UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

٦

OTHART DAIRY FARMS, LLC, PAREO FARM, INC., PAREO FARM II, INC., DESERTLAND DAIRY, LLC, DEL ORO DAIRY, LLC, BRIGHT STAR DAIRY, LLC, and SUNSET DAIRY, LLC, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,	Case No CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT
Plaintiffs,	
VS.	
DAIRY FARMERS OF AMERICA, INC., SELECT MILK PRODUCERS, INC., and GREATER SOUTHWEST AGENCY,	
Defendants.	

DOCKET A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	NATURE OF ACTION	. 1
II.	JURISDICTION AND VENUE	. 5
III.	PARTIES	. 7
A.	Plaintiffs	. 7
В.	Defendants	. 8
IV.	AGENTS AND CO-CONSPIRATORS	. 9
V.	TRADE AND COMMERCE	11
VI.	FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS	12
A.	Background on the Dairy Industry	12
1	. Basics of Raw Grade A Milk	12
2	. The Southwest Dairy Production Market Is Worth More than \$3.5 Billion Annually	13
3	. There Are No Significant Substitutes for Milk and Milk Products	13
4	. The Capper-Volstead Act	13
5	. Milk Balancing and Milk Classes	15
6	. Dairy Production in the United States	16
7	. History of and Background on DFA and Select Milk	17
	a. DFA	17
	b. Select Milk	18
8	. DFA's Regions	19
9	. Dairy Industry History	21
1	0. Federal Milk Policy and Pricing	24
1	1. Federal Milk Marketing Orders	29
В.	The Structure and Characteristics of the Southwest Dairy Market Render the Conspirace Economically Plausible	
1	. Milk Is a Commodity	31
2	. The Market Is Characterized by Inelastic Demand	31

Case 2:22-cv-00251-GJF-SMV Document 1 Filed 04/04/22 Page 3 of 77

3.	The Southwest Dairy Industry Is Highly Concentrated and Has Experienced High Consolidation
4.	The Southwest Dairy Industry Is Characterized by a Lack of Pricing Transparency and Asymmetric Access to Key Market Information
5.	Has Been Repeatedly, Successfully Sued for Violations of the Federal Antitrust Laws
	a. DFA's History of Wrongdoing
	b. Prior Antitrust Class Litigation Against DFA
	i. Southeast and Appalachian FMMOs
	ii. Northeast FMMO 40
6.	Defendants Had and Have Numerous Opportunities to Collude
7.	There Are High Barriers to Entry in the Southwest Dairy Market
C.	DFA and Select Milk Conspired With One Another to Depress Prices Paid to Southwestern Dairy Farmers
1.	DFA's and Select Milk's Coordination as Part of GSA
D.	The Prices Paid to Southwestern Dairy Farmers for Their Raw Grade A Milk Fell Beginning in At Least January 2015 and Have Remained Low
E.	DFA's and Select Milk's Decreased Pooling of Milk
F.	DFA's and Select Milk's Self-Dealing
VII.	CLASS ACTION ALLEGATIONS
VIII.	ANTITRUST INJURY
IX.	ACTIVE CONCEALMENT
X.	CAUSE OF ACTION
XI.	REQUEST FOR RELIEF
XII.	JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Case 2:22-cv-00251-GJF-SMV Document 1 Filed 04/04/22 Page 4 of 77

Plaintiffs Othart Dairy Farms, LLC, Pareo Farm, Inc., Pareo Farm II, Inc., Desertland Dairy, LLC, Del Oro Dairy, LLC, Bright Star Dairy, LLC, and Sunset Dairy, LLC, ("Plaintiffs"), bring this action on behalf of themselves individually and on behalf of a plaintiff class (the "Class"), pursuant to Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure consisting of all dairy farmers, whether individuals or entities, who produced Grade A milk and sold Grade A milk independently or directly or through an agent to Defendants, Dairy Farmers of America, Inc. ("DFA") and Select Milk Producers, Inc. ("Select Milk") or Co-Conspirators within DFA's Southwest Area region any time from at least January 1, 2015 until present (the "Class Period"). Plaintiffs also allege claims against Defendant Greater Southwest Agency ("GSA"). Plaintiffs bring this action for treble damages under the antitrust laws of the United States against Defendants, and demand a trial by jury.

I. NATURE OF ACTION

1. Dairy cooperatives are meant to serve dairy-farmer owners. However, as alleged herein, in the Southwest United States the two largest dairy cooperatives, DFA and Select Milk, have conspired in violation of the Sherman Act to suppress pay to dairy farmers. DFA and Select Milk control at least 75% of the Southwest market, and together have used that control to significantly depress the price dairy farmers receive for their raw milk. The effect of Defendants' conspiracy has been devastating to many dairy farmers, causing numerous farmers to borrow from generations of equity built up in their land, relying on that equity to pay themselves and keep their farms in operation. Many Southwestern dairy farmers have been forced to declare bankruptcy and completely closed their operations.

2. Upon information and belief, as alleged herein, DFA and Select Milk have conspired with one another to stabilize and depress the prices paid to these cooperatives' farmers

Case 2:22-cv-00251-GJF-SMV Document 1 Filed 04/04/22 Page 5 of 77

for the raw Grade A milk they produce in several ways, including: (a) unlawfully sharing pricing information though, *inter alia*, their various commercial joint ventures as well as Defendant GSA; (b) driving down take-home pay for dairy farmers through selective and increasingly frequent non-pooling of milk, allowing the cooperatives as entities to market members' milk at higher prices without passing those increases on to farmers; and (c) unlawfully coordinating pricing and pricing-related decisions. Upon information and belief, DFA's and Select Milk's monthly rates to their respective member-farmers – what Plaintiffs and Class members actually receive – are almost always within a few pennies of each other. This would not be the case absent the conspiracy alleged herein.

3. Since at least January 2015, the prices paid by DFA and Select Milk for the raw Grade A milk their member-farmers have produced have been unlawfully and artificially depressed as a result of the conduct alleged herein, even though these Defendants' revenues and profits have increased. As a direct result of this unlawful conspiracy, the percentage of their revenues that DFA and Select Milk are paying to Plaintiffs and the Class has dwindled.

4. DFA and Select Milk are organized as member-owned, non-profit dairy cooperatives, obligated to operate for the benefit of their farmer-members. Their members are obligated to deliver all of their milk to the cooperative to market on their behalf. In turn, the cooperatives must market or process their member-farmers' raw Grade A milk to obtain the best possible price for the product. DFA and Select Milk have utterly forsaken this obligation, and have conspired to stabilize, fix, and maintain at artificially depressed rates the raw Grade A milk prices paid to Plaintiffs and Class members.

5. The vast majority of milk marketed in the Southwest, approximately 85-90%, is marketed via a dairy cooperative. DFA is the largest dairy cooperative both in the Southwest and

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET A L A R M



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.