

Filed on behalf of Securus Technologies, Inc.
By: Justin B. Kimble (jkimble@bcpc-law.com)
Jeffrey R. Bragalone (jbragalone@bcpc-law.com)
Bragalone Conroy P.C.
2200 Ross Ave.
Suite 4500 – West
Dallas, TX 75201
Tel: 214.785.6670
Fax: 214.786.6680

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

GLOBAL TEL*LINK CORPORATION

Petitioner

v.

SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES, INC.

Patent Owner

Case IPR2014-00785
U.S. Patent No. 6,636,591

EXHIBIT 2003: DECLARATION OF DR. ROBERT AKL

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450

Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 6,636,591

Declaration of Dr. Robert Akl

I, Robert Akl, do hereby declare and state, that all statements made herein of my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true; and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code.

Executed this 23rd day of December 2014 in Denton, TX.



Dr. Robert Akl, D.Sc.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
A. Engagement	1
B. Background and Qualifications	1
C. Compensation and Prior Expert Witness Experience	3
D. Information Considered.....	4
II. LEGAL STANDARDS.....	5
III. THE '591 PATENT.....	10
A. Effective Filing Date of the '591 Patent.....	10
B. Overview of the '591 Patent.....	10
C. Claim Construction.....	12
D. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art	14
IV. ANALYSIS OF GROUND 1: Claims 1-10 Under 103(a) Karacki in view of Gainsboro	14
A. Overview of Karacki	14
B. Overview of Gainsboro	16
C. Petitioner Failed as a Matter of Law to Meet its Burden of Proving Claims 1-10 Unpatentable by Failing to Show that One of Skill in the Art Would Have Reason to Combine Karacki and Gainsboro	16
D. Karacki in View of Gainsboro does not Teach or Suggest Many of the Limitations of the '591 Patent.	23
1. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “reducing the telephone call charge rate for inmates that meet the measurement of conduct”.....	24
2. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “establishing a discount telephone rate”	27
3. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “a predetermined period of time”	29
4. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “said measurement is a predetermined point total”	29
5. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “providing an identification for each inmate”	31

6. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “raising the rate when an inmate no longer meets the measurement of conduct during incarceration” (element [2.1])33

7. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “associating the reduced charge rate with at least one predetermined number” (element [9.4])33

8. The Combination of Karacki and Gainsboro Fails to Teach or Suggest the Element “reduced charge rate for said at least one predetermined destination number” (element [10.1])34

V. CONCLUSION34

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The facts set forth below are known to me personally and I have firsthand knowledge of them. I am a U.S. citizen over eighteen years of age. I am fully competent to testify as to the matters addressed in this Declaration. I understand that this Declaration is being submitted along with Patent Owner's response to the October 9, 2014 Decision on Institution of Inter Partes Review by the Patent Trial and Appeal Board ("PTAB") for US Patent No. 6,636,591 (hereinafter, "the '591 Patent") in IPR2014-00785.

A. Engagement

2. I have been retained as a technical expert by Patent Owner to study and provide my opinions on the technology claimed in, and the patentability or nonpatentability of, Claims 1-10 of the '591 patent.

B. Background and Qualifications

3. I have summarized in this section my educational background, work experience, and other relevant qualifications. A true and accurate copy of my curriculum vitae is attached as Appendix A.

4. I earned my Bachelor of Science degrees in Electrical Engineering and Computer Science summa cum laude with a ranking of first in my undergraduate class from Washington University in Saint Louis in 1994. In 1996 I earned my Master of Science degree in Electrical Engineering from Washington University in Saint Louis. I earned my Doctorate of Science in Electrical

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.