Trials@uspto.gov Paper 21
Tel: 571-272-7822 Entered: December 14, 2016

## UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

\_\_\_\_\_

## BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

THE TORO COMPANY Petitioner,

v.

MTD PRODUCTS INC., Patent Owner.

\_\_\_\_\_

Cases
IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458)
IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

Before WILLIAM V. SAINDON, RICHARD E. RICE, and TIMOTHY J. GOODSON, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

SAINDON, Administrative Patent Judge.

ORDER Authorizing Sur-Reply and Sur-Sur-Reply 37 C.F.R. § 42.5



IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458) IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

On December 12, 2016, a conference call was held at the request of Patent Owner. Patent Owner requested the call to seek a sur-reply to Petitioner's Reply in each case, because it believed that the Replies introduced new theories on patentability and/or claim construction. After discussion with both parties, the panel authorized Patent Owner to file a Sur-Reply in each proceeding no later than December 19, 2016, of no more than 5 pages. Petitioner was authorized to file a Sur-Sur-Reply in each proceeding no later than December 26, 2016, of no more than 3 pages. Neither paper may introduce new evidence.

Patent Owner also objected to Petitioner's Reply on a theory that it improperly incorporated by reference material from a declaration. We will reserve our ruling on the objection.

It is so ORDERED.



IPR2016-00194 (Patent 8,011,458) IPR2016-00219 (Patent 8,136,613)

## PETITIONER:

Cyrus Morton cmorton@robinskaplan.com

Davis Prange <a href="mailto:dprange@robinskaplan.com">dprange@robinskaplan.com</a>

## PATENT OWNER:

John Cipolla jcipolla@calfee.com

Mark McDougall mmcdougall@calfee.com

Tracy Johnson tjohnson@calfee.com

