

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

MARVELL SEMICONDUCTOR, INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

INTELLECTUAL VENTURES I LLC,  
Patent Owner.

---

IPR2014-00548 (Patent 5,712,870)  
IPR2014-00552 (Patent 6,754,195)  
IPR2014-00553 (Patent 6,754,195)

---

Held: September 11, 2015

---

BEFORE: THOMAS L. GIANNETTI, JAMES A. TARTAL,  
and PATRICK M. BOUCHER, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Friday,  
September 15, 2015, commencing at 1:01 p.m., at the U.S. Patent  
and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

IPR2014-00548 (Patent 5,712,870)  
IPR2014-00552 (Patent 6,754,195)  
IPR2014-00553 (Patent 6,754,195)

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

W. KARL RENNER, ESQUIRE  
INDRANIL MUKERJI, ESQUIRE  
JOSEPH V. COLAIANNI, JR., ESQUIRE  
ADAM R. SHARTZER, ESQUIRE  
Fish & Richardson, PC  
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20005

ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

HERBERT D. HART III, ESQUIRE  
KIRK A. VANDER LEESE, ESQUIRE  
MICHAEL J. CARROZZA, ESQUIRE  
PETER McANDREWS, ESQUIRE  
McAndrews Held & Malloy Ltd.  
500 West Madison Street, 34th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60661



IPR2014-00548 (Patent 5,712,870)

IPR2014-00552 (Patent 6,754,195)

IPR2014-00553 (Patent 6,754,195)

1 MR. RENNER: And also, Your Honor, David Holt  
2 from our office.

3 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Okay. Mr. Renner, will you be  
4 presenting the argument?

5 MR. RENNER: Your Honor, Mr. Murkerji will be  
6 presenting for '870.

7 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Okay.

8 MR. RENNER: And we're joined also by Joseph  
9 Colaianni who will be presenting in the second matter, as well as  
10 Adam Shartzer.

11 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Okay. And you all have either  
12 been admitted or have pro hac petitions that have been granted,  
13 correct?

14 MR. RENNER: Yes, Your Honor.

15 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Okay. Thank you very much.  
16 And now for the Patent Owner, who is appearing today?

17 MR. HART: Good afternoon, Your Honors. My name  
18 is Herb Hart. I am lead counsel for Patent Owner, and with me  
19 today arguing the 548 case is backup counsel, Kirk Vander Leest,  
20 and arguing for the 552 and 553 proceedings are backup counsel,  
21 Michael Carrozza and Peter McAndrews.

22 MR. McANDREWS: Good afternoon, Your Honors.

23 MR. HART: And, Your Honor, in view of the  
24 allocation of time that's been provided, 90 minutes for each side,

IPR2014-00548 (Patent 5,712,870)

IPR2014-00552 (Patent 6,754,195)

IPR2014-00553 (Patent 6,754,195)

1 we would like to take 30 minutes for the 548 proceeding and we  
2 understand there will be a brief recess. And then when we  
3 resume, the argument for Patent Owner for 552 and 553 will be  
4 presented in two parts, the first part being the technical issues and  
5 those will be addressed by Mr. Carrozza and he'll take about 35 or  
6 40 minutes, and the remaining time will be Mr. McAndrews  
7 addressing the Section 103(c) issue that we have in the case.

8 And with regard to Mr. McAndrews' time, if the panel  
9 agrees, the parties have an understanding that because Patent  
10 Owner is the party with the burden of proof on the 103(c) issues  
11 that Mr. McAndrews would open and close on that issue and so  
12 he would like to reserve a few minutes of his time to do that.

13 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Okay. Is that -- go ahead.

14 MR. HART: Is that acceptable?

15 JUDGE GIANNETTI: Anything further on the  
16 schedule?

17 MR. HART: There's one last housekeeping item, Your  
18 Honor. As you know, there's been some third-party discovery in  
19 this case. And as a consequence of that, there are just a couple of  
20 documents that are subject to a protective order and so we just  
21 might inquire whether there's anyone in the room who is not  
22 subject to the obligations of the protective order.

23 JUDGE GIANNETTI: You can ask that. We're not  
24 going to clear the courtroom, though, Mr. Hart, but we'll have to

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.