


IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

VLSI TECHNOLOGY LLC,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 18-966 (CFC) (CJB)
)	
INTEL CORPORATION,)	
)	
Defendant.)	

**INTEL CORPORATION’S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO
EXCLUDE EVIDENCE FROM MARK CHANDLER**

MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL
LLP

Jack B. Blumenfeld (#1014)

Jeremy A. Tigan (#5239)

1201 North Market Street

P.O. Box 1347

Wilmington, DE 19899

(302) 658-9200

jblumenfeld@morrisnichols.com

jtigan@morrisnichols.com

Attorneys for Defendant

OF COUNSEL:

William F. Lee

Dominic E. Massa

Joseph J. Mueller

Jordan L. Hirsch

Louis Tompros

Felicia H. Ellsworth

Kate Saxton

Benjamin N. Ernst

Thomas F. Lampert

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING

HALE AND DORR LLP

60 State Street

Boston, MA 02109

(617) 526-6000

Gregory H. Lantier
Amanda L. Major
Joshua L. Stern
R. Gregory Israelsen
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20006
(202) 663-6000

S. Calvin Walden
Jeffrey A. Dennhardt
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
7 World Trade Center
250 Greenwich Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 295-6359

Arthur W. Coviello
Christine E. Duh
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
2600 El Camino Real, Suite 400
Palo Alto, CA 94306
(650) 858-6069

March 8, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARGUMENT	1
I. Mr. Chandler’s Opinions About Non-Comparable, Unapportioned Intel Settlements Are Inadmissible.	1
II. Mr. Chandler Cannot Rely On Other Non-Comparable Licenses To Support A Running Royalty.	4
III. Mr. Chandler’s “Patent Holdout” Opinions Should Be Excluded.	5
CONCLUSION	6

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Apple Inc. v. Motorola, Inc.</i> , 757 F.3d 1286, 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	6
<i>Apple Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.</i> , No. 12-cv-630, 2014 WL 794328 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 25, 2014).....	5
<i>Apple Inc. v. Wi-Lan Inc.</i> , 25 F.4th 960 (Fed. Cir. 2022)	1, 3, 4
<i>Elbit Sys. Land & C4I Ltd. v. Hughes Network Sys., LLC</i> , 927 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	2
<i>GREE, Inc. v. Supercell Oy</i> , Nos. 19-cv-00070 & -00071, 2020 WL 4288345 (E.D. Tex. July 27, 2020)	5
<i>Intel Corp. v. Tela Innovations, Inc.</i> , No. 18-cv-02848, 2021 WL 1222622 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 11, 2021).....	2
<i>LaserDynamics, Inc. v. Quanta Computer, Inc.</i> , 694 F.3d 51 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	2, 3, 5
<i>MLC Intell. Prop., LLC v. Micron Tech., Inc.</i> , 10 F.4th 1358 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	3
<i>Odyssey Wireless, Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> , Nos. 15-cv-1735, -1738, & -1743, 2016 WL 7644790 (S.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2016)	5
<i>RMail Ltd. v. Amazon.com, Inc.</i> , No. 10-cv-258, 2019 WL 10375642 (E.D. Tex. June 12, 2019).....	2
<i>Smartflash LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. 13-cv-447 & -448, 2014 WL 7336213 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 23, 2014)	5

Stragent, LLC v. Intel Corp.,
No. 11-cv-421, 2014 WL 12611339 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 12, 2014).....4

VLSI Tech. LLC v. Intel Corp., No. 6:21-cv-00057 (W.D. Tex. Aug. 9,
2021), Dkt. 6383

VLSI Tech. LLC v. Intel Corp., No. 6:21-cv-00057 (W.D. Tex. Feb. 2,
2021), Dkt. 5076

EXHIBITS

The exhibits cited in the brief as “Ex. 1” and “Ex. 3” are attached to the Declaration of Thomas F. Lampert in Support Of Intel Corporation’s Motion to Exclude Evidence From Mark Chandler. *See* D.I. 798-01 (Exs. 1, 3). The remainder of the exhibits are attached to the declaration of Thomas F. Lampert filed herewith.

EMPHASES

All emphases in quotations are added unless otherwise indicated.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.