UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE ————— BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD ——————

PANTIES PLUS, INC., Petitioner,

v.

BRAGEL INTERNATIONAL, INC.,

Patent Owner

Case No. **IPR2017-00044**Patent No. **7,144,296**

PATENT OWNER'S OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE FILED APRIL 19, 2017



Patent Owner hereby files the following objections to Exhibits 3001 and 3002, filed by the Board on April 19, 2017, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §42.64.

Exhibit 3001: Patent Owner objects to Exhibit 3001 as irrelevant (FRE 401-403). Patent Owner respectfully submits that Exhibit 3001, which reflects the Federal Circuit's remand to the District Court in the two related litigation matters (Case No. 8:15-cv-01756-R-FFM and Case No. 2:15-cv-08364-R-FFM), does not address the merits of the District Court's findings of fact and conclusions of law, other than to hold that those findings of fact and conclusions of law were not sufficiently detailed to allow an appellate review of the grant of a preliminary injunction. *See* Ex. 3001 at 4-5.

Exhibit 3002: Patent owner objects to Exhibit 3002 as irrelevant (FRE 401-403). Patent Owner respectfully submits that Exhibit 3002 is a Federal Circuit decision relating to a distinct case, and is not relevant evidence to this matter.



DATED: April 26, 2017 Respectfully submitted, LEWIS ROCA ROTHGERBER CHRISTIE LLP

> By /Thomas J. Daly/ Thomas J. Daly Reg. No. 32,213

> > Lead Counsel for Petitioner Bragel International, Inc.



CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 26, 2017, a copy of this PATENT OWNER'S OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE FILED APRIL 19, 2017, was served via email on the following correspondence address of record for Petitioner, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e):

LEAD COUNSEL

Sergey Kolmykov (Reg. No. 47,713) Kroub, Silbersher & Kolmykov PLLC 305 Broadway 7th Fl. New York, NY 10007 Tel: (212) 323-7442

Email: skolmykov@kskiplaw.com

info@kskiplaw.com

BACK-UP COUNSEL

Gaston Kroub (Reg. No. 51,903) Kroub, Silbersher & Kolmykov PLLC 305 Broadway 7th Fl. New York, NY 10007 Tel: (212) 323-7442

Email: gkroub@kskiplaw.com

/Thomas J. Daly/

Thomas J. Daly Registration No. 32,213 Counsel for Patent Owner Bragel International, Inc.

