

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MARYLAND

JUDY JIEN, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PERDUE FARMS, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

C.A. No. 1:19-CV-2521-SAG

**PLAINTIFFS' MEMORANDUM IN
SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR
PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF
SETTLEMENT WITH PILGRIM'S
PRIDE CORP., CERTIFICATION OF
SETTLEMENT CLASS, AND
APPOINTMENT OF SETTLEMENT
CLASS COUNSEL**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. BACKGROUND 1

 A. The Litigation..... 1

 B. The Settlement Agreement 2

 1. The Settlement Class..... 3

 2. The Settlement Amount 3

 3. Cooperation Requirements..... 3

 4. Release of All Claims against Pilgrim’s 4

III. THE COURT SHOULD PRELIMINARILY APPROVE THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT 5

 A. Standard for Granting Preliminary Approval 5

 B. The Settlement Agreement Is Fair 7

 C. The Settlement Agreement Is Adequate 10

IV. THE COURT SHOULD CERTIFY THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT CLASS 13

 A. The Settlement Class Satisfies Rule 23(a) 14

 1. Numerosity..... 14

 2. Commonality..... 15

 3. Typicality 15

 4. Adequacy 16

 B. The Requirements of Rule 23(b)(3) Are Satisfied..... 16

 1. Predominance of Common Issues..... 17

 a. Violation of the Antitrust Laws..... 18

 b. Impact of the Unlawful Activity 19

 c. Measurable Damages 22

 2. Superiority of a Class Action..... 22

V. DEFERRING CLASS NOTICE IS APPROPRIATE IN THIS CASE 23

VI. CONCLUSION..... 25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES	PAGE(S)
<i>In re A.H. Robins Co.</i> , 880 F.2d 709 (4th Cir. 1989)	14
<i>Adesso Homeowners' Ass'n v. Holder Props., Inc.</i> , No. 3:16-cv-710-JFA, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 224941 (D.S.C. May 23, 2017)	9, 15
<i>Am. Sales Co. v. Pfizer, Inc.</i> , No. 2:14cv361, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 137222 (E.D. Va. July 28, 2017)	15, 18, 19
<i>Amchem Prods., Inc., v. Windsor</i> , 521 U.S. 591 (1997).....	16, 17, 23
<i>Amgen Inc. v. Conn. Ret. Plans & Tr. Funds</i> , 568 U.S. 455 (2013).....	17
<i>In re Ampicillin Antitrust Litig.</i> , 82 F.R.D. 652 (D.D.C. 1979).....	13
<i>In re Auto. Wire Harnesses</i> , No. 12-md-02311, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 183483 (E.D. Mich. Sept. 30, 2020)	24
<i>Brown v. Transurban USA, Inc.</i> , 318 F.R.D. 560 (E.D. Va. 2016)	14
<i>Cantu-Guerrero v. Lumber Liquidators, Inc.</i> , 952 F.3d 471 (4th Cir. 2020)	6, 7
<i>In re Cardizem CD Antitrust Litig.</i> , 200 F.R.D. 297 (E.D. Mich. 2001)	17
<i>In re Cardizem CD Antitrust Litig.</i> , 218 F.R.D. 508 (E.D. Mich. 2003)	12
<i>City of Ann Arbor Employees' Ret. Sys. v. Sonoco Prods. Co.</i> , 270 F.R.D. 247 (D.S.C. 2010)	23
<i>City of Cape Coral Mun. Firefighters' Ret. Plan v. Emergent Biosolutions, Inc.</i> , 322 F. Supp. 3d 676 (D. Md. 2018).....	17
<i>In re Corrugated Container Antitrust Litig.</i> , 643 F.2d 195 (5th Cir. 1981)	16
<i>Cypress v. Newport News Gen. & Non-Sectarian Hosp. Ass'n</i> , 375 F.2d 648 (4th Cir. 1967)	14

..

D&M Farms v. Birdsong Corp.,
No. 2:19-cv-463, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 226047 (E.D. Va. Dec. 1, 2020).....15

Donovan v. Estate of Fitzsimmons,
778 F.2d 298 (7th Cir. 1985)11

Fire & Police Retiree Health Care Fund v. Smith,
Civil Action No. CCB-18-3670, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 217892 (D. Md. Nov.
20, 2020)6

Gaston v. Lexisnexis Risk Sols., Inc.,
No. 5:16-cv-00009-KDB-DCK, 2021 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 12872 (W.D.N.C. Jan.
25, 2021)9, 10

Gen. Tel. Co. of Sw. v. Falcon,
457 U.S. 147 (1982).....16

Grunin v. Int’l House of Pancakes,
513 F.2d 114 (8th Cir. 1975)11

Gunnells v. Healthplan Servs., Inc.,
348 F.3d 417 (4th Cir. 2003)14, 16

Herrera v. Charlotte Sch. of Law, LLC,
818 F. App’x 165 (4th Cir. 2020)7

Hughes v. Baird & Warner, Inc.,
No. 76 C 3929, 1980 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 13885 (N.D. Ill. Aug. 20, 1980)17

In re Hydrogen Peroxide Antitrust Litig.,
552 F.3d 305 (3d Cir. 2008).....19

In re India Globalization Cap., Inc.,
No. DKC 18-3698, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 77190 (D. Md. May 1, 2020)7, 8, 10

In re IPO Sec. Litig.,
226 F.R.D. 186 (S.D.N.Y. 2005)13

In re Jiffy Lube Sec. Litig.,
927 F.2d 155 (4th Cir. 1991)5, 10

McKinney v. U.S. Postal Serv.,
292 F.R.D. 62 (D.D.C. 2013).....24

In re MicroStrategy, Inc. Sec. Litig.,
148 F. Supp. 2d 654 (E.D. Va. 2001)10

...

In re Mid-Atlantic Toyota Antitrust Litig.,
564 F. Supp. 1379 (D. Md. 1983)6, 11

In re Nexium Antitrust Litig.,
777 F.3d 9 (1st Cir. 2015).....21

In re PNC Fin. Servs. Grp., Inc., Sec. Litig.,
440 F. Supp. 2d 421 (W.D. Pa. 2006).....8, 9, 12

S.C. Nat’l Bank v. Stone,
139 F.R.D. 335 (D.S.C. 1991)6, 12

Seaman v. Duke Univ.,
No. 1:15-CV-462, 2018 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 16136 (M.D.N.C. Feb. 1, 2018)20, 21, 22

In re Serzone Prods. Liab. Litig.,
231 F.R.D. 221 (S.D. W. Va. 2005).....8, 22

Sharp Farms v. Speaks,
917 F.3d 276 (4th Cir. 2019)11

Strang v. JHM Mortg. Sec. Ltd. P’ship,
890 F. Supp. 499 (E.D. Va. 1995)8

Sullivan v. DB Invs., Inc.,
667 F.3d 273 (3d Cir. 2011) (*en banc*)7

Temp. Servs., Inc. v. Am. Int’l Grp., Inc.,
No. 3:08-cv-00271-JFA, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 86474 (D.S.C. June 22, 2012) *passim*

In re Titanium Dioxide Antitrust Litig.,
284 F.R.D. 328 (D. Md. 2012).....14

United States v. Manning Coal Corp.,
977 F.2d 117 (4th Cir. 1992)6

US Airline Pilots Ass’n v. Velez,
No. 3:14-cv-00577-RJC-DCK, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 54239 (W.D.N.C. Apr.
22, 2016)11

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes,
564 U.S. 338 (2011).....15

In re Zetia Ezetimihe Antitrust Litig.,
No. 2:18-md-2836, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 112331 (E.D. Va. June 18, 2020).....17, 18, 19, 21

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.