UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

IN RE: DIRECT PURCHASER INSULIN PRICING LITIGATION	Civil Action No. 20-03426 (BRM)(LHG) (Consolidated)
This Document Relates To:	**ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED**
All Actions	

MANUFACTURER DEFENDANTS' REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION TO DISMISS THE FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT

(Counsel Listed on Next Page)

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

REED SMITH LLP
Melissa A. Geist
506 Carnegie Center, Suite 300
Princeton, NJ 08540
Tel.: (609) 514-5978

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
Shankar Duraiswamy
Henry Liu (*admitted pro hac vice*)
One CityCenter
850 Tenth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20001
Tel.: (202) 662-6000

Attorneys for Defendant Eli Lilly and Company

WALSH PIZZI O'REILLY FALANGA LLP
Liza M. Walsh
Katelyn O'Reilly
William T. Walsh, Jr.
Three Gateway Center
100 Mulberry Street, 15th Floor
Newark, NJ 07102
Tel.: (973) 757-1100

JONES DAY
Michael R. Shumaker
(*admitted pro hac vice*)
William D. Coglianese
(*admitted pro hac vice*)
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20001
Tel.: (202) 879-3939

Attorneys for Defendant Sanofi-Aventis U.S. LLC

GIBBONS P.C.
Michael R. Griffinger
Michael R. McDonald
Christopher Walsh
One Gateway Center
Newark, NJ 07102
Tel.: (973) 596-4500

DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP
James P. Rouhandeh*
David B. Toscano*
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017
Tel.: (212) 450-4000

Neal A. Potischman*
Andrew Yaphe*
1600 El Camino Real
Menlo Park, CA 94025
Tel.: (650) 752-2000

**pro hac vice pending*

Attorneys for Defendant Novo Nordisk Inc.

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iii

INTRODUCTION 1

ARGUMENT 2

I. Plaintiffs' Robinson-Patman Act Claim Should Be Dismissed. 2

A. Plaintiffs Lack Antitrust Standing to Assert a Section 2(c) Claim. 2

B. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead the Requisite Buyer-Seller Relationship. 4

C. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead a Section 2(c) Commercial Bribery Claim. 6

D. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead a Dummy Brokerage Claim. 10

II. Plaintiffs' Sherman Act Claims Should Be Dismissed. 11

A. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead a Plausible Price-Fixing Claim Among the Manufacturer Defendants. 11

B. Plaintiffs Fail To Plead A Conspiracy Involving All Defendants. 15

III. Plaintiffs' RICO Claims Should Be Dismissed. 15

A. Plaintiffs Abandon Their Mail and Wire Fraud Predicate Acts. 15

B. Plaintiffs Lack Standing to Assert Alleged Violations of the Anti-Kickback Statute as Predicate Acts. 16

C. Plaintiffs Fail to Plead Any Predicate Violations of the Anti-Kickback Statute. 18

D. Plaintiffs Fail to Allege a RICO Conspiracy. 19

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

IV. Plaintiffs' Claims Are Partially Time-Barred..... 20

V. Plaintiff PDC's Claims Should Be Dismissed. 25

CONCLUSION 25

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

2660 Woodley Rd. Joint Venture v. ITT Sheraton Corp.,
369 F.3d 732 (3d Cir. 2004) 1, 2, 3, 4

In re Aetna UCR Litig.,
2015 WL 3970168 (D.N.J. June 30, 2015).....13

Allen v. Verizon Commc'ns, Inc.,
2019 WL 399922 (D.N.J. Jan. 31, 2019).....13, 14

In re Allergan ERISA Litig.,
975 F.3d 348 (3d Cir. 2020) 1, 11, 12

Ashcroft v. Iqbal,
556 U.S. 662 (2009).....18

In re Aspartame Antitrust Litig.,
416 F. App'x 208 (3d Cir. 2011) 24

In re Avandia Mktg. Sales Pracs. & Prod. Liab. Litig.,
804 F.3d 633 (3d Cir. 2015) 18

In re Baby Food Antitrust Litig.,
166 F.3d 112 (3d Cir. 1999) 14

Baglio v. Baska,
116 F.3d 467 (3d Cir. 1997) (unpublished table decision).....17

Baglio v. Baska,
940 F. Supp. 819 (W.D. Pa. 1996).....16, 17

Barton & Pittinos, Inc. v. SmithKline Beecham Corp.,
118 F.3d 178 (3d Cir. 1997) 4

Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly,
550 U.S. 544 (2007).....14, 18

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.