

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS**

IN RE BROILER CHICKEN ANTITRUST
LITIGATION

Civil Action No. 1:16-cv-08637

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:
*CERTAIN DIRECT ACTION PLAINTIFF
CASES*

Judge Thomas M. Durkin
Magistrate Judge Jeffrey T. Gilbert

**MOTION TO PRECLUDE ENFORCEMENT OF
CERTAIN DEFENDANTS' JUDGMENT SHARING AGREEMENT**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ii

BACKGROUND 3

 I. Defendants’ “Judgment Sharing Agreement” 3

 II. The JSA and Settlement Agreements with the Classes 4

 III. Direct Action Plaintiffs’ Request to Defendants for Production of the JSA 6

ARGUMENT 7

 I. The JSA’s J&S Negation Provision Should Be Found Invalid and Unenforceable 7

 A. Private Antitrust Enforcement and the Role of Joint and Several Liability 7

 B. The JSA’s J&S Negation Provision is Incompatible with the Federal Antitrust Regime 10

 C. The JSA’s J&S Negation Provision Violates Section 1 of Sherman Act 14

 D. The JSA’s J&S Negation Provision is Void Under Illinois Law 15

 II. The JSA’s Settlement Agreement Sharing Provision Should Be Found Unenforceable 16

CONCLUSION 17

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<u>Cases</u>	Page(s)
<i>Apple Inc. v. Pepper</i> , 139 S. Ct. 1514 (2019).....	8
<i>Armstrong v. Bd. of Sch. Dirs.</i> , 616 F.2d 305 (7th Cir. 1980).....	17
<i>Beaver v. Country Mut. Ins. Co.</i> , 95 Ill. App. 3d 1122 (5th Dist. 1981)	10
<i>Burlington Indus. v. Milliken & Co.</i> , 690 F.2d 380 (4th Cir. 1982).....	9
<i>Cali Express, Inc. v. Bermingham</i> , 2015 WL 13631361 (S.D. Ind. July 20, 2015)	16
<i>City of Atlanta v. Chattanooga Foundry & Pipeworks</i> , 127 F. 23 (6th Cir. 1903).....	8
<i>Dunbar v. American Tel. & Tel. Co.</i> , 87 N.E. 521 (Ill. 1909).....	15
<i>Elec. Contractors' Ass'n of City of Chi. v. A.S. Schulman Elec. Co.</i> , 63 N.E.2d 392 (Ill. 1945).....	15
<i>Flintkote Co. v. Lysfjord</i> , 246 F.2d 368 (9th Cir. 1957).....	9
<i>Fox Midwest Theaters, Inc. v. Means</i> , 221 F.2d 173 (8th Cir. 1955).....	14
<i>Goesel v. Boley Int'l (H.K.) Ltd.</i> , 738 F.3d 831 (7th Cir. 2013).....	16
<i>Hasbrouck v. BankAmerica Housing Servs.</i> , 187 F.R.D. 453 (N.D.N.Y. 1999)	16
<i>Hawaii v. Standard Oil Co. of Cal.</i> , 405 U.S. 251 (1972)	7
<i>Illinois Brick Co. v. Illinois</i> , 431 U.S. 720 (1977)	7

In re Brand Name Prescription Drugs Antitrust Litigation,
1995 WL 221853 (N.D. Ill. 1995) 10

In re Ins. Brokerage Antitrust Litig.,
282 F.R.D. 92 (D.N.J. 2012) 17

In re Sch. Asbestos Litig.,
921 F.2d 1330 (3d Cir. 1990) 17

Ironshore Speciality Ins. Co. v. Akorn, Inc.,
2021 WL 2399997 (N.D. Ill. June 11, 2021)..... 10

Jessup v. Luther,
277 F.3d 926 (7th Cir. 2002) 16

Jewel Tea Co. v. Local Unions,
274 F.2d 217 (7th Cir. 1960) 14

Kelly v. Kosuga,
358 U.S. 516 (1959) 14

Lawlor v. Nat’l Screen Serv. Corp.,
349 U.S. 322 (1955) 14

Marion Healthcare, LLC v. Becton Dickinson & Co.,
952 F.3d 832 (2020) 8

Memorial Hosp. for McHenry Cnty. v. Shadur,
664 F.2d 1058 (7th Cir. 1981) 14

Mitsubishi Motors Corp. v. Soler Chrysler-Plymouth, Inc.,
473 U.S. 614 (1985) 13

Oberweis Dairy, Inc. v. Associated Milk Producers, Inc.,
568 F. Supp. 1096 (N.D. Ill. 1983)..... 13

Paper Sys. Inc. v. Nippon Paper Indus. Co.,
281 F.3d 629 (7th Cir. 2002) 8, 10, 12

Paramount Famous Lasky Corp. v. United States,
282 U.S. 30 (1930) 14

Perez v. Z Frank Oldsmobile, Inc.,
223 F.3d 617 (7th Cir. 2000) 10

...

Perma Life Mufflers, Inc. v. Int’l Parts Corp.,
392 U.S. 134 (1968) 7

Platinum Supplemental Ins., Inc. v. Guarantee Trust Life Ins. Co.,
989 F.3d 556 (7th Cir. 2021) 13

Scentura Creations, Inc. v. Long,
756 N.E.2d 451 (Ill. App. Ct. 2001) 15

Simpson v. Union Oil Co. of Cal.,
377 U.S. 13 (1964) 13

Tex. Indus., Inc. v. Radcliff Materials, Inc.,
451 U.S. 630 (1981) 7, 8

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Visa U.S.A., Inc.,
396 F.3d 96 (2d Cir. 2005) 17

Wells Fargo Funding v. Draper & Kramer Mortg. Corp.,
608 F. Supp. 2d 981 (N.D. Ill. 2009) 13

Zenith Radio Corp. v. Hazeltine Research, Inc.,
395 U.S. 100 (1969) 7

Statutes

15 U.S.C. § 15 12

Pub. L. No. 108–237, § 213(a), 118 Stat. 661 (2004) 9

Rules

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure Rule 23 15

Other Authorities

ABA Section of Antitrust Law, *Antitrust Law Developments* (8th ed. 2017) 9, 12

IIA Phillip E. Areeda, et al., *Antitrust Law* ¶ 330d (4th 2014) 8

Christopher R. Leslie, *Judgment-Sharing Agreements*, 58 Duke L.J. 747 (2009) 1, 2, 8

Manual for Complex Litigation, Fourth, § 13.23 at 178 1, 2

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.