

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ALBAAD MASSUOT YITZHAK, LTD. AND ALBAAD USA, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

EDGEWELL PERSONAL CARE BRANDS, LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00694
Patent 6,432,075 B1

**PATENT OWNER PRELIMINARY RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107(a)**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	2
II. BACKGROUND	4
III. GROUND 1 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT KOCH ANTICIPATES ANY OF THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	12
A. The Petition Unfairly Second-Guesses the Previous Decision of the Office, Causing Inefficient Use of Resources for Both PTAB and the Patent Owner	13
B. The Petitioner Fails to Demonstrate a Reasonable Likelihood that Koch Teaches Claim Elements 1g and 1h, Claims 2 and 4, and Claim Elements 5f, 5h, and 5i	15
1. Reliance on Patent Drawings to Show Precision is Improper	16
2. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1g	17
3. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1h	24
a) The Petitioner Relies on Improper Measurements	26
b) The Petitioner Relies on Improper Assumption that All of Koch’s Petals Are Equal	28
4. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim 2	30
5. Koch Fails to Disclose Claims 3 and 4	32
6. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim Element 5f	35
7. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim Element 5h	38
8. Koch Fails to Disclose Claim Element 5i	38
IV. GROUND 2 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT KOCH RENDERS CLAIM 6 OBVIOUS	39
V. GROUND 3 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT BALZAR ANTICIPATES CLAIMS 1-3 AND 6	40
A. Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1a	40
B. Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1g	41
C. Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1h	45

Patent Owner Preliminary Response

D.	Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim 2	47
E.	Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim 3	48
F.	Balzar Fails to Disclose Claim Elements 6g and 6h	48
VI.	GROUND 4 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT BALZAR AND KOCH RENDER CLAIM 4 AND 5 OBVIOUS	49
A.	Balzar and Koch Fail to Render Obvious Dependent Claim 4	49
1.	Adding Koch to Balzar Still Does Not Teach All the Elements of Dependent Claim 4	49
2.	The Petition Fails to Provide a Motivation for Combining Balzar and Koch to Invalidate Claim 4.....	50
B.	Balzar and Koch Fail to Render Obvious Claim 5.....	52
1.	Balzar and Koch Fail to Disclose the Elements of Claim 5	52
2.	The Petitioner Fails to State a Motivation for Combining Balzar and Koch to Develop Its Positions on Claim 5	53
VII.	GROUND 5 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT LOYER ANTICIPATES CLAIMS 1, 2, 3, AND 6	54
A.	The Petitioner Improperly Relies on Hand-Measurements of Loyer’s Non-Scaled Patent Drawings.....	54
B.	Loyer Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1g	55
C.	The Petitioner’s Analysis of Claim Element 1h is Also Flawed	58
D.	Loyer Fails to Disclose the Elements of Dependent Claim 2	61
E.	Loyer Fails to Disclose the Elements of Dependent Claim 3	62
F.	Loyer Fails to Disclose Claim Elements 6g and 6h.....	62
VIII.	GROUND 6 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT LOYER AND KOCH RENDER CLAIM 4 AND 5 OBVIOUS	63
A.	Loyer and Koch Fail to Render Claim 4 Obvious	63
B.	Loyer and Koch Fail to Render Claim 5 Obvious	64
IX.	GROUND 7 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT BERGER ANTICIPATES CLAIM ELEMENTS 1, 2, 3 and 6.....	66

Patent Owner Preliminary Response

- A. The Petitioner Improperly Relies on Hand-Measurements of Berger’s Patent Drawings to Dimensions, While Ignoring Berger’s Actual Teaching of Dimensions66
- B. Not Only Does Berger Fails to Disclose Claim Element 1g, but the Petitioner Uses the Wrong Dimension for Axial Length “B”67
- C. In Addition to Berger Not Teaching Claim Element 1h, the Petitioner Substitutes the Wrong Measurement for “L” from Berger’s FIG69
- D. Berger Fails to Disclose Dependent Claim 271
- E. Berger Fails to Disclose Dependent Claim 371
- F. Berger Fails to Disclose Claim Elements 6g and 6h.....72

- X. GROUND 8 – THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT BERGER AND KOCH RENDER CLAIM 4 AND 5 OBVIOUS72
 - A. Berger and Koch Fail to Render Dependent Claim 4 Obvious.....72
 - B. Berger and Koch Cannot Render Claim 5 Obvious74

- XI. THE BOARD SHOULD NOT INSTITUTE *INTER PARTES* REVIEW76

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
FEDERAL CASES	
<i>Avaya Inc., Dell Inc., Sony Corp. of Am., and Hewlett-Packard Co. v. Network-1 Sec. Sols. Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00071	68
<i>Ex parte LeMay</i> , 2008 2008 Pat. App. LEXIS 6774 (BPAI Sep. 24, 2008).....	63, 73
<i>Hockerson-Halberstadt, Inc. v. Avia Group Int'l</i> , 222 F.3d 951 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	16
<i>In re Chitayat</i> , 408 F.2d 475 (CCPA 1969).....	16
<i>In re Magnum Oil Tools Int'l, Ltd.</i> , 829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	passim
<i>In re Wilson</i> , 312 F.2d 449 (CCPA 1963).....	17, 22
<i>In re Wright</i> , 569 F.2d 1124 (CCPA 1977)	16
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007)	39, 51, 63
<i>Nu Mark LLC v. Fontem Holdings I, B.V.</i> , IPR2016-01309	13
<i>Nystrom v. TREX Co, Inc.</i> , 424 F.3d 1136 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	passim
FEDERAL STATUTES	
35 U.S.C. § 325(d).....	13, 15
U.S.C. § 314(a).....	13

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.