

Donald J. Cox, Jr.
DNJ Attorney ID: DC1284
Law Offices of Donald Cox, LLC
103 Carnegie Center, Suite 300
Princeton, NJ 08540
Tel: (609) 921-1166
Fax: (609) 921-8131
coxd@iplawonline.com
Attorneys for Defendants
Simon Nicholas Richmond and
Adventive Ideas, LLC

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT
CORPORATION

Civil Action No. 3:09-CV-02495-
GEB

Plaintiff,

v.

SIMON NICHOLAS RICHMOND AND
ADVENTIVE IDEAS, LLC

Defendants.

DECLARATION OF DR. ALFRED DUCHARME ON VALIDITY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION3

II. MATERIALS REVIEWED3

III. PROFESSIONAL BACKGROUND5

IV. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....7

V. THE FOUR SEASON SOLAR LIGHTS DO NOT ANTICIPATE THE
ASSERTED CLAIMS9

VI. THE FOUR SEASON SOLAR LIGHTS AND THE PIEPGRAS ‘358
PUBLICATION DO NOT RENDER ‘827 PATENT CLAIMS 30-31 AND 34
OBVIOUS UNDER THE REASONING IN THE LAURENT DECLARATION.19

VII. THE VARYING INTENSITY TAUGHT IN PIEPGRAS DOES NOT
RENDER ANY OF THE ASSERTED CLAIMS OBVIOUS.....23

 A. The Scope and Content of the Prior Art24

 1. The Four Season Solar Lights24

 2. The Piepgras ‘358 Publication25

 B. The Differences Between the Claimed Invention and the Prior Art29

 C. The Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art30

VIII. SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS41

IX. CONCLUSION.....53

I, Dr. Alfred Ducharme, hereby declare:

I. INTRODUCTION

1. I have been retained as an expert by the defendants in this litigation, Simon Nicholas Richmond and Adventive Ideas, LLC. (“Defendants”). In this declaration I provide my expert opinion on the validity of the patents asserted in the litigation.

2. I understand the litigation includes an allegation by Defendants that certain products of the plaintiff, International Development Corporation, infringe the claims of U.S. Patent Nos. 7,196,477 B2 (the “477 patent”) and U.S. Patent No. 7,429,827 B2 (the “827 patent”) to defendant Simon Nicholas Richmond. I understand that the defendants have asserted claims 1-9, 13-16, 20-22, and 26 of the ‘477 patent and claims 27-35 of the ‘827 patent (the “Asserted Claims”).

II. MATERIALS REVIEWED

3. I have reviewed the following materials in preparation for this declaration:
- U.S. Patent No. 7,196,477 B2 to Simon Nicholas Richmond (the “477 patent”).
 - U.S. Patent No. 7,429,827 B2 to Simon Nicholas Richmond (the “827 patent”).
 - WIPO publication 2003/026358 to Piepgras et al. (the “Piepgras ‘358 publication”).
 - U.S. Patent No. 7,064,498 (the “Dowling patent”).

- U.S. Patent No. 6,016,038 (the “Mueller patent”).
- U.S. Patent No. 5,062,028 (the “Frost patent”).
- U.S. Patent No. 7,497,588 (the “Browder patent”).
- The transcript of the November 4, 2010, *Markman* hearing in this litigation (“*Markman* Transcript”).
- The Court’s November 12, 2010, *Markman* Order (“*Markman* Order”) and *Markman* Opinion.
- Plaintiff’s Memorandum of Law in Support of its Partial Motion for Summary Judgment of Invalidity.
- The July 20, 2010, Declaration of Duane G. Laurent in Support of the Plaintiff International Development LLC’s opening *Markman* Brief (“Laurent *Markman* Declaration”)(Doc. 60-9).
- The December 10, 2010, Declaration of Duane G. Laurent in Support of the Plaintiff’s Motion for Partial Summary Judgment Based on Invalidity (“Laurent Declaration”).
- The December 10, 2010, Declaration of Zachary W. Hilton in Support of Plaintiff’s Motion for Summary Judgment of Invalidity and accompanying exhibits.
- The December 9, 2010, Declaration of Chi-Gon Chen and accompanying exhibits.

- The December 9, 2010, Declaration of John Browder and accompanying exhibits.
- The transcript of the Deposition of Simon Nicholas Richmond in this litigation.
- The transcript of the Deposition of John Browder in this litigation.
- The Declaration of Simon Nicholas Richmond In Response to Motion for Summary Judgment which will be submitted concurrently with this declaration (“Richmond Declaration”).
- The expert report of Dr. Frank D. Tinari, Ph.D dated December 21, 2010, entitled “An Appraisal of Economic Loss to Simon N. Richmond and Adventive Ideas, Inc.”
- Customer comments regarding the IDC “Spectrum” solar lights at issue, on the website “qvc.com”.
- Other documents in the prosecution of the ‘477 and ‘827 patents and other documents filed in this litigation.

III. PROFESSIONAL BACKGROUND

4. I am an expert in optical and electrical devices and an Associate Professor and Assistant Dean at the College of Engineering and Computer Science at the University of Central Florida. I have doctoral degree in Electrical Engineering with a specialization in Photonics, which is the study of the generation,

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.