

trials@uspto.gov

IPR2016-00116, Paper No. 38

IPR2016-00161, Paper No. 42

IPR2016-00173, Paper No. 39

571-272-7822

February 24, 2017

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ALARM.COM INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

VIVINT, INC.,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-00116 (Patent 6,147,601)

Case IPR2016-00161 (Patent 6,462,654 B1)

Case IPR2016-00173 (Patent 6,535,123 B2)

Technology Center 2600

Oral Hearing Held: Tuesday, January 31, 2017

Before: MICHAEL R. ZECHE, JAMES B. ARPIN (via video link), and CHARLES J. BOUDREAU (via video link), Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, January 31, 2017, at 1:00 p.m., in Hearing Room B, taken at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

WILLIAM H. MANDIR, ESQ.

BRIAN K. SHELTON, ESQ.

Sughrue Mion PLLC

2100 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20037-3213

202-663-7959

RICHARD J. STARK, ESQ.

TINA-ANN V. SANKOORIKAL, ESQ.

MAX W. ABEND, ESQ.

MARC J. KHADPE, ESQ.

Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP

Worldwide Plaza

825 Eighth Avenue

New York, New York 10019-7475

212-474-1784

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

ROBERT GREENE STERNE, ESQ.

JASON D. EISENBERG, ESQ.

RYAN RICHARDSON, ESQ.

Sterne Kessler Goldstein Fox

1100 New York Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20005

202-371-2600

Case IPR2016-00116 (Patent 6,147,601)
Case IPR2016-00161 (Patent 6,462,654 B1)
Case IPR2016-00173 (Patent 6,535,123 B2)

P R O C E E D I N G S

(1:00 p.m.)

JUDGE ZECHER: Let's go on the record. This is an oral argument for three cases, Cases IPR2016-00116, IPR2016-00161 and IPR2016-00173.

As the parties are aware in our oral argument order, we've allotted two hours for this hearing. Each party was given an hour for their oral arguments, which they can divide accordingly, for the three cases, so we will give you flexibility in that regard.

As you can see, we are in Hearing Room B. We did our best to try to accommodate the parties to get Hearing Room A, but, unfortunately, due to another oral argument involving a large family, we were unable to do that today.

So to begin I think it is best if the parties introduce themselves. Let's start with the Petitioner, please.

MR. MANDIR: Good afternoon, Your Honors. William Mandir from Sughrue Mion in Washington, D.C. on behalf of the Petitioner, Alarm.com. With me from Sughrue also is Mr. Brian Shelton.

And we also have with us from the Cravath firm in New York City, Mr. Richard Stark, Teena Sankoorikal, Max

Case IPR2016-00116 (Patent 6,147,601)
Case IPR2016-00161 (Patent 6,462,654 B1)
Case IPR2016-00173 (Patent 6,535,123 B2)

1 Abend, and Marc Khadpe. Also from Alarm.com we have
2 Mr. Dan Ramos.

3 Thank you, Your Honor.

4 JUDGE ZECHER: Thank you. And for Patent
5 Owner?

6 MR. STERNE: Good morning, Your Honor. This
7 is Robert Sterne from Sterne Kessler representing the Patent
8 Owner, Vivint. And today I have with me Jason Eisenberg
9 from my firm, as well as Ryan Richardson.

10 We also have from the Patent Owner, Vivint, Paul
11 Evans and Sean Ricks from Salt Lake City, Utah.

12 JUDGE ZECHER: Thank you very much. Okay.
13 The Panel realizes there is significant overlap on the issues in
14 these cases. So, like I said, we're going to give you some
15 leeway in your presentation.

16 So, Petitioner, we will turn the floor over to you.
17 We don't know if you want to stick to an individual case or you
18 want to argue things together.

19 MS. SANKOORIKAL: Your Honor, we have copies
20 of our presentation. If I may approach?

21 JUDGE ZECHER: Certainly. Thank you.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.