S.D. Cal. Sep. 20, 2018).....	12
<i>Horn v. City of New Haven</i> , No. 3:18-CV-1502 (JAM), 2019 WL 3997095 (D. Conn. Aug. 23, 2019)	18
<i>In re Priceline.com Inc. Sec. Litig.</i> , 233 F.R.D. 83 (D. Conn. 2005).....	4, 9
<i>In re Scotts EZ Seed Litig.</i> , 304 F.R.D. 397 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)	8
<i>In re Steinhardt Partners, L.P.</i> , 9 F.3d 230 (2d Cir. 1993)	18
<i>Kimbrow v. I.C. Sys., Inc.</i> , No. No. 3:01 CV 1676(DJS), 2002 WL 1816820 (D. Conn. July 22, 2002).....	3, 6
<i>Langan v. Johnson & Johnson Consumer Cos.</i> , 897 F.3d 88 (2d Cir. 2018).....	13
<i>Mohegan Lake Motors, Inc. v. Maoli</i> , 16CV6717, 2018 WL 4278351 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 6, 2018).....	13
<i>N. Shore-Long Island Jewish Health Sys., Inc. v. Multiplan, Inc.</i> , 325 F.R.D. 36, 48 (E.D.N.Y. 2018)	7
<i>Nat'l Org. for Women, Farmington Valley Chapter v. Sperry Rand Corp.</i> , 88 F.R.D. 272 (D. Conn. 1980).....	3
<i>NL Indus., Inc. v. ACF Indus. LLC</i> , No. 10CV89W, 2015 WL 4066884 (W.D.N.Y. July 2, 2015)	18
<i>Oppenheimer Fund, Inc. v. Sanders</i> , 437 U.S. 340 (1978).....	3
<i>Precision Rx Compounding, LLC v. Express Scripts Holding Co.</i> , No. 4:16-CV-69 RLW, 2018 WL 2100281 (E.D. Mo. May 7, 2018).....	22
<i>Race Tires Am., Inc. v. Hoosier Racing Tire Corp.</i> , No. 02:07cv1294, 2008 WL 2487835 (W.D. Pa. June 16, 2008).....	21

<i>Ramsey v. Nestlé Waters N. Am.</i> , No. 03 CHK 817 (Ill. Cir. Ct. Nov. 5, 2003)	5
<i>Rose v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.</i> , 809 N.Y.S. 2d 784 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2005)	15
<i>S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc. v. Henkel Corp.</i> , No. 3:19CV00805 (AVC), 2020 WL 5640528 (D. Conn. Sept. 22, 2020)	4
<i>Sandigo v. Ocwen Loan Servicing, LLC</i> , 17-cv-002727 BLF (NC), 2018 WL 4293339 (N.D. Cal. July 18, 2018).....	22
<i>Seegert v. Rexall Sundown, Inc.</i> , No. 17-cv-01243-JAH (JLB), 2019 WL 12044514 (S.D. Cal. Mar. 26, 2019).....	11
<i>Seegert v. Rexall Sundown, Inc.</i> , No. 17-cv-01243-JAH (JLB), 2019 WL 3774485 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 9, 2019).....	11
<i>Sentis Grp., Inc. v. Shell Oil Co.</i> , 763 F.3d 919 (8th Cir. 2014)	6
<i>Shcherbakovskiy v. Da Capo Al Fine, Ltd.</i> , 490 F.3d 130,138 (2d Cir. 2007).....	10
<i>SR Int’l Bus. Ins. Co. v. World Trade Cent. Props. LLC</i> , No. 01 Civ. 9291(JSM), 2002 WL 1334821 (S.D.N.Y. June 19, 2002).....	16
<i>Tarr v. Bob Ciasulli’s Mack Auto Mall, Inc.</i> , 194 N.J. 212 (2008)	15
<i>Tucker v. Am. Int’l Grp., Inc.</i> , No. 3:09–CV–1499 (CSH), 2011 WL 6020851 (D. Conn. Dec. 2, 2011).....	20
<i>Ulbrich v. Groth</i> , 310 Conn. 375 (2013)	15
<i>United States v. Bilzerian</i> , 926 F.2d 1285 (2d Cir.), <i>cert denied</i> , 502 U.S. 813 (1991).....	17
<i>Visa U.S.A., Inc. v. First Data Corp.</i> , No. C-02-1786JSWEMC, 2005 WL 119868 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 20, 2005).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>WPIX, Inc. v. Broadcast Music, Inc.</i> , No. CV 11–4052–SJO, 2011 WL 9753912 (C.D. Cal. July 5, 2011).....	12
<i>Xchange Telecom Corp. v. Sprint Spectrum L.P.</i> , No. No. 14–CV–54, 2015 WL 773752 (N.D.N.Y. Feb. 24, 2015).....	6, 7

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.