John Meyer, MT Bar # 11206 Cottonwood Environmental Law Center P.O. Box 412 Bozeman, MT 59771 (406) 546-0149 | Phone John@cottonwoodlaw.org

Counsel for Plaintiff

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA BUTTE DIVISION

COTTONWOOD ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER,	Case No. CV-22-05-BU-BMM-JTJ
Plaintiff,)
vs.	
MARY ERICKSON, in her official capacity as Forest Supervisor of the Custer Gallatin National Forest; UNITED STATES FOREST SERVICE, an agency of the U.S. Department of Agriculture) COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF)
Defendants.))
)
)



INTRODUCTION

- 1. Climate change is the most existential threat facing humanity.
- 2. This case challenges the Custer Gallatin National Forest's failure to protect the public from climate change.
- 3. More carbon is stored in forests than in anywhere else but the oceans, and the United States has the world's fourth largest forest estate, behind only Russia, Brazil, and Canada.
- 4. The importance of carbon storage capacity of the earth's forests is tied to their role in removing atmospheric carbon that is contributing to ongoing global warming.
- 5. The top three anthropogenic (human-caused) contributors to greenhouse gas emissions (from 1970-2004) are: fossil fuel combustion, deforestation, and agriculture. Land use change, primarily the conversion of forests to other land uses (deforestation) is the second leading source of human-caused greenhouse gas emissions globally.
- 6. The Forest Service previously determined that it needed to revise its 1987 Custer Gallatin Forest Plan because "[d]irection guided by new information and science is needed to address impacts reasonably expected to occur as a result of climate change." FEIS Ch. 1 p. 5.
- 7. "A key assumption" in the Environmental Impact Statement ("EIS") for the 2022 Custer Gallatin Forest Plan "is that the forestland will not be converted to a non-forest condition after harvesting and will remain productive." FEIS Vol. IV at 20.



- 8. On June 9, 2020, Cottonwood provided Defendant Erickson with a 2017 article from the National Academy of Sciences that states "when thinning is combined with the expected warming, unintended consequences may ensue, whereby regeneration is compromised and forested areas convert to nonforest." Tania Schoennagel, *Adapt to More Wildfire in Western North American Forests as Climate Changes*, PROCEEDINGS OF NATIONAL ACADEMY OF SCIENCES, April 17, 2017, 114 (18) 4586.
- 9. The Forest Service violated the National Environmental Policy Act ("NEPA") by failing to disclose and analyze the contradictory science found in the NATIONAL ACADEMY OF SCIENCES article in its NEPA analysis for the 2022 Revised Custer Gallatin Forest Plan. *See* FEIS Vol. IV at 214; FEIS Vol. III at 434 (References cited).
- 10. The Custer Gallatin started logging three old growth timber sales—the Bozeman Municipal Watershed project, North Bridger project, and North Hebgen project—before the Forest Plan revision was complete.
 - 11. According to the Record of Decision for the BMW project:

This proposal does not fall within any of these primary contributors of global greenhouse gas emissions nor is it similar to the primary human activities exerting negative pressure on the carbon sink that currently exists in U.S. forests. The affected forests will remain forests, not converted to other land uses, and long-term forest services and benefits will be maintained.

ROD at 44-45.

12. Defendants violated NEPA by failing to take a hard look at the impacts of logging when combined with climate change in the revised Custer Gallatin National Forest Plan and associated analysis.



13. The Forest Service's implementation of the Revised Forest Plan through three site-specific old growth timber sales is a violation of NEPA.

JURISDICTION

- 14. This Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 (federal question), 28 U.S.C. §2201 (Declaratory Judgment Act), 5 U.S.C. §§ 701-706, et. seq. (Administrative Procedure Act), and the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) 42 U.S.C. § 4321 et seq.
- 15. The federal government has waived sovereign immunity and the court has jurisdiction to hear this action pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 701-706.
- 16. An actual controversy exists between Plaintiff and Defendants. Plaintiff's members use the Gallatin National Forest for survival in the form of carbon sequestration. Plaintiff's members also use Project areas that are being loggeed for hiking, fishing, hunting, camping, photography, horseback riding and engaging in other vocational, scientific, spiritual, and recreational activities.
- 17. Plaintiffs' members intend to continue to use and enjoy the Custer Gallaitn National Forest and Project areas frequently and on an ongoing basis in the future.
- 18. Implementation of the 2022 Revised Custer Gallatin Forest Plan through the Bozeman Municipal Watershed, North Hebgen, and North Bridger Forest Health Projects will cause irreparable harm to Cottonwood members' interest in self-preservation as well as their aesthetic, recreational, scientific, spiritual, conservation, and educational interests. These are actual and concrete injuries caused by



Defendants' failure to comply with mandatory duties under NEPA and the APA. The requested relief would redress these injuries and this Court has the authority to grant Plaintiffs' requested relief.

VENUE

19. Venue is proper in the United States District Court for the District of Montana pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e). Plaintiffs are located in Bozeman and within the Butte Division of the United States District Court for the District of Montana. Defendant Erickson is the Forest Supervisor of the Custer Gallatin National Forest. Her office is located within the Butte Division of the United States District Court for the District of Montana. Venue is also proper under Rule 3.2 of the Local Rules of Procedure of the United States District Court for the District of Montana.

PARTIES

20. Plaintiff Cottonwood Environmental Law Center is a conservation organization dedicated to protecting the people, forests, water and wildlife in the West. Cottonwood is based in Bozeman, Montana. Cottonwood members have visited the Project areas for years and have aesthetic, recreational, spiritual, scientific, and conservation interests in the Custer Gallatin National Forest, including the Bozeman Municipal Watershed Project area, North Bridger Forest Health, and North Hebgen Project areas. Cottonwood members have suffered and will continue to experience concrete injuries to their self-preservation as well as their aesthetic,



DOCKET

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

