

KATHERINE L. MATTHEWS, COLORADO BAR NO. 53372  
Senior Counsel  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
United States Department of Justice  
999 18<sup>th</sup> Street, South Terrace, Room 370  
Denver, Colorado 80202  
Telephone: (303) 844-1365  
Facsimile: (303) 844-1350  
Katherine.Matthews@usdoj.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff United States*

LAWRENCE G. WASDEN  
Attorney General  
State of Idaho  
DARRELL G. EARLY  
Deputy Attorney General  
Chief, Natural Resources Division

LISA J. O'HARA, ISB # 7452  
Deputy Attorney General  
Department of Environmental Quality  
1410 N. Hilton, 2nd Floor  
Boise, Idaho 83706  
Telephone (208) 373-0494  
lisa\_ohara@deq.idaho.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Idaho*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF IDAHO

_____	)	
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, and	)	
the STATE OF IDAHO,	)	
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	Civil Action No.
v.	)	
	)	
P4 PRODUCTION, L.L.C.,	)	COMPLAINT
	)	
Defendant.	)	
_____	)	

The United States of America, by authority of the Attorney General of the United States and through the undersigned attorney, and at the request of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), and the State of Idaho, by the authority of the Idaho Attorney General and through the undersigned attorney, file this complaint and allege as follows:

### **NATURE OF THE ACTION**

1. This is a civil action brought under Sections 106, 107, and 113(g)(2)(B) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA), as amended, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 and 9607, for injunctive relief and recovery of costs incurred and to be incurred in response to releases and threatened releases of hazardous substances into the environment at or from the Ballard Mine Site (Site) located in Caribou County, Idaho.

2. The State of Idaho seeks additional relief under the Idaho Environmental Protection and Health Act (EPHA), Idaho Code § 39-101, *et seq.*, for certain injunctive relief, declaratory relief, and reimbursement of costs it has incurred and will incur relating to the discharge of hazardous substances at the Site.

### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and over the parties under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1345, and 1367 and Sections 106, 107, and 113(b) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607, & 9613(b).

4. Venue is proper in this judicial district under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2) and Section 113(b) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(b), because the releases or threatened releases of hazardous substances that gave rise to this claim occurred in this district, and because the Site is located in this district.

**DEFENDANT**

5. Defendant P4 Production, L.L.C. (Defendant) is a company formed in Delaware and registered to do business in the State of Idaho, and a wholly-owned subsidiary of the Monsanto Company, which is a subsidiary of Bayer AG.

6. Defendant is a “person” as defined in Section 101(21) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(21).

7. Defendant currently owns the Site.

**STATUTORY BACKGROUND**

8. CERCLA was enacted in 1980 to provide a comprehensive governmental mechanism for abating releases and threatened releases of hazardous substances and other pollutants and contaminants, and for funding the costs of such abatement and related enforcement activities, which are known as “response” actions, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9604(a), 9601(25).

9. Section 104(a)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9604(a)(1), provides:

Whenever (A) any hazardous substance is released or there is a substantial threat of such a release into the environment, or (B) there is a release or substantial threat of release into the environment of any pollutant or contaminant which may present an imminent and substantial danger to the public health or welfare, the President is authorized to act, consistent with the national contingency plan, to remove or arrange for the removal of, and provide for remedial action relating to such hazardous substance, pollutant, or contaminant at any time (including its removal from any contaminated natural resource), or take any other response measure consistent with the national contingency plan which the President deems necessary to protect the public health or welfare or the environment.

10. Section 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a), provides in pertinent part:

Notwithstanding any other provision or rule of law, and subject only to the defenses set forth in subsection (b) of this Section –

(1) the owner and operator of a vessel or a facility

\* \* \*

shall be liable for –

- (A) all costs of removal or remedial action incurred by the United States Government . . . not inconsistent with the National Contingency Plan . . . .

11. Under Section 106(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9606(a), the United States is also authorized to seek injunctive relief necessary to abate the imminent and substantial endangerment to the public health or welfare, or the environment, that may result from an actual or threatened release of a hazardous substance at or from a facility.

12. Section 113(g)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(g)(2), provides: “In any such action described in this subsection, the court shall enter a declaratory judgment on liability for response costs or damages that will be binding on any subsequent action or actions to recover further response costs or damages.”

13. The Idaho Environmental Protection and Health Act, Idaho Code §39-108, provides *inter alia* that:

...any person who has determined to have violated the provisions of this act or the rules, permits, or order promulgated hereunder, shall be liable for any expense incurred by the state in enforcing the act, or in enforcing or terminating any nuisance source of environmental degradation, cause of sickness or health hazard.

### **GENERAL ALLEGATIONS**

14. The Site is a former open-pit phosphate mine located in the Phosphate Resource Area of southeastern Idaho. The Site is located approximately thirteen miles north of Soda Springs, Idaho, in Caribou County. To manage cleanup operations of the Site, EPA has divided response actions for the Site into portions referred to as “Operable Units.”

15. On September 24, 2019, EPA issued a Record of Decision for Operable Unit 1 that called for, among other things, an engineered cover system over more than 500 acres of the Site where wastes are left in place, a series of permeable reactive barriers to intercept and treat contaminated groundwater, and wetland treatment cells to treat contaminated residual seeps and springs.

16. The Site is a “facility” as defined in Section 101(9) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(9).

17. There has been a “release” or a “threatened release” of “hazardous substances,” including selenium and heavy metals, into the “environment” at or from the Site, as those terms are defined in Section 101 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601.

18. In undertaking response actions to address the release or threat of release of hazardous substances at the Site, EPA has incurred and will continue to incur “response costs” as defined in Section 101(25) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(25).

19. The United States has incurred at least \$300,000 as of August 31, 2019, in response costs with respect to the Site that have not been reimbursed. These response costs are not inconsistent with the National Contingency Plan promulgated pursuant to Section 105 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9605, and codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 300.

20. The State of Idaho has incurred and will continue to incur response costs within the meaning of CERCLA Section 107(a), which are not inconsistent with the National Contingency Plan, and expenses within the meaning of Idaho Code §39-108 associated with responding to and terminating a nuisance, source of environmental degradation, cause of sickness or health hazard associated with the Site.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.