Filed on behalf of: VirnetX Inc.

By:

Joseph E. Palys

Naveen Modi

Paul Hastings LLP Paul Hastings LLP 875 15th Street NW 875 15th Street NW

Washington, DC 20005 Washington, DC 20005

Telephone: (202) 551-1996 Telephone: (202) 551-1990 Facsimile: (202) 551-0496 Facsimile: (202) 551-0490

#### UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC., Petitioner

v.

VIRNETX INC. Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00866 Patent No. 8,458,341

# PATENT OWNER'S OBJECTIONS TO PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS



Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1), Patent Owner VirnetX Inc. submits the following objections to certain exhibits submitted by Apple Inc. ("Petitioner") in Case No. IPR2015-00866. Patent Owner's objections apply equally to Petitioner's reliance on these exhibits in any subsequently-filed documents. These objections are timely, having been served within ten business days of the Board's decision to institute a trial in this proceeding.

### Exhibits 1005, 1022, 1023, and 1043

Patent Owner objects to Exhibit 1005 under Rules 401-403 of the Federal Rules of Evidence to the extent that Exhibit 1005 contains testimony unrelated to the grounds of rejection on which the Board instituted *inter partes* review. *See*, *e.g.*, at least testimony relating to U.S. Patent Nos. 8,516,131 and 8,560,705, *Aventail*, *Brand*, and RFC 2543. Patent Owner similarly objects to Exhibits 1022, 1023, and 1043 under Rules 401-403 of the Federal Rules of Evidence because they contain testimony unrelated to the grounds of rejection on which the Board instituted *inter partes* review. Patent Owner further objects to Exhibits 1022, 1023, and 1043 under Rule 802 of the Federal Rules of Evidence because the testimony in these Exhibits constitutes inadmissible hearsay.

## Exhibits 1003, 1004, 1010-1041, 1043-1048, 1050, 1051, 1053, and 1054

Patent Owner objects to Exhibits 1003, 1004, 1010-1041, 1043-1048, 1050, 1051, 1053, and 1054 under Rules 401-403 of the Federal Rules of Evidence on



Case IPR2015-00866 Patent No. 8,458,341

the grounds that these exhibits contain evidence not relevant to issues in this proceeding because the evidence lacks a nexus to the grounds of rejection on which the Board has instituted *inter partes* review.

Exhibits 1002-1004, 1006, 1010-1041, 1043-1048, 1050, 1051, 1053, and 1054

Patent Owner objects to Exhibits 1002-1004, 1006, 1010-1041, 1043-1048, 1050, 1051, 1053, and 1054 under Rules 401-403 of the Federal Rules of Evidence because Petitioner never relied on these exhibits in the Petition.

Dated: October 15, 2015 Respectfully submitted,

/Joseph E. Palys/ Joseph E. Palys Registration No. 46,508

Counsel for VirnetX Inc.



Case IPR2015-00866 Patent 8,458,341

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 15th day of October 2015, a copy of the foregoing Patent Owner's Objections to Petitioner's Exhibits was served by electronic mail upon the following:

Counsel for Apple Inc.:

iprnotices@sidley.com Sidley Austin LLP 1501 K Street NW Washington, DC 20005

Dated: October 15, 2015 Respectfully submitted,

/Joseph E. Palys/
Joseph E. Palys
Registration No. 46,508

Counsel for VirnetX Inc.

