trials@uspto.gov

IPR2016-00194, Paper No. 40 IPR2016-00219, Paper No. 37 February 28, 2017

571-272-7822

DOCKF

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

- - - - - -

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

- - - - - -

THE TORO COMPANY,

Petitioner,

v.

MTD PRODUCTS INC.,

Patent Owner.

- - - - - - -

Case IPR2016-00194 (Patent No. 8,011,458)

Case IPR2016-00219 (Patent No. 8,136,613)

Technology Center 3600 Oral Hearing Held: Tuesday, February 7, 2017

Before: WILLIAM V. SAINDON, RICHARD E. RICE, and TIMOTHY J. GOODSON (via video link), Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, February 7, 2017, at 1:02 p.m., in Hearing Room B, taken at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

APPEARANCES:

DOCKET

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

CYRUS A. MORTON, ESQ. DAVID A. PRANGE, ESQ. WILLIAM E. MANSKE, ESQ. Robins Kaplan LLP 800 LaSalle Avenue Suite 2800 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402 612-349-8500

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

JOHN S. CIPOLLA, ESQ. MARK W. McDOUGALL, ESQ. TRACY SCOTT JOHNSON, ESQ. Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP The Calfee Building 1405 East Sixth Street Cleveland, Ohio 44114-1607 216-622-8200

Case IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458) Case IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	(1:02 p.m.)
3	JUDGE SAINDON: We are here for an oral
4	argument for IPR2016-00194 and 219, involving The Toro
5	Company and MTD Products, Inc.
6	I'm Judge Saindon. With me here are Judges Rice
7	and Goodson. Judge Goodson is appearing remotely, as you
8	can see. He can only hear you if you are speaking into that
9	microphone at the podium so, please, whoever is up there,
10	please speak into the microphone. And as well he can't see
11	what is on the screen, so please refer to whatever you are
12	talking about both for the clarity of the record and so that
13	Judge Goodson can follow.
14	All right. We have provided 90 minutes per side
15	and we're going to do IPR2016-00194 first. We will hear
16	argument from both sides and then move on to the next one.
17	The hearing record will cover all cases at the same time so
18	there doesn't need to be overlap, but we will break it up just
19	for sake of the issues.
20	I would like to first do appearances. Let's start
21	with Patent Owner.
22	MR. CIPOLLA: John Cipolla

Case IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458) Case IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

1	JUDGE SAINDON: Please go up to the podium,
2	please.
3	MR. CIPOLLA: John Cipolla from Calfee, Halter
4	& Griswold arguing the 194 IPR.
5	JUDGE SAINDON: Petitioner?
6	MR. MORTON: Yes, Your Honor. Cy Morton of
7	Robins Kaplan. I will also be arguing the 194. Will Manske
8	and David Prange are with me also from my law firm.
9	JUDGE SAINDON: All right. Before we get
10	started I wanted to read off into the record the e-mail that I
11	sent to the two of you regarding the objections on the slides.
12	The parties' objections to the demonstratives in
13	IPR2016-00194 and 00298 are noted. All objections are
14	overruled and the parties may present the material on the
15	demonstratives during oral argument. This ruling is only
16	directed to whether the material may be presented at oral
17	argument and is not a ruling that any content discussed or cited
18	therein is proper for consideration when making our final
19	written decision.
20	The demonstratives submitted by the parties are
21	visual aides and neither argument nor evidence. The Panel will

4

read this e-mail into the record during the oral argument to

Case IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458) Case IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

1	provide a written record of our ruling.
2	All right. With that we may begin. Petitioner,
3	would you like to set aside some time for rebuttal ahead of
4	time? I will keep time on my end. The lights right there are
5	not operational so I will just provide you reminders.
6	MR. MORTON: Yes, Your Honor. I'm going to
7	shoot for about 40 minutes and 10 for my rebuttal.
8	JUDGE SAINDON: Okay.
9	MR. MORTON: I do have copies of our slides. If
10	that's helpful to Your Honors I can hand them up. If you don't
11	need them, that's fine.
12	Okay. I'm ready to begin.
13	JUDGE SAINDON: Yes, please.
14	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My
14 15	-
	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My
15	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My name is Cy Morton. I represent Petitioner Toro. The '458
15 16	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My name is Cy Morton. I represent Petitioner Toro. The '458 patent we are here to discuss today is directed to vehicles that
15 16 17	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My name is Cy Morton. I represent Petitioner Toro. The '458 patent we are here to discuss today is directed to vehicles that are propelled and steered using two rear hydrostatic drives.
15 16 17 18	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My name is Cy Morton. I represent Petitioner Toro. The '458 patent we are here to discuss today is directed to vehicles that are propelled and steered using two rear hydrostatic drives. This is known as differential steering and has been around for
15 16 17 18 19	MR. MORTON: May it please the Board. My name is Cy Morton. I represent Petitioner Toro. The '458 patent we are here to discuss today is directed to vehicles that are propelled and steered using two rear hydrostatic drives. This is known as differential steering and has been around for many decades.

DOCKET A L A R M



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.