

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT NEW YORK

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|-----------------|
| ----- | X | |
| STEPHANIE SINCLAIR, | : | |
| | : | |
| Plaintiff, | : | |
| | : | |
| v. | : | 18-CV-790 (DAB) |
| | : | |
| ZIFF DAVIS, LLC, and MASHABLE, INC., | : | |
| | : | |
| Defendants. | : | |
| ----- | X | |

MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS

DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP
James Rosenfeld
1251 Avenue of the Americas, 21st Floor
New York, NY 10020
Tel: 212-489-8230
jamesrosenfeld@dwt.com

ZIFF DAVIS, LLC
George Wukoson
114 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10011
Tel: 646-397-0874
george_wukoson@ziffdavis.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Ziff Davis, LLC,
and Mashable, Inc.*



TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|--------------------|
| PRELIMINARY STATEMENT | 1 |
| I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND..... | 2 |
| A. The Parties | 2 |
| B. Embedding | 3 |
| C. Instagram..... | 5 |
| D. The Photo and the Article | 8 |
| II. ARGUMENT | 10 |
| A. STANDARDS OF REVIEW | 10 |
| B. MASHABLE HOLDS A SUB-LICENSE TO THE INSTAGRAM POST, A “COMPLETE DEFENSE” TO PLAINTIFF’S CLAIMS | 12 |
| C. PLAINTIFF FAILS TO STATE A CLAIM FOR RELIEF AGAINST ZIFF DAVIS | 14 |
| CONCLUSION..... | 16 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | <u>Page(s)</u> |
|--|-----------------------|
| Cases | |
| <i>Applebaum v. Lyft, Inc.</i> , 263 F. Supp. 3d 454 (S.D.N.Y. 2017)..... | 13 |
| <i>Ariel (UK) Ltd. v. Reuters Grp. PLC</i> , No. 05 CIV. 9646 (JFK), 2006 WL 3161467 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 31, 2006), <i>aff'd</i> , 277 F. App'x 43 (2d Cir. 2008) | 12 |
| <i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009)..... | 10, 11 |
| <i>Boarding School Review, LLC v. Delta Career Educ. Corp.</i> , No. 11 Civ. 8921, 2013 WL 6670584 (Mar. 29, 2013) | 11 |
| <i>BWP Media USA, Inc. v. Gossip Cop Media, LLC</i> , 87 F. Supp. 3d 499 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)..... | 10 |
| <i>BWP Media USA Inc. v. Hollywood Fan Sites, LLC</i> , 69 F. Supp. 3d 342 (S.D.N.Y. 2014)..... | 11 |
| <i>Dauman v. Hallmark Card, Inc.</i> , No. 96 CIV. 3608 (JFK), 1998 WL 54633 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 9, 1998)..... | 14, 15 |
| <i>Flava Works, Inc. v. Gunter</i> , 689 F.3d 754 (7th Cir. 2012) | 1 |
| <i>Fteja v. Facebook, Inc.</i> , 841 F. Supp. 2d 829 (S.D.N.Y. 2012)..... | 13 |
| <i>Goldman v. Breitbart News Network, LLC</i> , No. 17-CV-3144 (KBF), 2018 WL 911340 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 15, 2018) | 2 |
| <i>Grady v. Iacullo</i> , No. 13-CV-00624-RM-KMT, 2016 WL 1559134 (D. Colo. Apr. 18, 2016)..... | 1 |
| <i>Graham v. James</i> , 144 F.3d 229 (2d Cir. 1998)..... | 12 |
| <i>Heston v. Farmers Ins. Grp.</i> , 160 Cal. App. 3d 402, 206 Cal. Rptr. 585 (Ct. App. 1984) | 13 |
| <i>Lasica v. America Online, Inc.</i> , No. CV 15-4230, GW (FFMx), 2015 WL 12791495 (C.D. Cal. Sept. 3, 2015) | 12 |

| | |
|---|------|
| <i>Leveyfilm, Inc. v. Fox Sports Interactive Media, LLC</i> , No. 13 C 4664, 2014 WL 3368893 (N.D. Ill. July 8, 2014) | 2 |
| <i>Live Face on Web, LLC v. Biblio Holdings LLC</i> , No. 15 Civ. 4848 (NRB), 2016 WL 4766344 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 13, 2016) (Buchwald, J.) | 1 |
| <i>Mayimba Music, Inc. v. Sony Corp. of Am.</i> , No. 12 Civ. 1094 AKH, 2014 WL 5334698 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 19, 2014), <i>order suspended</i> , No. 12 Civ. 1094 AKH, 2015 WL 6917260 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 30, 2015) | 14 |
| <i>Moss v. Infinity Ins. Co.</i> , No. 15-CV- 03456-JSC, 2016 WL 7178559 (N.D. Cal. Dec. 9, 2016) | 11 |
| <i>MyPlayCity, Inc. v. Conduit Ltd.</i> , No. 10 Civ. 1615(CM), 2012 WL 1107648 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 30, 2012), <i>adhered to on recons.</i> , 2012 WL 2929392 (S.D.N.Y. July 18, 2012) | 2 |
| <i>Patsy's Italian Restaurant, Inc. v. Banas</i> , 575 F. Supp. 2d 427 (E.D.N.Y. 2008), <i>aff'd</i> , 658 F. 3d 254 (2d Cir. 2011)..... | 11 |
| <i>Pearson Educ., Inc. v. Ishayev</i> , 963 F. Supp. 2d 239 (S.D.N.Y. 2013)..... | 2 |
| <i>Perfect 10, Inc. v. Amazon.com, Inc.</i> , 508 F.3d 1146 (9th Cir. 2007) | 1, 2 |
| <i>Person v. Google Inc.</i> , 456 F. Supp. 2d 488 (S.D.N.Y. 2006)..... | 13 |
| <i>Peter F. Gaito Architecture, LLC v. Simone Dev. Corp.</i> , 602 F.3d 57 (2d Cir. 2010)..... | 10 |
| <i>Republic Bank v. Marine Nat'l Bank</i> , 45 Cal. App. 4th 919, 53 Cal. Rptr. 2d 90 (1996)..... | 13 |
| <i>Schwartz v. HSBC Bank USA, N.A.</i> , 160 F. Supp. 3d 666 (S.D.N.Y. 2016)..... | 11 |
| <i>Sira v. Morton</i> , 380 F.3d 57 (2d Cir. 2004)..... | 11 |
| <i>Spinelli v. Nat'l Football League</i> , 96 F. Supp. 3d 81 (S.D.N.Y. 2015) | 12 |
| <i>Veronica Foods Co. v. Ecklin</i> , No. 16-CV- 07223-JCS, 2017 WL 2806706 (N.D. Cal. June 29, 2017) | 11 |

Viacom Int’l, Inc. v. YouTube, Inc.,
676 F.3d 19 (2d Cir. 2012).....16

Wang v. Pataki,
396 F. Supp. 2d 446 (S.D.N.Y. 2005).....11

Statutes

17 U.S.C. § 106(5)1, 2

17 U.S.C. § 512(c)15, 16

Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6).....1

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.