

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
ATLANTA DIVISION**

IN RE EQUIFAX, INC. CUSTOMER
DATA SECURITY BREACH
LITIGATION

MDL Docket No. 2800

No: 17-md-2800-TWT

CONSUMER CASES

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF EQUIFAX'S MOTION TO
DISMISS THE OPT-OUT CONSUMER COMPLAINTS**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	PLAINTIFFS’ ALLEGATIONS	3
	A. “Commercial Acquiescence” Plaintiffs.....	3
	B. Eustice Plaintiffs.....	5
	C. Plaintiffs Joshpe and Khalaf.....	7
	D. Plaintiff Anna Lee	7
III.	STANDARD OF REVIEW.....	8
IV.	APPLICABLE LAW	8
V.	ARGUMENT.....	10
	A. Most of the Opt-Out Plaintiffs’ Claims Are Facially Insufficient Under Rule 8(a).....	10
	B. Contract and Quasi-Contract Claims.	13
	C. Negligence Claims	18
	D. Plaintiffs’ FCRA Claims Fail Because They Have Not Alleged That Equifax “Furnished” a “Consumer Report.”	29
	E. Plaintiffs’ State Statutory Claims Should Be Dismissed.	31
VI.	CONCLUSION	37

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Advon Corp. v. Coopwood’s Air Conditioning Inc.</i> , 517 F. Supp. 3d 656 (S.D. Tex. 2021).....	32
<i>Amstadt v. U.S. Brass Corp.</i> , 919 S.W.2d 644 (Tex. 1996)	31, 32
<i>Anderson v. Barrow Cty.</i> , 256 Ga. App. 160, 568 S.E.2d 68 (2002)	23
<i>In re Arby’s Rest. Grp. Inc. Litig.</i> , No. 1:17-CV-0514-AT, 2018 WL 2128441 (N.D. Ga. Mar. 5, 2018)	26
<i>Arrington v. Wells Fargo</i> , 842 F. App’x 307 (11th Cir. 2020)	10
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009).....	8, 10
<i>Baker v. G4S Secure Sols. (USA) Inc.</i> , No. 4:18-CV-267, 2020 WL 5096520 (S.D. Ga. Aug. 28, 2020)	28
<i>Baylor Univ. v. Sonnichsen</i> , 221 S.W.3d 632 (Tex. 2007)	14
<i>Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007).....	31
<i>Bickley v. Dish Network, LLC</i> , 751 F.3d 724 (6th Cir. 2014)	30
<i>Bilal v. Geo Care, LLC</i> , 981 F.3d 903 (11th Cir. 2020)	8

<i>Bildstein v. MasterCard Int’l Inc.</i> , 329 F. Supp. 2d 410 (S.D.N.Y. 2004)	33, 34
<i>Bradley Center, Inc. v. Wessner</i> , 250 Ga. 199 (Ga. 1982)	25, 26, 27
<i>Brooks v. Branch Banking & Tr. Co.</i> , 107 F. Supp. 3d 1290 (N.D. Ga. 2015).....	16
<i>Budinich v. Becton Dickinson & Co.</i> , 486 U.S. 196 (1988).....	9
<i>Collins v. Athens Orthopedic Clinic, P.A.</i> , 307 Ga. 555 (2019)	19, 22, 23
<i>Columbian Mut. Life Ins. Co. v. Carter</i> , 58 Ga. App. 150 (1938)	16
<i>Coon v. Med. Ctr., Inc.</i> , 300 Ga. 722, 797 S.E.2d 828 (2017)	9
<i>Davis v. Equifax, Inc.</i> , No. 2:20CV00094RMGMHC, 2020 WL 7000971 (D.S.C. Sept. 30, 2020)	15
<i>Department of Labor v. McConnell</i> , 305 Ga. 812 (2019)	26, 27, 28, 29
<i>Dibrell Bros. Int’l S.A. v. Banca Nazionale Del Lavoro</i> , 38 F.3d 1571 (11th Cir. 1994)	16
<i>Engram v. Engram</i> , 265 Ga. 804 (Ga. 1995)	17
<i>In re Equifax Inc. Customer Data Sec. Breach Litig.</i> , No. 1:17-MD-2800-TWT, 2020 WL 256132 (N.D. Ga. Mar. 17, 2020)	27
<i>In re Equifax, Inc., Customer Data Sec. Breach Litig.</i> , 362 F. Supp. 3d 1295 (N.D. Ga. 2019).....	18

<i>Frank Briscoe Co. v. Georgia Sprinkler Co.</i> , 713 F.2d 1500 (11th Cir. 1983)	9
<i>Frintzilas v. DirecTV, LLC</i> , 731 F. App'x 71 (2d Cir. 2018)	35
<i>Frye v. Barbour</i> , 2017 WL 4226531 (M.D. Fla. Sept. 22, 2017).....	12
<i>Gen. Elec. Co. v. Lowe's Home Centers, Inc.</i> , 279 Ga. 77 (2005)	20
<i>Glennon v. Dean Witter Reynolds, Inc.</i> , 83 F.3d 132 (6th Cir. 1996)	9
<i>Gordon v. JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A.</i> , No. CIV.A. H-12-0528, 2012 WL 1552050 (S.D. Tex. Apr. 30, 2012)	17
<i>Grinold v. Farist</i> , 284 Ga. App. 120, 643 S.E.2d 253 (2007)	24
<i>Hamilton v. Powell, Goldstein, Frazer & Murphy</i> , 167 Ga. App. 411, 306 S.E.2d 340 (1983), <i>aff'd</i> , 252 Ga. 149, 311 S.E.2d 818 (1984)	20
<i>Hart v. Hart</i> , 297 Ga. 709 (2015)	14
<i>Hartford Cas. Ins. Co. v. J.R. Mktg., L.L.C.</i> , 61 Cal. 4th 988 (2015)	18
<i>Harvey v. Merchan</i> , 860 S.E.2d 561 (Ga. 2021)	9
<i>Hayes v. Bank of New York Mellon</i> , No. 1:14-CV-338-TWT, 2014 WL 3887922 (Thrash, J.) (N.D. Ga. Aug. 6, 2014), <i>aff'd</i> , 592 F. App'x 891 (11th Cir. 2015).....	12
<i>Hite v. Anderson</i> , 284 Ga. App. 156 (2007)	28

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.