

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MICROSOFT CORPORATION,

Petitioner,

v.

BRADIUM TECHNOLOGIES LLC,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-00449
Patent 8,924,506 B2

Paper 31

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

February 10, 2017

TABLE OF CONTENTS

UPDATED EXHIBIT LIST	II
I. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	1
A. “Limited Bandwidth Communications Channel”	1
B. “Limited Communication Bandwidth Computer Device”	2
II. ALL CLAIM ELEMENTS ARE TAUGHT OR SUGGESTED BY REDDY IN VIEW OF HORNBACKER	3
A. “Limited Bandwidth” Elements	3
B. “Said processor operative to select said defined data parcel... and render said defined data parcel... for a progressive resolution enhancement”	6
C. “Queuing the update data parcels on the remote computer based on an importance of the update data parcel as determined by the remote computer”	8
D. Data Structure Arguments	9
III. A POSITA WOULD COMBINE REDDY AND HORNBACKER.....	16
A. Reddy and Hornbacker are Analogous art	16
B. Reddy Does not Teach Away from the Claimed Solutions	17
C. Reddy Encourages Use of its Teachings on a Device with Limited Bandwidth.....	18
D. Bradium Fails to Show that Reddy and Hornbacker are Incompatible	19
IV. NO SECONDARY INDICIA OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS	20
A. No Long-Felt Need.....	20
B. No Nexus and No Evidence of Praise, Licenses, or Commercial Success	22
1. Purported awards:	24
2. Purported Licenses and Funding Agreements:	24
3. Navi2Go:	25
4. 3DVU / Microsoft (Ex. 2013 at 2, Ex. 2015) preliminary discussions:	25
5. Conclusion regarding Secondary Considerations	26

TABLE OF CONTENTS

V.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	26
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	26

UPDATED EXHIBIT LIST

- Ex. 1001 U.S. Patent No. 7,908,343 B2 to Levanon et al. (“the 343 Patent”)
- Ex. 1002 U.S. Patent No. 8,924, 506 B2 to Levanon et al. (“the 506 Patent”)
- Ex. 1003 PCT Publication No. WO 99/41675 to Cecil V. Hornbacker, III (“Hornbacker”)
- Ex. 1004 Reddy *et al.*, “TerraVision II: Visualizing Massive Terrain Databases in VRML,” IEEE Computer Graphics and Applications March/April 1999, pp. 30-38 (“Reddy” with added paragraph numbers by Petitioner for ease of reference in the Petition)
- Ex. 1005 Declaration of Prof. William R. Michalson (“Michalson Decl.”) with Appendices
- Ex. 1006 EP1070290 to Cecil V. Hornbacker, III
- Ex. 1007 Printout of IEEE Explore citations to Reddy *et al.* (Ex. 1004)
- Ex. 1008 Printout of Google Scholar citations to Reddy *et al.* (Ex. 1004)
- Ex. 1009 Cover page and authenticating declaration of Reddy *et al.* (Ex. 1004) from British Library
- Ex. 1010 Cover page of Reddy *et al.* (Ex. 1004) from Linda Hall Library
- Ex. 1011 Proof of Service dated Jan. 12, 2015 in Case No. 15-cv-00031-RGA, *Bradium Technologies, LLC v. Microsoft Corp.*
- Ex. 1012 Affidavit of Matthew C. Bernstein in Support of Petitioner's Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission
- Ex. 1013 Affidavit of Evan S. Day in Support of Petitioner's Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission
- Ex. 1014 LinkedIn Page for Isaac Levanon

- Ex. 1015 IEEE 802.11a1999, Wikipedia, available at https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=IEEE_802.11a-1999&oldid=740398108
- Ex. 1016 Declaration of Prof. William R. Michalson in Support of Petitioner's Reply to Patent Owner's Response
- Ex. 1017 Declaration of Yonatan Lavi, with Exhibits A-F
- Ex. 1018 Deposition Transcript of Peggy Agouris, dated January 13, 2017
- Ex. 1019 Deposition Transcript of Isaac Levanon, dated January 18, 2017
- Ex. 1020 Fujitsu Technical Reference Guide, Stylistic 2300, Copyright 1998
- Ex. 1021 *Not Used in This Proceeding*
- Ex. 1022 The Universal Grid System, NGA Office of GEOINT Sciences, March 2007
- Ex. 1023 Wolford, B., FXT1: 3dfx Texture Compression, Last Updated September 14, 1999, available at <http://web.archive.org/web/20000114134331/http://www.combatsim.com/htm/sept99/3dfx-tc1.htm>
- Ex. 1024 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2008/0294332 A1 to Levanon et al.
- Ex. 1025 U.S. Patent No. 7,561,156 B2 to Levanon et al.
- Ex. 1026 Excerpt of Initial Claim Chart, *Bradium Techs. LLC v. Microsoft Corporation*, No. 15-cv-31-RGA (D. Del)
- Ex. 1027 Bing Maps Preview App for Windows in the Window Store, available at <http://web.archive.org/web/20140101045325/http://apps.microsoft.com/windows/en-us/app/bing-maps-preview/75ce2a6a-8a25-4916-83d0-19b8e7b60787>
- Ex. 1028 Windows 8 and 8.1 System Requirements, available at <https://support.microsoft.com/en-us/help/12660/windows-8-system-requirements>

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.