

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS, LLC,
Petitioner,

v.

SUPERNUS PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.
Patent Owner.

Case Numbers IPR2013-00368, IPR2013-00371 and IPR2013-00372
Patent Numbers 8,206,740, 8,394,405 and 8,394,406

Held: August 12, 2014

Before: LORA M. GREEN, SCOTT E. KAMHOLZ, and
GEORGIANNA WITT BRADEN, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

H. KEETO SABHARWAL, ESQUIRE
PAUL A. AINSWORTH, ESQUIRE
Sterne Kessler Goldstein Fox
1100 New York Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20005

1 ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

2 GERALD J. FLATTMAN JR., ESQUIRE

3 GREGORY A. MORRIS, ESQUIRE

4 Paul Hastings

5 75 East 55th Street

6 New York, New York

7 -and-

8 STEPHEN B. MAEBIUS, ESQUIRE

9 ANDREW S. BALUCH, ESQUIRE

10 Foley & Lardner, LLP

11 3000 K Street, NW

12 Washington, DC 20007-5109

13
14
15 The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday,
16 August 12, 2014, commencing at 1:00 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and
17 Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

18
19
20
21 P R O C E E D I N G S

22 - - - - -

23 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Can everyone in the room hear Judge
24 Braden? Judge Braden, would you speak again, please?

25 JUDGE BRADEN: Yes, I can. Can everyone in the room
26 hear me?

27 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: I think that will suffice.

28 Good afternoon. We will hear argument now in Case
29 Numbers IPR2013-00368, 00371, 00372, Amneal Pharmaceuticals,
30 LLC, versus Supernus Pharmaceuticals, Incorporated. Counsel for the

1 parties, would you please introduce yourselves, starting with the
2 Petitioner?

3 MR. SABHARWAL: Good afternoon, Your Honors. On
4 behalf of Amneal Pharmaceuticals, Keeto Sabharwal of the law firm
5 Sterne, Kessler, Goldstein and Fox.

6 MR. AINSWORTH: Good afternoon, Your Honor, Paul
7 Ainsworth, also with Sterne, Kessler, Goldstein and Fox.

8 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: And Patent Owner?

9 MR. FLATTMANN: Yes, Your Honor. I'm Gerald
10 Flattmann of the law firm of Paul Hastings for the patent holder,
11 Supernus.

12 MR. MORRIS: I'm Greg Morris, Your Honor, from the law
13 firm of Paul Hastings, also for Supernus.

14 MR. MAEBIUS: Also Steve Maebius of Foley and Lardner
15 on behalf of Supernus.

16 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Welcome, everyone, to the Board.

17 Per our order dated July 18, 204, each side will have one
18 hour to argue during this hearing. The Petitioner will argue first and
19 present all of its arguments concerning all cases and may reserve
20 rebuttal time. You should begin your presentation by indicating how
21 much time you will reserve, if any. The Patent Owner may not
22 reserve rebuttal time.

23 I will remind the parties that the Petitioner bears the burden
24 of proving any proposition of unpatentability by a preponderance of
25 the evidence. I will also remind the parties that this hearing is open to

1 the public and a full transcript of everything that is said will become
2 part of the public record.

3 Please bear in mind that the third member of this panel,
4 Judge Braden, is attending this hearing by telephone from our office
5 in Dallas. Please remember also to mention by number every slide as
6 you refer to it. This is especially important to ensure that Judge
7 Braden can follow the proceedings.

8 With that, I would like to invite Petitioner to begin.

9 MR. SABHARWAL: Thank you, Your Honors. Your
10 Honor, just a couple of preliminary matters. First of all can you hear
11 me? Does this work. Does that work? Hello?

12 **(Discussion off the record.)**

13 MR. SABHARWAL: I can speak loud.

14 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Why don't you do that. Someone is
15 coming, and we'll deal with it.

16 MR. SABHARWAL: Great, thank you. Just a couple
17 preliminary matters, Your Honors. First of all, with respect to the
18 time allocation, with the Board's permission, we would like to allocate
19 40 minutes for our opening presentation and then 20 minutes for
20 rebuttal.

21 Also, we have hard copies of our demonstratives, if the
22 Board would like that.

23 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Yes, please.

24 MR. SABHARWAL: Could you hand those out, please.

25 Excuse me.

1 **(Discussion off the record.)**

2 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Please proceed.

3 MR. SABHARWAL: Thank you. One other thing, Your
4 Honors, in terms of the allocation, I will be addressing the prima facie
5 and secondary consideration issues in part of our opening, and Mr.
6 Ainsworth will be discussing the alternative arguments, the
7 incorporation by reference, the antedation issue and CREATE Act
8 issue.

9 JUDGE KAMHOLZ: Thank you. Please make sure that
10 you speak up and into the microphone so Judge Braden can hear.

11 MR. SABHARWAL: All right. If for any reason you can't
12 hear me, please let me know.

13 JUDGE BRADEN: Thank you. It would be nice.

14 MR. SABHARWAL: Sure. Your Honors, on December 17
15 of 2013, this Board instituted the foregoing IPRs based upon the '932
16 Ashley reference as well as the Sheth reference.

17 In the ensuing eight months, Petitioner's case has been
18 strengthened based upon at least three principal reasons: Number 1,
19 the express disclosures of the '932 reference and the Sheth reference.
20 Your Honors, it doesn't matter what Mr. Flattmann or I say. The
21 references say what they say, and we believe that they strongly
22 demonstrate unpatentability of the alleged invention in this case.

23 Secondly, based upon deposition testimony as well as the
24 pleadings and other exhibits, the Patent Owner, Supernus, has failed
25 to demonstrate that any of the secondary considerations overcome our

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.