

Filed on behalf of Symantec Corporation

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

VEEAM SOFTWARE CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

SYMANTEC CORPORATION
Patent Owner

Case IPR2013-00150
U.S. Patent No. 7,093,086

**SYMANTEC CORPORATION'S OPPOSITION TO VEEAM SOFTWARE
CORPORATION'S MOTION TO COMPEL THE DEPOSITION
OF VMWARE ON THE PUBLIC AVAILABILITY OF EXHIBIT 1005**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO SHOW THAT THE ESX MANUAL WAS PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE PRIOR TO THE ‘086 PATENT2

 A. Veeam’s Petition3

 B. Veeam’s Supplemental Evidence.....5

 C. The Evidence Suggests That The VMware ESX 1.0 Manual Was Not Publicly Accessible Prior To The ‘086 Patent8

II. THE VMWARE ESX 1.0 MANUAL IS CUMULATIVE OF THE VMWARE GSG REFERENCE11

III. THE GARMIN FACTORS13

IV. CONCLUSION.....15

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

CNET Networks, Inc. v. Etilize, Inc.,
584 F. Supp. 2d 1260 (N.D. Cal. 2008).....3

Garmin Int’l, Inc. et al. v. Cuozzo Speed Tech. LLC,
IPR2012-00001, No. 26 (Mar. 5, 2013).....13

In re Lister,
583 F.3d 1307 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....4

Mannesmann Demag Corp. v. Engineered Metal Products Co., Inc.,
605 F. Supp. 1362, 1366-67 (D. Del. 1985),
aff’d, 793 F.2d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....3

Neutrino Dev’t Corp. v. Sonosite Inc.,
337 F. Supp. 2d 942, 947 (S.D. Tex. 2004), *aft d*, 210 Fed. Appx. 991
(Fed. Cir. 2006)3

STATUTES AND RULES

35 U.S.C.A. § 311(b) (West)2, 4

35 U.S.C.A. § 316(a)(5) (West).....13

LIST OF EXHIBITS

<u>Exhibit No.</u>	<u>Document Description</u>
Symantec 2001	Office Action, dated April 11, 2005
Symantec 2002	Appeal Brief, dated July 19, 2005
Symantec 2003	Response to Office Action, dated November 14, 2005
Symantec 2004	Supplemental Notice of Allowability, dated July 6, 2016
Symantec 2005	<i>Symantec Corp. v. Veeam Software Corp.</i> , Civil Action No. 3:12cv700 (Dkt. 105), Claim Construction Order, dated March 8, 2013

Currently Filed

Symantec 2006	Patent Owner's Objections to Petitioner's Evidence Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1)
Symantec 2007	Declaration of Daniel Block, dated September 5, 2013
Symantec 2008	Patent Owner's Objections to Petitioner's Supplemental Evidence Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1)
Symantec 2009	Email requesting permission to file motion to amend, dated October 21, 2013
Symantec 2010	Internet Archive webpage titled "Download VMware Products" captured from VMware website, dated June 23, 2001
Symantec 2011	Internet Archive webpage titled "Download VMware Products" captured from VMware website, dated June 23, 2001
Symantec 2012	Internet Archive webpage titled "VMware Server Products Ordering Information" captured from VMware website, dated October 7, 2001

Symantec 2013 Internet Archive webpage titled “Evaluate VMware ESX
Servicer” captured from VMware website, dated June 8, 2001

Symantec 2014 *Garmin Int’l, Inc. et al. v. Cuozzo Speed Tech. LLC*, IPR2012-
00001, No. 26 (Mar. 5, 2013), Decision

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.