

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

WESTINGHOUSE AIR BRAKE TECHNOLOGIES CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

SIEMENS INDUSTRY, INC.
Patent Owner

CASE: IPR2017-01270
U.S. PATENT NO. 7,236,860

PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW

Mail Stop *Patent Board*
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Mandatory Notices (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)).....	vi
A. Real Parties-In-Interest (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1)).....	vi
B. Related Matters (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2))	vi
C. Lead and Backup Counsel and Service (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3)-(4)).....	vii
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. TECHNOLOGY OF THE ‘860 PATENT	1
A. Overview of PTC and Grade Crossings.....	1
B. ‘860 Patent Overview	5
C. Prosecution History of the ‘860 Patent.....	5
III. GROUNDS FOR STANDING (37 C.F.R. § 42.104(A)).....	6
IV. PAYMENT OF FEES (37 C.F.R. §§ 42.15 AND 42.103).....	7
V. PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	7
VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	7
A. Configurable Device	8
B. Transmitting...to a configurable device	9
VII. STATEMENT OF THE PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED AND THE REASONS THEREFORE (37 C.F.R. § 42.22(a) AND 42.104(b)).....	10
A. Statement Regarding Non-Redundancy.....	11
B. Overview of the Prior Art	12
1. Petit	12
2. Blesener.....	15
3. RSAC	18
C. Ground 1: Challenged Claims are Unpatentable Under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as Obvious Over <i>Petit</i> and <i>Blesener</i>	24
1. Motivation to Combine.....	25
2. The Challenged Claims are Obvious	31
a. Independent Claim 1	31
b. Dependent Claims 3, 5, 7 and 10	41

c. Independent Claim 15	45
d. Dependent Claims 16, 18, 20, 25	47
D. Ground 2: Challenged Claims are Unpatentable Under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as Obvious Over <i>RSAC</i> and <i>Blesener</i>	48
1. Motivation to Combine	48
2. The Challenged Claims are Obvious	52
a. Independent Claim 1	52
b. Dependent Claims 3, 5, 7 and 10	59
c. Independent Claim 15	61
d. Dependent Claims 16, 18, 20, 25	63
E. Ground 3: Challenged Claims are Unpatentable Under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as Obvious Over <i>RSAC</i> , <i>Petit</i> and <i>Blesener</i>	64
1. Motivation to Combine	65
2. Challenged Claims	66
VIII. CONCLUSION	67
CLAIM APPENDIX OF THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	68

List of Exhibits

- Ex. 1001 U.S. Patent No. 7,236,860 (the “‘860 Patent”), filed November 18, 2005, issued June 26, 2007.
- Ex. 1002 Declaration of Steven R. Ditmeyer.
- Ex. 1003 *Curriculum vitae* of Steven R. Ditmeyer.
- Ex. 1004: Prosecution History of the ‘860 Patent.
- Ex. 1005: Report of the Railroad Safety Advisory Committee to the Federal Railroad Administrator, *Implementation of Positive Train Control Systems* (August 1999) (“RSAC”).
- Ex. 1006: Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 6,996,461 (the “‘461 Patent”).
- Ex. 1007: PCT Publication No. WO 02/091013 to Blesener et al. (“Blesener”).
- Ex. 1008: U.S. Patent No. 5,092,544 to Petit et al. (“Petit”).
- Ex. 1009: Federal Railroad Administration, Railroad Communications and Train Control Report to Congress (July 1994) (“FRA report”).
- Ex. 1010: ARES Operators Manual, Rockwell Int’l, Operators Manual for Advanced R.R. Elecs. Sys. For Burlington Northern R.R., (June 1, 1987).
- Ex. 1011: *Pulse Electronics Prepares for Move to German Town*, June 11, 1997
- Ex. 1012: Safety Analysis of ARES, William W. Weinstein et al. (October 1987).

- Ex. 1013: U.S. Patent No. 7,769,544 to Blesener et al.
- Ex. 1014: U.S. Provisional Patent Application No. 60/289,320 to Blesener et al.
- Ex. 1015: Affidavit of Christopher Butler of Archive.org, February 24, 2017, http://web.archive.org/web/20010717113545/http://rsac.fra.dot.gov/meetings/ptc_report.htm.
- Ex. 1016: Letter to Al Gore, President of the Senate, from Jolene Molitoris, Administrator of Federal Railroad Administration, regarding the RSAC Report, May 17, 2000 and coversheet of the RSAC Report forwarded therewith.
- Ex. 1017: Report of the Railroad Safety Advisory Committee to the Federal Railroad Administrator, *Implementation of Positive Train Control Systems* (September 8, 1999), FRA Research & Development Library.
- Ex. 1018: Railroad Safety Advisory Committee (RSAC) Meeting Minutes, September 8, 1999.
- Ex. 1019: Letter to RSAC PTC Working Group Members and Alternates from Grady Cothen, and Attached Report of the Railroad Safety Advisory Committee to the Federal Railroad Administrator, *Implementation of Positive Train Control Systems* (July 1999), Illinois Dept. of Transportation.
- Ex. 1020: Journal of the Senate, May 22, 2000.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.