

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

CORELOGIC, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

BOUNDARY SOLUTIONS, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2015-00226
Patent 7,499,946 B2

Before LYNNE E. PETTIGREW, PETER P. CHEN, and
RICHARD H. MARSCHALL, *Administrative Patent Judges.*

CHEN, *Administrative Patent Judge.*

FINAL WRITTEN DECISION
35 U.S.C. § 318(a) and 37 C.F.R. § 42.73

I. INTRODUCTION

CoreLogic, Inc. (“Petitioner”) filed a Corrected Petition requesting an *inter partes* review of claims 1–21 of U.S. Patent No. 7,499,946 (Ex. 1001, “the ’946 patent”). Paper 4 (“Pet.”). Boundary Solutions, Inc. (“Patent Owner”) filed a Preliminary Response. Paper 7 (“Prelim. Resp.”). On May 21, 2015, we instituted an *inter partes* review for the challenged claims on the grounds of unpatentability alleged in the Petition. Paper 8 (“Dec. to Inst.”).

After institution of trial, Patent Owner filed a Corrected Patent Owner Response (Paper 25, “PO Resp.”), to which Petitioner filed a Reply (Paper 37, “Pet. Reply”). Petitioner filed a Motion to Exclude Evidence (Paper 39 (“Mot. Excl.”), Patent Owner filed an Opposition to the Motion to Exclude, Paper 43, and Petitioner filed a Reply in support of its Motion to Exclude, Paper 44. An oral hearing was held on February 11, 2016, consolidated with the hearings in IPR2015-00219, IPR2015-00222, and IPR2015-00228. The transcript of the consolidated hearing has been entered into the record. Paper 49 (“Tr.”). On February 26, 2016, Patent Owner filed a disclaimer of claims 13 and 16–18. *See CoreLogic, Inc. v. Boundary Solutions, Inc.*, Case CBM 2016-00017, Ex. 2003.

The Board has statutory authority under 35 U.S.C. § 6(c). In this Final Written Decision, issued pursuant to 35 U.S.C. § 318(a) and 37 C.F.R. § 42.73, we determine Petitioner has shown by a preponderance of the

IPR2015-00226
Patent 7,499,946 B2

evidence that claims 1–12, 14, 15, and 19–21 of the '946 patent are unpatentable.

A. Related Proceedings

According to Petitioner, the '946 patent is involved in the district court case captioned *Boundary Solutions, Inc. v. CoreLogic, Inc.*, No. 5:14-cv-00761 (N.D. Cal.). Pet. 59. Patent Owner also has asserted related U.S. Patent No. 8,065,352 (“the '352 patent”) and U.S. Patent No. 7,092,957 (“the '957 patent”) in that proceeding. Pet. 59; Paper 6.

We instituted *inter partes* reviews of the '352 patent (IPR2015-00219, IPR2015-00222) and the '957 patent (IPR2015-00228). Petitions for covered business method patent review of the '957 patent, '946 patent, and '352 patent are pending in Cases CBM2015-00016, CBM2015-00017, and CBM2015-00018, respectively.

B. The '946 Patent

The subject matter of the challenged claims of the '946 patent relates generally to a Geographic Information System (“GIS”) and a National Online Parcel-Level Map Data Portal referred to as a “NPDP.” Ex. 1001, Title, Abstract, 1:13–22. The '946 patent states that “[p]arcel-level GIS is a mature technology” and adds that “[t]hrough hundreds of local governments have finished digitizing their parcel maps, a single national parcel map source (portal) does not exist. The National Online Parcel-Level Map Data Portal (NPDP) remedies this problem by providing the first national

repository of parcel data for use by all industry sectors.” *Id.* at 3:18, 1:17–22. In particular, the ’946 patent describes an interactive online method for users to retrieve geographic parcel maps and related data:

An end user, utilizing an assigned password, begins the NPDP process by logging on from a computer terminal to an intranet or internet start page of the NPDP, and enters the state, city, street and number of a desired address. The NPDP address database is searched for a matching tax record. If there is a match, the NPDP displays the road right-of-ways, all parcel boundaries within a select distance, the “exact” address location highlighted, the pertinent parcel polygon changing the color to a brighter or different color from surrounding parcels also displayed. In addition, a list of property record attributes such as owner, use code, assessed value and year constructed can be displayed for the selected parcel. Other displayed parcels can also be selected and their linked attributes viewed.

Id. at 1:57–2:3. Parcel-level information includes parcel boundaries and geocodes, which are linked using a parcel identifier to a non-graphic database containing property tax records. *Id.* at 1:52–56, 3:66–4:7, 8:1–12. Data from jurisdictions are normalized into a single standard format. *Id.* at 1:37–40, 7:19–54.

The ’946 patent describes retrieving a parcel-level map based on the address of a requested parcel. *Id.* at 1:57–60, 4:42–46. A jurisdictional lookup table is searched to identify, for example, the jurisdiction in which the requested parcel is located. *Id.* at 8:13–17. In particular:

The Jurisdiction Lookup Table (JLT) 102 is a single tabular file, developed and maintained by NPDP service provider. The JLT makes it possible for the state and jurisdiction values stated in an

address entry transaction to be used to determine the pertinent county in which it is located. Hence, by the table also containing the county's FIPS number, the appropriate county directory is automatically accessed for data retrieval purposes. In addition, the JLT is the source of the Metadata values assigned to the parcel map data of each jurisdiction within a county. Each JLT record contains the following fields: state, jurisdiction, county name, county FIPS number, accuracy, publication date, percent complete, ortho scale, ortho resolution, and update frequency.

Id. at 8:13–25. The non-graphic database for that jurisdiction is searched for a record matching the address, and the parcel identifier for that record is used to access a graphic database containing the selected parcel. *Id.* at 3:36–54. The selected parcel and surrounding parcels may be displayed, with the selected parcel shown as a highlighted polygon. *Id.* at 3:54–55; 4:51–53. The parcel's linked data (e.g., tax record) also may be displayed. *Id.* at 4:53–54.

Illustrative Claim

Claims 1–21 are the subject of the Petition, and claims 13 and 16–18 have since been disclaimed by Patent Owner. Claims 1 and 20 are independent. Claim 1 is reproduced as follows.

1. An interactive computer implemented method for retrieving geographic parcel boundary polygon maps and associated parcel attribute data linked to a non-graphic database, wherein the data is acquired electronically, comprising:

- a. activating a computer terminal;
- b. accessing an applications program for access to the data;

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.