

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

SONY CORPORATION,  
Petitioner,

v.

COLLABO INNOVATIONS, INC.,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2017-00958 (Patent 7,023,034 B2)

Case IPR2017-00960 (Patent 7,023,034 B2)

---

Record of Oral Hearing  
Held: May 9, 2018

---

Before DAVID C. McKONE, GREGG I. ANDERSON, and JENNIFER  
MEYER CHAGNON, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Case IPR2017-00958 (Patent 7,023,034 B2)

Case IPR2017-00960 (Patent 7,023,034 B2)

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

MATTHEW A. SMITH, ESQUIRE

Smith Baluch, LLP

100 M Street, S.E.

Suite 600

Washington, D.C. 20003

ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

TERRY A. SAAD, ESQUIRE

Bragalone Conroy, P.C.

2200 Ross Avenue

Suite 4500W

Dallas, Texas 75201-7924

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Wednesday, May 9, 2018, commencing at 1:00 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 - - - - -

2 JUDGE ANDERSON: If you are not already seated, hopefully let  
3 me just make it clear you can be seated. And welcome. This is the hearing  
4 for IPR2017-00958 and 960. Petitioner is Sony Corporation. Patent owner  
5 is Collabo Innovations, Inc., the owner of U.S. patent number 7,023,034,  
6 which is the challenged patent in both of the IPR proceedings.

7 I am obviously joining you remotely. Judge McKone is on the  
8 other screen there in the hearing room joining you remotely as well. Judge  
9 Chagnon is there with you in person. Because Judge McKone and I are  
10 remote, any demonstratives that you decide to use need to be described by  
11 slide number so that both of us can follow along.

12 Per our order, each party is going to have 60 minutes to present its  
13 arguments for both proceedings. You are not required to take all of the time.  
14 Let me repeat that. You are not required to take all of the time. Because  
15 petitioner has the burden to show unpatentability of the original claims,  
16 petitioner will proceed first followed by patent owner, who will, during that  
17 time, address its motion to exclude in both cases. Petitioner may reserve  
18 time to rebut patent owner's opposition and the motion to exclude. And if  
19 the patent owner desires to, it may reserve some time to rebut petitioner's  
20 opposition to its motion to exclude.

21 For the record, we have a recent Supreme Court case, *SAS versus*  
22 *Iancu*. These particular cases, we instituted on all grounds on all claims, so  
23 we have no need to do anything additional to comply with that Supreme  
24 Court decision which happened about a little over a week ago.

1           Also, any objection to argument presented by the opposing party  
2 shall be made during the time set aside for the objecting party's argument.  
3 In other words, we don't want interruptions to the arguments. People should  
4 understand that we have experienced judges here. We can sort through this  
5 at such time as you make the point, which can be during the presentation of  
6 the party that has the objection.

7           At this time, let me have the counsel make their entry of  
8 appearances. First for petitioner, please.

9           MR. SMITH: Thank you, Your Honor. This is Matthew Smith,  
10 Smith Baluch, LLP, for the petitioner, Sony Corporation.

11           JUDGE ANDERSON: Can you say that again. I did not get that.

12           MR. SMITH: Yes. Matthew Smith.

13           JUDGE ANDERSON: Okay, Mr. Smith. Thank you. And for  
14 patent owner?

15           MR. SAAD: Yes, Your Honor. Terry Saad on behalf of the patent  
16 owner.

17           JUDGE ANDERSON: Thank you, counsel. We did receive some  
18 demonstratives from the patent owner. We didn't receive any objections.  
19 We assume that the petitioner has no objection to those. Is that true,  
20 Mr. Smith?

21           MR. SMITH: Yes, Your Honor, we have no objection to the  
22 demonstratives.

23           JUDGE ANDERSON: And on the same subject of  
24 demonstratives, we did not receive any demonstratives from petitioner. So  
25 we assume you are going to make your presentation without any, right?

1 MR. SMITH: That is correct. There are no petitioner  
2 demonstratives, Your Honor. We may refer to portions of the record that  
3 have already been filed.

4 JUDGE ANDERSON: I'm sorry, what was that? You need to be  
5 closer to a microphone. I don't know whether Judge McKone is having a  
6 problem, but I'm having a hard time hearing you.

7 MR. SMITH: Can you hear me from the podium microphone?

8 JUDGE ANDERSON: Pull it closer up, Mr. Smith.

9 MR. SMITH: Can you hear me now?

10 JUDGE McKONE: I don't think the microphone is on.

11 MR. SMITH: So to be clear, petitioner has no demonstratives of  
12 their own. We may show portions of the record that have already been filed  
13 or patent owner's demonstratives, but none of our own.

14 JUDGE ANDERSON: Okay. Well, remember, Judge McKone  
15 and I are going to have a hard time seeing any of that. So you are going to  
16 need to be particularly scintillating with your discussion here today.

17 Okay. So do you want to reserve any rebuttal time, Mr. Smith?

18 MR. SMITH: Yes, Your Honor, could I reserve a half hour,  
19 please.

20 JUDGE ANDERSON: Okay. You can do that. And I should say  
21 since how Judge Chagnon is there, she's going to keep track of the time for  
22 us. And with that, Mr. Smith, you may begin your presentation right now.  
23 Thank you.

24 MR. SMITH: Thank you, Judge Anderson, and members of the  
25 Board. I will be very clear as to what we are talking about, which exhibits,  
26 when. We are pulling up right now the patent owner's demonstrative slide,

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.