NYSCEE DOC NO 367

INDEX NO. 113802/2009

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/19/2018

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK NEW YORK COUNTY

PRESENT:	HON. MARGARET A. CHAN	PART	IAS MOTION 33EF	
		lustice		
		X INDEX NO	113802/2009	
ROBERT MC	CULLOUGH,	MOTION I	DATE	
	Plaintiff,	MOTION	SEQ. NO. 008 009	
	- V -			
ONE BRYANT PARK, DURST DEVELOPMENT, LLC., CONSTRUCTION CORP., COMPONENT ASSEMBLY INC.,				
	Defendant.			
		X		
	e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF docu 7, 248, 249, 250, 251, 252, 253, 254, 269, 2			
were read on this motion to/for		VACATE - DECISION/ORDER/JUDGMENT/AWARD .		
259, 260, 261	e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF docu , 262, 263, 264, 265, 266, 267, 268, 336, 33 , 353, 354, 356, 357, 358, 359			
were read on	this motion to/for	SET ASIDE	VERDICT	

In this personal injury action, a nine-day jury trial was held on October 2, 2017. The jury awarded plaintiff a total sum of \$3,927,046 for personal injuries and apportioned liability as follows: 90% to defendant One Bryant Park LLC (Owner)/Tishman Construction Corp. 1 (the Bryant defendants); 5% to Component Assembly Systems, Inc. (Component); and 5% to plaintiff. The Bryant defendants moved to set aside the verdict and requested a collateral source hearing pursuant to CPLR § 4545 in motion sequence (MS) 8. Defendant Component also moved in MS 9 to set aside the verdict. This court rendered a Decision and Order on those motions dated August 10, 2018 (the Decision) that granted the motions to the extent that the jury's verdict was reduced and a collateral source hearing was ordered to take place on October 3, 2018. After the issuance of the Decision, an error on the amount for future lost earnings was noted in the Decision. Additionally, after the Decision was rendered, the parties stipulated to a further reduction of future lost earnings, and the defendants agreed to withdraw the request for a collateral source hearing. A copy of the stipulation is annexed to this Decision and Order. As such, this court amends the Decision to correct the errors and to incorporate the parties' stipulation.

113802/2009 MCCULLOUGH, ROBERT vs. ONE BRYANT PARK

Page 1 of 3



Defendants One Bryant Park LLC and Tishman Construction Corp. are represented by the same counsel.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 367

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/19/2018

INDEX NO. 113802/2009

The Decision stated that at trial the jury returned a total award of \$3,960,455.52, itemized as follows:

• future medical expenses \$ 99,000

- lost earnings up to verdict date \$705,370
- future lost earnings to age 62 (now 53) \$1,000,000
- pain and suffering up to verdict date \$1,000,000
- future pain and suffering \$ 750,000

(NYSCEF Doc No. 361 - Decision and Order dated August 10, 2018).

The itemization did not include stipulated past medical expenses in the amount of \$33,409.52, even though the total award accounted for that amount. Another error was the amount listed for "future lost earnings to age 62 (now 53)". The court's decretal paragraph stated that the jury award for future lost earnings was \$1,058,000 for 27.3 years, and the court reduced the amount to 24.8 years. However, there was no dispute that the jury had reconsidered the amount for future lost earnings while they were still empaneled. The amount the jury awarded for future lost earnings was \$1,372,676.00 for a period of 10.3 years (Trial Tr., pp 779-781). The Decision shall be amended to reflect this amount.

As such, the court's prior decision and order dated August 10, 2018, is amended to reflect the correct itemization of the total award of \$3,960,455.52, as follows:

stipulated past medical expenses \$33,409.52
future medical expenses \$99,000
lost earnings up to verdict date \$705,370
future lost earnings to age 62 (now 53) \$1,372,676
pain and suffering up to verdict date \$1,000,000

In all other respects, the court adheres to the Decision.

future pain and suffering

Lastly, after the Decision, on October 29, 2018, the parties executed a stipulation that reflected an amendment of plaintiff's future lost earnings. The parties agreed to reduce the future lost earnings to age 62 (now 53) by \$81,674.59, making the total award for lost earnings \$1,291,001.41. Defendants also withdrew their request for a collateral source hearing. The stipulation is annexed to this amended decision and order.

\$ 750,000

Accordingly, pursuant to these corrections and the stipulation of the parties, the court's decision and order dated August 10, 2018, is hereby amended in that it is



FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 11/19/2018 11:20 AM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 367

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/19/2018

INDEX NO. 113802/2009

ORDERED that plaintiff is awarded a judgment after trial in the amount of \$3,878,780.93, itemized as follows:

stipulated past medical expenses
future medical expenses
lost earnings up to verdict date
stipulated future lost earnings
pain and suffering up to verdict date
future pain and suffering
\$ 1,291,001.41
pain and suffering
\$ 1,000,000
future pain and suffering
\$ 750,000

This constitutes the decision and order of the court.

11/15/2018			
DATE	-	MARGARET A. CHAN, J.S.C.	
CHECK ONE:	X CASE DISPOSED	NON-FINAL DISPOSITION	
	GRANTED X DENIED	GRANTED IN PART OTHER	
APPLICATION:	SETTLE ORDER	SUBMIT ORDER	
CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:	INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN	FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT REFERENCE	

113802/2009 MCCULLOUGH, ROBERT vs. ONE BRYANT PARK

Page 3 of 3

