

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

STINGRAY DIGITAL GROUP INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MUSIC CHOICE,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00888 (Patent 7,320,025 B1)
Case IPR2017-01191 (Patent 9,351,045 B1)

Record of Oral Hearing
Held: June 19, 2018

Before MITCHELL G. WEATHERLY, GREGG I. ANDERSON, and
JOHN F. HORVATH, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Case IPR2017-00888 (Patent 7,320,025 B1)

Case IPR2017-01191 (Patent 9,351,045 B1)

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

JOSHUA A. RASKIN, ESQUIRE
ALLAN A. KASSENOFF, ESQUIRE
Greenberg Traurig
MetLife Building
200 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10166

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

ROBERT W. ASHBROOK, JR., ESQUIRE
MARTIN J. BLACK, ESQUIRE
Dechert LLP
Cira Centre
2929 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, June 19, 2018, commencing at 1:30 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

P R O C E E D I N G S

1

- - - - -

2

JUDGE WEATHERLY: So this is a hearing for two

3

proceedings, IPR 2017-00888, relating to U.S. Patent 7,320,025, and IPR

4

2017-01191, which is relating to U.S. Patent 9,351,045.

5

The Petitioner is Stingray Digital Group Inc. and the Patent

6

Owner is Music Choice.

7

I am Judge Weatherly and I'm joined today by my colleagues

8

Judges Anderson and Horvath remotely, joined remotely that is. The camera

9

that they see you through is above my head. So it might make them feel a

10

little more warm and fuzzy if you look at the camera when you are speaking

11

to one of them. Also, during the hearing if you are using your slides it really

12

helps them, the remote judges in particular, follow the presentation if you

13

tell us what slide you are on. That also makes the record much easier for us

14

to use later. So I would ask that you do that.

15

Pursuant to our Hearing Order, each party is going to have one

16

hour to present its argument today for the two proceedings combined. The

17

Petitioner will go first, since it has the burden of persuasion, and the Patent

18

Owner will go second. Petitioner, you may reserve time if you wish to rebut

19

arguments that the Patent Owner advances in their presentation. I'm not

20

sure how, if the parties have discussed it or whether they have any

21

preferences about whether we address both cases serially or I should say all

22

at one time, or we split it up and kind of divide the hearing. Has there been

23

any discussion about that?

24

MR. RASKIN: There hasn't, Your Honor, only to the extent

25

that we both assumed that we would address both IPRs first.

26

JUDGE WEATHERLY: Then that's fine.

1 MR. RASKIN: And we're happy to do it that way.

2 JUDGE WEATHERLY: No, I don't have any preferences.

3 MR. ASHBROOK: We're fine with that, Your Honor.

4 JUDGE WEATHERLY: All right, great. However the parties
5 want to do it is fine with me. So I understand, Petitioner, that you'll present
6 the case for both IPRs at one time. There will be a response, and then a
7 rebuttal for both cases, yes?

8 MR. RASKIN: Yes.

9 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Okay. Fantastic. So before we start,
10 I'd like each side to introduce themselves. We'll begin with Petitioner. And
11 please introduce people who you've brought with you also.

12 MR. RASKIN: Sure. My name is Josh Raskin from the law
13 firm of Greenberg Traurig. I represent the Petitioner Stingray Digital. And
14 with me today are Allan Kassenoff, he will be speaking on the second IPR;
15 and --

16 JUDGE ANDERSON: Yeah, counsel, you might check your
17 microphone. I'm not getting any noise here.

18 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Sometimes the power button on the
19 base of the microphone, it should be glowing green.

20 MR. RASKIN: Is this better?

21 JUDGE ANDERSON: Much.

22 MR. RASKIN: Okay, great. I'll start again.

23 JUDGE WEATHERLY: And Judge Anderson, we can't really
24 see you. We can only see your left shoulder. Maybe that's intentional.

25 JUDGE ANDERSON: Well, I don't know, let's see. My left
26 shoulder --

1 JUDGE WEATHERLY: At least I think --

2 JUDGE ANDERSON: You can't see my --

3 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Now we can.

4 MR. RASKIN: We can see you now.

5 JUDGE WEATHERLY: We've got you now.

6 JUDGE ANDERSON: Okay.

7 JUDGE WEATHERLY: All right.

8 MR. RASKIN: Okay. I'll start again. Good afternoon. My
9 name is Josh Raskin from Greenberg Traurig and I represent the Petitioner
10 Stingray. I'll be speaking as to the first IPR, the one ending in 088. With
11 me are my colleagues Allan Kassenoff, he will speaking as to the other IPR;
12 and then also with us is (indiscernible).

13 MR. ASHBROOK: Your Honors, my name is Robert Ashbrook
14 from the Dechert Law Firm. I'm representing the Patent Owner Music
15 Choice. With me is my colleague Martin Black and I'm very pleased to say
16 that from Music Choice is Paula Calhoun and Karen Raybrook (phonetic).

17 JUDGE WEATHERLY: All right. Great. Thank you very
18 much for the introductions. Mr. Ashbrook, who is going to be making the
19 presentation for the Patent Owner?

20 MR. ASHBROOK: Your Honor, I will primarily speak. There
21 may be a few points where Mr. Black may want to speak as well.

22 JUDGE WEATHERLY: All right. Fantastic. Okay. So all
23 right. So Petitioner, whenever you are ready. How much time would you
24 like to reserve?

25 MR. RASKIN: We'd like to reserve a total of 20 minutes.

26 JUDGE WEATHERLY: All right.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.