

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTEL CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

R2 SEMICONDUCTOR, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Cases:

IPR2017-00705, IPR2017-00706, IPR2017-00707,
IPR2017-00708, IPR2017-01123, and IPR2017-01124
Patent 8,233,250 B2

Record of Oral Hearing
Held: May 1, 2018

Before JAMESON LEE, JEAN R. HOMERE, and JENNIFER S. BISK,
Administrative Patent Judge.

IPR2017-00705, IPR2017-00706, IPR2017-00707,
IPR2017-00708, IPR2017-01123, and IPR2017-01124
Patent 8,233,250 B2

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

MICHAEL J. SUMMERSGILL, ESQUIRE
DONALD R. STEINBERG, ESQUIRE
JOSHUA STERN, ESQUIRE
RICHARD GOLDENBERG, ESQUIRE
WilmerHale
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

IMAN LORDOOEI, ESQUIRE
JAMES M. GLASS, ESQUIRE
LANCE YANG, ESQUIRE
Quinn Emanuel Trial Attorneys
50 California Street
22nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111

and

Mashood Rassam, Intel Corporation
Tony Baca, HP
David Fisher, CEO, R2 Semiconductor, Inc.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing Tuesday, May 1, 2018,
commencing at 12:59 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600
Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

IPR2017-00705, IPR2017-00706, IPR2017-00707,
IPR2017-00708, IPR2017-01123, and IPR2017-01124
Patent 8,233,250 B2

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - - - -

JUDGE BISK: Good afternoon. This is a trial hearing for six cases, IPR2017-00705, 706, 707, 708, 1123 and 1124, between Petitioner, Intel Corporation, and the owner of U.S. Patent 8,233,250, R2 Semiconductor, Inc.

I have a few administrative matters before we begin. And just as a reminder, if you're using demonstratives, please describe any slides you present by number. This will make the transcript easier to read.

And as you know, per order, each party has 90 minutes to present their argument. Because Petitioner has the burden to show unpatentability on the challenged claims and the proposed amended claims, Petitioner will proceed first, followed by Patent Owner. Petitioner may reserve rebuttal time, but may only use its time to rebut Patent Owner's arguments.

One other thing is that we have looked at both parties' motions to exclude. Preliminarily, we find most of the objections are lacking in merit.

Authentication, for example, is a very low bar, and both parties appear to use the motions to exclude to improperly supplement the briefing on the merits. So we don't want to hear any arguments today about these motions to exclude, and although we are not making a definitive ruling today, we are inclined to deny both in their entirety, both sides in all six cases.

So the parties are ordered to meet and confer on these motions,

IPR2017-00705, IPR2017-00706, IPR2017-00707,
IPR2017-00708, IPR2017-01123, and IPR2017-01124
Patent 8,233,250 B2

1 and in five days we would like the parties to file a joint notice declaring
2 which, if any, of the objections included in the motions to exclude they
3 would like us to continue to consider.

4 Okay. At this time we'd like Counsel to introduce yourselves
5 and who you have with you, beginning with Petitioner.

6 MR. SUMMERSGILL: Good afternoon, Your Honors,
7 Michael Summersgill on behalf of Intel, the Petitioner. And joining me at
8 counsel table is Mr. Don Steinberg and Josh Stern, and Richard Goldenberg
9 is lead counsel. We also have Mashhood Rassam and Tony Baca of Intel
10 and HP respectively.

11 JUDGE BISK: Okay.

12 MR. SUMMERSGILL: Thank you.

13 JUDGE BISK: Thank you.

14 And Patent Owner?

15 MR. GLASS: Good afternoon, Your Honors, my name is Jim
16 Glass for Patent Owner. With me today at counsel table is Mr. Iman
17 Lordgooei. Mr. Lordgooei will be presenting on behalf of PO today. Also
18 with me is Mr. Lance Yang.

19 Behind me is Mr. David Fisher, who is the CEO and founder of
20 Patent Owner, R2.

21 JUDGE BISK: Okay, thank you very much. Petitioner, would
22 you like to reserve time for rebuttal, and how much?

23 MR. SUMMERSGILL: We would, Your Honor, we'd like to
24 reserve 30 minutes, please.

25 JUDGE BISK: Thirty minutes, okay.

IPR2017-00705, IPR2017-00706, IPR2017-00707,
IPR2017-00708, IPR2017-01123, and IPR2017-01124
Patent 8,233,250 B2

1 MR. SUMMERSGILL: Thank you.

2 JUDGE BISK: All right. I will try to keep time. I'm not very
3 good at the timer itself, so I'm just going to use the clock, and I'll try to
4 remind you as you get close to any -- the end of your time.

5 MR. SUMMERSGILL: And, Your Honor, I was going to
6 argue the petitions and Mr. Steinberg the motions to amend. We were
7 roughly going to try and split our --

8 JUDGE BISK: Okay.

9 MR. SUMMERSGILL: -- hour by 30 or I may take 35
10 minutes.

11 JUDGE BISK: Okay, I'll try to remind you when you're
12 halfway through the 60 minutes.

13 MR. SUMMERSGILL: Great, thank you.

14 JUDGE BISK: Okay, whenever you're ready.

15 MR. SUMMERSGILL: Thank you, Your Honors. As I said,
16 I'll be handling the petition arguments and Mr. Steinberg will be handling
17 the motions to amend.

18 We would respectively submit that the evidence across the six
19 petitions demonstrates that each of the claims of the '250 Patent are invalid
20 on two separate grounds; one, based on the Shekhawat reference, the
21 Shekhawat primary reference, and second based on the Hibino primary
22 reference.

23 So the '250 Patent claims, as Your Honors know, claim a
24 voltage regulator with voltage spike protection circuitry, also known as
25 snubber circuitry, and there's no dispute that all of those components were

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.