

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF CONNECTICUT

-----	X
MURPHY MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, LLC;	:
DIAGNOSTIC AND MEDICAL SPECIALISTS OF	:
GREENWICH, LLC; NORTH STAMFORD MEDICAL	:
ASSOCIATES, LLC; COASTAL CONNECTICUT	:
MEDICAL GROUP, LLC; and STEVEN A.R. MURPHY,	3:20-cv-01675-JBA
MD,	:
	:
Plaintiffs,	:
V.	:
	:
CIGNA HEALTH AND LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY	APRIL 16, 2021
and CONNECTICUT GENERAL LIFE INSURANCE	:
COMPANY,	:
	:
Defendants.	:
-----	X

**DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS
PLAINTIFFS' AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Robinson & Cole LLP
280 Trumbull Street
Hartford, CT 06103
Telephone: (860) 275-8200
Fax: (860) 275-8299

*Attorneys for Cigna Health And Life
Insurance Company and Connecticut
General Life Insurance Company*

Of Counsel:
Theodore J. Tucci
Patrick W. Begos
Jean E. Tomasco

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. SUMMARY OF CLAIMS AND GROUNDS FOR DISMISSAL.....	3
III. SUMMARY OF PLAINTIFFS’ ALLEGATIONS	5
IV. LEGAL STANDARD ON A MOTION TO DISMISS	8
V. ARGUMENT	9
A. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead Essential Facts for Out-of-Network Reimbursement.....	9
B. Plaintiffs Have No Cause of Action Under the CARES Act	11
1. The FFCRA and the CARES Act Have No Express Private Right of Action	11
2. The FFCRA and the CARES Acts Have No Implied Private Right of Action	13
3. The Amended Complaint Alleges No Facts Concerning Posted “Cash Prices”	15
C. Plaintiffs Lack Standing Under ERISA and Fail to Plead a Plausible ERISA Claim	15
1. Plaintiffs Have No ERISA Standing.....	15
a. Plaintiffs Fail to Adequately Plead A Single Valid Assignment	16
b. Neither the FFCRA nor the CARES Act Confer Standing to Sue Under ERISA	18
2. Plaintiffs Fail to Allege Sufficient Facts About Any Plan to Support a Claim	20
3. The Second Count—Seeking Reformation of Unidentified ERISA Plans—Fails to State a Claim	22
4. The Third Count—Seeking Benefits—Fails to State a Claim	23
5. The Fourth Count—Seeking Equitable Relief—Fails to Plausibly State a Claim	25
D. Plaintiffs’ CUTPA/CUIPA Claim Fails as a Matter of Law.....	26
1. ERISA Preempts CUTPA and CUIPA	26
2. Plaintiffs Have Not Pleaded Facts Establishing a CUTPA/CUIPA Claim.....	27
E. Plaintiffs’ Unjust Enrichment Claim Fails as a Matter of Law	28
1. ERISA Preempts the Unjust Enrichment Claim	28

2.	Plaintiffs Have Not Pleaded Facts Establishing an Unjust Enrichment Claim	29
F.	There is No “Federal Law” Claim for Reimbursement	30
G.	Plaintiffs’ Tortious Interference Claim Fails as a Matter of Law	30
1.	ERISA Preempts the Tortious Interference Claim.....	31
2.	Plaintiffs Have Not Pleaded Facts Establishing an Tortious Interference Claim	31
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	33

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Abe v. N.Y. Univ.</i> , No. 14-CV-9323, 2016 WL 1275661 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 30, 2016).....	24
<i>Alexander v. Sandoval</i> , 532 U.S. 275 (2001).....	11, 13, 14
<i>Am. Video Duplicating, Inc. v. City Nat’l Bank</i> , No. 2:20-CV-04036, 2020 WL 6882735 (C.D. Cal. Nov. 20, 2020)	14
<i>Apollo MD Bus. Servs., L.L.C. v. Amerigroup Corp. (Delaware)</i> , No. 1:16-cv-4814-RWS, 2017 WL 10185527 (N.D. Ga. Nov. 27, 2017).....	19
<i>Appleton v. Bd. of Educ. of Town of Stonington</i> , 254 Conn. 205 (2000)	31, 32
<i>Artie’s Auto Body, Inc. v. Hartford Fire Ins. Co.</i> , 317 Conn. 602 (2015)	27
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009).....	8
<i>Autumn Court Operating Co., LLC v. Healthcare Ventures of Ohio</i> , No. 2:20-cv-4901, 2021 WL 325887 (S.D. Ohio Feb. 1, 2021).....	14
<i>Baras v. Baras</i> , No. FST-CV-186035174-S, 2019 WL 4668415 (Conn. Super. Ct. Aug. 22, 2019)	29
<i>Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007).....	8
<i>Biomed Pharm., Inc. v. Oxford Health Plans</i> , 775 F. Supp. 2d 730 (S.D.N.Y. 2011).....	17, 22, 26, 33
<i>Black & Decker Disability Plan v. Nord</i> , 538 U.S. 822 (2003).....	23
<i>Brownstone Inv. Grp., LLC. v. Levey</i> , 468 F. Supp. 2d 654 (S.D.N.Y. 2007).....	10
<i>Chertkova v. Conn. Gen. Life Ins. Co.</i> , No. CV-980486346-S, 2002 WL 1902988 (Conn. Super. Ct. July 12, 2002).....	31

<i>Ciambrello v. Cty. of Nassau</i> , 292 F.3d 307 (2d Cir. 2002).....	8
<i>Cole v. Aetna</i> , 70 F. Supp. 2d 106 (D. Conn. 1999).....	29
<i>Cole v. Travelers Ins. Co.</i> , 208 F. Supp. 2d 248 (D. Conn. 2002).....	28
<i>Curtis v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , No. 3:19-CV-01579, 2021 WL 1056785 (D. Conn. Mar. 18, 2021)	8, 23
<i>Dekutowski-Cook v. Pavalock</i> , No. HHB-CV-054005970-S, 2006 WL 251167 (Conn. Super. Ct. Jan. 9, 2006)	28
<i>DeSilva v. N. Shore-Long Island Jewish Health Sys., Inc.</i> , 770 F. Supp. 2d 497 (E.D.N.Y. 2011)	25
<i>Feldman v. Bhrags Home Care, Inc.</i> , No. 15CV5834RRMRML, 2017 WL 1274055 (E.D.N.Y. Mar. 10, 2017).....	10
<i>Ferrari v. U.S. Equities Corp.</i> , No. 3:13-CV-00395, 2014 WL 5144736 (D. Conn. Oct. 14, 2014).....	27
<i>Forest Ambulatory Surgical Assocs., L.P. v. United Healthcare Ins. Co.</i> , No. 10-CV-04911, 2011 WL 2748724 (N.D. Cal. July 13, 2011).....	21
<i>Franchise Tax Bd. v. Constr. Laborers Vacation Trust for S. Cal.</i> , 463 U.S. 1 (1983).....	15
<i>Frommert v. Conkright</i> , 433 F.3d 254 (2d Cir. 2006).....	26
<i>Gerosa v. Savasta & Co., Inc.</i> , 329 F.3d 317 (2d Cir. 2003).....	26
<i>Gianetti v. Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Connecticut, Inc.</i> , No. 3:07-CV-01561, 2008 WL 1994895 (D. Conn. May 6, 2008), <i>aff'd</i> , 351 F. App'x 520 (2d Cir. 2009).....	27
<i>Giordano v. Thomson</i> , 564 F.3d 163 (2d Cir. 2009).....	23
<i>Glynn v. Bankers Life & Cas. Co.</i> , 297 F. Supp. 2d 424 (D. Conn. 2003).....	27

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.