

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
Alexandria Division

REMBRANDT SOCIAL MEDIA, LP,)	
)	
)	Plaintiff,
v.)	CIVIL ACTION
)	
FACEBOOK, INCORPORATED, et al.,)	1:13-cv-158
)	
)	Defendant.
)	

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT

MOTIONS HEARING (Via Teleconference)

Thursday, June 6, 2013

BEFORE: THE HONORABLE T.S. ELLIS, III
Presiding

APPEARANCES: ROBERT HILLMAN, ESQ.
AHMED DAVIS, ESQ.
THOMAS MELSHEIMER, ESQ.
Fish & Richardson PC
1425 K St., NW, Suite 1100
Washington, DC 20005

For the Plaintiff

JONATHAN G. GRAVES, ESQ.
HEIDI KEEFE, ESQ.
MARK WEINSTEIN, ESQ.
Cooley, LLP
Reston Town Center, 11951 Freedom Drive
Reston, VA 20190-5656

For Defendant Facebook

MICHAEL A. RODRIQUEZ, RPR/CM/RMR
Official Court Reporter
USDC, Eastern District of Virginia
Alexandria Division

1 APPEARANCES (Cont'd):

2

3

STEPHEN P. MCBRIDE, ESQ.
Cooley, LLP
Reston Town Center, 11951 Freedom Drive
Reston, VA 20190-5656

5

For Defendant AddThis

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX

RULING BY THE COURT

5

(Court recessed)

PROCEEDINGS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(Court called to order at at 4:11 p.m.)

THE COURT: Hello. This is Judge Ellis.

The case is Rembrandt Social Media against Facebook and AddThis, 113-cv-158.

Who is on, on behalf of the plaintiff?

Who will be heard today?

ATTORNEY HILLMAN: Bob Hillman and Tom Melsheimer and Ahmed Davis.

THE COURT: All right. Mr. Hillman, when you speak, as you'll be the person speaking on behalf of Rembrandt, identify yourself, if you would, before you speak so that the reporter can properly attribute your remarks.

ATTORNEY HILLMAN: I will do so, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right. That was Mr. Hillman.

All right. Now, who is here on behalf of Facebook?

ATTORNEY GRAVES: Your Honor, this is Jonathan Graves from Cooley. And Heidi Keefe and Mark Weinstein are on the line from Palo Alto. And I believe Ms. Keefe will be the primary talker for Facebook today.

1 THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon,
2 Ms. Keefe. Again, when you speak, please identify
3 yourself in advance.

4 ATTORNEY KEEFE: This is Ms. Keefe. Thank
5 you, your Honor.

6 THE COURT: And for AddThis.

7 ATTORNEY MCBRIDE: Good afternoon, your
8 Honor. This is Steve McBride. Thank you.

9 THE COURT: All right.

10 MARKMAN RULINGS BY THE COURT

11 THE COURT: Now, first I want to thank you
12 for making yourselves available for this telephone call,
13 the purpose of which is for me to disclose the Markman
14 ruling. The briefs and arguments have been very
15 helpful, so I thank you for those as well.

16 I have heard many judges say, and it's
17 correct, that -- it's generally true that although --
18 although patent cases often involve a great deal of work
19 and are difficult for many judges, judges nonetheless
20 say that a saving grace in patent cases is the typical
21 high quality of the lawyers involved, and this case is
22 no exception to that. So I thank you.

23 Now, the reason I am doing this by telephone
24 is that I don't have the time to develop a timely
25 opinion. I'll have to delay the opinion till I have

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.