

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION**

*In re: Clearview AI, Inc. Consumer  
Privacy Litigation*

)  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)

Case No. 1:21-cv-00135

Hon. Sharon Johnson Coleman

**CLEARVIEW DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN OPPOSITION TO  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .....	1
BACKGROUND .....	3
A. Clearview’s Product and Operations .....	3
B. Clearview’s Voluntary Changes to Its Business .....	5
C. Clearview’s Continued Commitment to Its Business Changes .....	6
LEGAL STANDARD.....	7
ARGUMENT.....	8
I. Clearview’s Operations Are Exempt From BIPA .....	8
II. Plaintiffs Cannot Show a Likelihood of Success on the Merits.....	9
A. BIPA Cannot Be Applied to Regulate Out-Of-State Conduct.....	9
B. Plaintiffs’ Claim Is Barred by the First Amendment .....	12
1. Clearview Is Engaged in Speech That Is Protected by the First Amendment.....	12
2. BIPA Is a Content- and Speaker-Based Restriction Subject to Strict Scrutiny .....	13
3. BIPA Is Subject to, and Cannot Survive, Strict Scrutiny .....	14
C. Clearview’s Operations Are Exempt From BIPA .....	15
III. The Harms to Clearview and to the Public Weigh Against Entry of an Injunction.....	15
A. Plaintiffs Will Not Be Irreparably Harmed Absent an Injunction .....	15
B. Clearview Will Be Irreparably Harmed If Plaintiffs’ Requested Injunctive Relief Is Granted .....	17
C. The Public Will Be Harmed If Clearview’s Activities Are Enjoined.....	19
IV. Plaintiffs Have Not Demonstrated That They Lack an Adequate Remedy at Law .....	20
CONCLUSION.....	20

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>ACLU v. Alvarez</i> , 679 F.3d 583 (7th Cir. 2012) .....	19
<i>Air Serv Corp. v. Serv. Emps. Int’l Union, Loc. 1</i> , 225 F. Supp. 3d 745 (N.D. Ill. 2016) .....	18
<i>Avery v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.</i> , 216 Ill. 2d 100, 835 N.E.2d 801 (2005) .....	9
<i>Bryant v. Compass Grp. USA, Inc.</i> , 958 F.3d 617 (7th Cir. 2020) .....	14
<i>Cassell v. Snyders</i> , 458 F. Supp. 3d 981 (N.D. Ill. 2020) .....	9
<i>Doe I v. Yesner</i> , No. 3:19-CV-0136-HRH, 2019 WL 4196054 (D. Alaska Sept. 4, 2019).....	13
<i>Elrod v. Burns</i> , 427 U.S. 347 (1976).....	19
<i>Goodman v. Ill. Dep’t of Fin. &amp; Prof’l Regulation</i> , 430 F.3d 432 (7th Cir. 2005) .....	1, 7
<i>Guest v. Leis</i> , 255 F.3d 325 (6th Cir. 2001) .....	13
<i>Healy v. Beer Inst., Inc.</i> , 491 U.S. 324 (1989).....	10
<i>Kessler v. Pass</i> , No. 18-cv-530, 2018 WL 5307821 (S.D. Ill. Oct. 26, 2018).....	17
<i>Landau v. CNA Fin. Corp.</i> , 381 Ill. App. 3d 61, 886 N.E.2d 405 (1st Dist. 2008).....	10
<i>Lockwood v. Am. Airlines, Inc.</i> , 107 F.3d 1565 (Fed. Cir. 1997).....	6
<i>Maxim’s Ltd. v. Badonsky</i> , 772 F.2d 388 (7th Cir. 1985) .....	17

*Mazurek v. Armstrong*,  
520 U.S. 968 (1997).....7

*Medeco Sec. Locks, Inc. v. Swiderek*,  
680 F.2d 37 (7th Cir. 1981) .....7

*Midwest Title Loans, Inc. v. Mills*,  
593 F.3d 660 (7th Cir. 2010) .....10, 11

*Monroy v. Shutterfly, Inc.*,  
No. 16 C 10984, 2017 WL 4099846 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 15, 2017).....9, 10

*Nieman v. VersusLaw, Inc.*,  
512 F. App'x 635 (7th Cir. 2013) .....12

*Outdoor Lighting Perspectives Franchising, Inc. v. Stubbs*,  
No. 11-cv-2524, 2012 WL 12904016 (D.S.C. June 15, 2012) .....16

*Pac. Trellis Fruit, LLC v. Agricola Yaurilla, S.A.*,  
No. 16-cv-4160, 2016 WL 9226379 (C.D. Cal. Oct. 17, 2016) .....16

*Piekosz-Murphy v. Bd. of Educ. of Cmty. High Sch. Dist. No. 230*,  
858 F. Supp. 2d 952 (N.D. Ill. 2012) .....7

*Reed v. Town of Gilbert*,  
576 U.S. 155 (2015).....13

*Reno v. ACLU*,  
521 U.S. 844 (1997).....14

*Rivera v. Google Inc.*,  
238 F. Supp. 3d 1088 (N.D. Ill. 2017) .....9, 10

*Roland Mach. Co. v. Dresser Indus., Inc.*,  
749 F.2d 380 (7th Cir. 1984) .....15, 19, 20

*S. New England Tel. Co. v. Glob. NAPs Inc.*,  
624 F.3d 123 (2d Cir. 2010).....18

*Smith v. Daily Mail Pub. Co.*,  
443 U.S. 97 (1979).....12

*Sorrell v. IMS Health Inc.*,  
564 U.S. 552 (2011).....12, 13

*TD Bank N.A. v. Hill*,  
928 F.3d 259 (3d Cir. 2019).....20

*Teamsters Loc. Unions Nos. 75 & 200 v. Barry Trucking, Inc.*,  
176 F.3d 1004 (7th Cir. 1999) .....9

*Ty, Inc. v. GMA Accessories, Inc.*,  
132 F.3d 1167 (7th Cir. 1997) .....7

*United States v. Caira*,  
833 F.3d 803 (7th Cir. 2016) .....14

*United States v. Khan*,  
No. 15-cr-286, 2017 WL 2362572 (N.D. Ill. May 31, 2017) .....12

*United States v. Philip Morris USA, Inc.*,  
327 F. Supp. 2d 21 (D.D.C. 2004) .....19

*White v. Rozum*,  
No. 06-cv-244, 2007 WL 218709 (W.D. Pa. Jan. 25, 2007) .....17

*Winter v. Nat. Res. Def. Council, Inc.*,  
555 U.S. 7 (2008).....15, 19

**Statutes**

740 ILCS 14/10.....13

740 ILCS 14/25.....1, 8, 13

**Other Authorities**

Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(c) .....18

Kashmir Hill & Gabriel J.X. Dance, *Clearview’s Facial Recognition App Is Identifying Child Victims of Abuse*, N.Y. Times (Feb. 7, 2020) .....19

A1911, Assemb., Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2019).....11

A9793, Assemb., Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2018).....11

S1203, Senate, Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2019).....11

S8547, Senate, Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2018).....11

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.