

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

TOSHIBA CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

INTELLECTUAL VENTURES, I, LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2014-00113
Patent No. 6,058,045

Held: November 6, 2014

Before KEVIN F. TURNER (via videoconference), TREVOR M. JEFFERSON, and DAVID C. McKONE (via videoconference),
Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Thursday, November 6, 2014, commencing at 10:02 a.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

Case No. IPR2014-00003 & IPR2014-005567
Patent 8,278,351

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

ALAN A. LIMBACH, ESQUIRE
HARPREET SINGH, ESQUIRE
DLA Piper, LLP (US)
2000 University Avenue
East Palo Alto, California 94303

ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

JON E. WRIGHT, ESQUIRE
CHRISTIAN A. CAMARCE, ESQUIRE
RAYMOND J. WERNER, ESQUIRE
Sterne Kessler Goldstein Fox
1100 New York Avenue
Washington, DC 20005

and

ANDREW G. HEINZ, ESQUIRE
Desmarais, LLP
230 Park Avenue
New York, New York 10169

and

DONALD COULMAN, ESQUIRE
Intellectual Ventures

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - - - -

JUDGE JEFFERSON: Good morning. I'm Judge
Jefferson and with us remotely are Judges McKone and Turner.

We're here for IPR 2014-00113, Toshiba Corporation V
Intellectual Ventures I, LLC.

I'll ask each attorney to stand, starting with the Petitioner,
and make your appearances and state who is with you.

MR. LIMBACH: Good morning. My name is Alan
Limbach, I'm with DLA Piper, I represent the Petitioner, Toshiba; and
with me is -- go ahead.

MR. SINGH: Hi, my name is Harpreet Singh,
representing Petitioner with DLA Piper.

JUDGE JEFFERSON: Thank you.

MR. WRIGHT: Good morning, Your Honors.
Jon Wright from Stern, Kessler, Goldstein and Fox
representing the Patent Owner, Intellectual Ventures I.

With my at counsel's table is Christian Camarce, also
from Stern, Kessler, and back-up counsel that are also present are
Raymond Werner from the Stern Kessler firm, Andy Heinz from the
Desmarais firm and Donald Coulman from Intellectual Ventures.

Thank you.

JUDGE JEFFERSON: Thank you.

1 Obviously per our Order Paper 24, the proceedings will
2 be transcribed by a court reporter. Please speak up or into the
3 microphone.

4 We also remind you that we have two remote Judges and
5 any demonstratives or exhibits you refer to please refer to by page
6 number or other identifying marks so that we can then have a clear
7 record of what's being referred to and the Judges can follow your
8 presentations.

9 Each side will have 60 minutes to present their argument.
10 As Petitioner bears the burden of proof, we'll start with Petitioner.
11 You should let us know at the outset if you're going to reserve any
12 time for rebuttal.

13 The Patent Owner will have 60 minutes to respond to the
14 issues presented.

15 Again, I'll note for the remote panel members, they will
16 be, they should be mic'ed and able to hear everything that's going on.
17 If you have trouble, if you do have trouble hearing or we have trouble
18 hearing, we can repeat the questions we have for you.

19 On, I'm, my recollection is that there were no objections
20 made to demonstratives or evidence that were filed with the Court.

21 Just reminding you that there are no speaking objections
22 here. You have your time period to make any objections or -- I'm
23 sorry, make any statements on the record that you want to make
24 regarding evidence.

1 And we'll get started, if there are no questions from either
2 party.

3 And our Judges can hear everything okay?

4 JUDGE McKONE: I can hear, Judge Jefferson.

5 If I cannot hear somebody at the podium, I will let you
6 know. And you can hear me okay?

7 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Certainly.

8 Judge Turner?

9 JUDGE TURNER: Yes, I can hear. I can't hear anybody
10 until you talk into the microphone, but I'm looking forward to that.

11 JUDGE JEFFERSON: And I'll remind then, again,
12 please everyone talk into the microphone, including me. And of
13 course if our court reporter couldn't hear, she will let us know, as well.

14 We'll get started with Petitioner. Will you please let me
15 know how much time you're going to reserve and you can continue?

16 MR. LIMBACH: Thank you, your Honors.

17 Can you hear me remotely?

18 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Why don't you adjust the mic
19 straight so it looks a little more directional, straight at you.

20 MR. LIMBACH: Okay. Great, so again, my name is
21 Alan Limbach, for Petitioner, Toshiba, and I'll reserve 25 minutes for
22 rebuttal.

23 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Okay. You may begin.

24 MR. LIMBACH: Okay. Thank you.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.