

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES CORP.,

Petitioner,

v.

BOSTON SCIENTIFIC SCIMED, INC.,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-01298

Patent 7,749,234

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
PATENT OWNER’S LIST OF EXHIBITS	iv
I. STATEMENT OF RELIEF REQUESTED	1
II. INTRODUCTION	1
III. BACKGROUND AND OVERVIEW OF THE ’234 PATENT	2
IV. THE ART AND GROUNDS OF UNPATENTABILITY RELIED ON BY PETITIONER.....	5
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION AND THE DISTRICT COURT PROCEEDING.....	6
VI. PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF UNPATENTABILITY IN EACH OF ITS GROUNDS OF CHALLENGE.....	8
A. Ground 1: Patentability Of Claims 1–3, 5–8, 13, 15, And 18– 20 In View Of Olympus, The Knowledge Of A POSITA, And/Or Burton, Fischell ’507, Williams, Or Fischell ’274	9
1. The References Fail To Disclose Every Limitation Of Claims 1–3, 5–8, 13, 15, And 18–20	9
2. Petitioner Has Not Met Its Burden Of Demonstrating A Motivation To Combine References.....	18
B. Ground 2: Patentability Of Claims 1–3, 5, 13, 15, And 18–20 Over Fischell ’274 In View Of Burton, In Further View Of The Knowledge Of A POSITA And/Or Williams	28
1. The References Fail To Disclose Every Limitation Of Claim 1–3, 5, 13, 15, And 18–20.....	28
2. Petitioner Has Not Met Its Burden Of Demonstrating A Motivation To Combine References.....	29
C. Ground 3: Patentability Of Claims 1, 6–8, 13, 15, And 18–20 Over Sugiyama ’032 In View Of Fischell ’507 And Further In View Of The Knowledge Of A POSITA And/Or Williams.....	33
1. The References Fail To Disclose Every Limitation Of Claims 1, 6–8, 13, 15, and 18–20	34

2.	Petitioner Has Not Met Its Burden Of Demonstrating A Motivation To Combine References.....	37
D.	Ground 4: Patentability Of Claims 1–3, 5, 13, 15, 19, and 20 As Anticipated By Ravenscroft And/Or Obvious In View Of The Knowledge Of A POSITA And/Or Williams	39
1.	Ravenscroft Fails To Disclose Every Limitation Of The Challenged Claims	39
2.	Petitioner Has Not Met Its Burden Of Demonstrating A Motivation To Combine References.....	49
VII.	CONCLUSION.....	50

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Activision Blizzard, Inc. v. Acceleration Bay, LLC</i> , IPR2016-00727, Paper 13 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 9, 2016).....	22
<i>Broadcom Corp. v. Emulex Corp.</i> , 732 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	21
<i>Exacq Techs., Inc., v. JDS Techs., Inc.</i> , IPR2016-00567, Paper 7 (P.T.A.B. July 15, 2016).....	21, 22
<i>Grain Processing Corp. v. Am. Maize-Prods. Co.</i> , 840 F.2d 902 (Fed. Cir. 1988)	27
<i>Ex parte Levy</i> , 17 U.S.P.Q.2d 1461 (B.P.A.I. 1990)	46
<i>Net MoneyIN, Inc. v. VeriSign, Inc.</i> , 545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	47
<i>In re Oelrich</i> , 666 F.2d 578 (C.C.P.A. 1981).....	11, 46
<i>Palo Alto Networks, Inc. v. Finjan, Inc.</i> , IPR2016-00165, Paper 7 (P.T.A.B. Apr. 21, 2016)	21
<i>Plas-Pak Indus., Inc. v. Sulzer Mixpac AG</i> , 600 F. App'x 755 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	22
<i>In re Rijckaert</i> , 9 F.3d 1531 (Fed. Cir. 1993)	11, 46
<i>Seabery N. Am., Inc. v. Lincoln Global, Inc.</i> , IPR2016-00749, Paper 13 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 21, 2016).....	24
STATUTES, RULES AND REGULATIONS	
37 C.F.R. § 1.84(h)(3).....	44
37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a).....	10

37 C.F.R. § 42.107(a).....1
35 U.S.C. § 102..... 8
35 U.S.C. § 103.....11

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.