

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

BMW OF NORTH AMERICA, LLC, and  
BAYERISCHE MOTOREN WERKE AKTIENGESELLSCHAFT,  
Petitioner,

v.

THEODORE & ASSOCIATES, LLC,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2017-01379 (Patent 9,045,163 B2)  
Case IPR2017-01380 (Patent 9,045,163 B2)

---

Record of Oral Hearing  
Held: August 15, 2018

---

Before MITCHELL G. WEATHERLY, FRANCES L. IPPOLITO, and  
SEAN P. O'HANLON, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Case IPR2017-01379 (Patent 9,045,163 B2)

Case IPR2017-01380 (Patent 9,045,163 B2)

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

JONATHON L. LINDSAY, ESQUIRE

JEFFREY D. SANOK, ESQUIRE

Crowell Moring

1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20004

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

THOMAS E. BEJIN, ESQUIRE

Bejin Bieneman, PLC

2000 Town Center

Suite 800

Southfield, MI 48075

SCOTT M. DANIELS

Westerman, Hattori, Daniels & Adrian LLP

1250 Connecticut Avenue, NW

Suite 700

Washington, DC 20036

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Wednesday, August 15, 2018, commencing at 1 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 - - - - -

2 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Good afternoon. Please be seated. If you'll  
3 give us a moment also to get our computers awakened. Are you ready?  
4 Excellent, thank you. So this is a hearing for two proceedings, IPR2017-  
5 01379 and IPR2017-01380, both of which relate to U.S. Patent No.  
6 9,045,163. Petitioner is BMW North America, LLC among others, I'm not  
7 going to try to pronounce the German entity's name even though I took  
8 German in college, and Patent Owner is Theodore & Associates, LLC.

9 I'm Judge Weatherly and I'm joined here to my left by Judge  
10 O'Hanlon and we're joined remotely by Judge Ippolito out on the West  
11 Coast. Because the camera through which Judge Ippolito is viewing the  
12 proceedings is mounted I believe behind me if you're addressing her you  
13 may want to look at the camera instead of me, it might make her feel a little  
14 more welcome and comfortable, more natural for her. Also when you're  
15 addressing slides during the presentation please be sure to let us know what  
16 slide number you're on. I can see the slide number and I think Judge  
17 O'Hanlon can see it, Judge Ippolito can't. It also makes the transcript much  
18 easier for us to use after the fact.

19 Pursuant to our Hearing Order, each party is going to have 60 minutes  
20 to present its argument today. Because of the similarity of the issues in the  
21 case we're going to do the argument in a combined way and I see the  
22 demonstrative exhibits have been prepared that way, so that's good.  
23 Petitioner will open because it bears the burden of persuasion. Patent  
24 Owner, you'll have a chance to respond and Petitioner you can reserve time

1 for a rebuttal that should be limited to addressing issues that are raised by  
2 the Patent Owner during its presentation.

3 Before we begin I'd like to have everyone introduce themselves,  
4 starting with the Petitioner including anybody that you've brought along with  
5 you.

6 MR. LINDSAY: Thank you, Your Honor. Jonathan Lindsay for  
7 Petitioner. I'll be arguing today.

8 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Excellent.

9 MR. LINDSAY: This is Jeff Santok.

10 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Okay. And Patent Owner.

11 MR. BEJIN: Good afternoon. Tom Bejin from Bejin Bieneman on  
12 behalf of Theodore & Associates. With me is Scott Daniels from  
13 Westerman Hattori. We have also Chris Theodore and his wife, Tracey  
14 Theodore.

15 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Thanks very much. Does either party want  
16 to address any of the Motions to Exclude or any objections that have been  
17 filed to the demonstratives before we get into the substance? I'm sort of  
18 hoping no to take my hand a little bit about that.

19 MR. LINDSAY: Not for Petitioner.

20 JUDGE WEATHERLY: But I don't want to stop anyone from  
21 making a presentation if they want to.

22 MR. BEJIN: We have one request --

23 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Sure.

24 MR. BEJIN: -- for consideration. On Friday the new guidelines were  
25 issued and we raised it with opposing counsel down in the cafeteria  
26 beforehand.

1 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Okay.

2 MR. BEJIN: Relative to a request that the Patent Owner receives a  
3 modest surrebuttal, so the new guidelines would allow a surreply brief. We  
4 had asked for a surreply brief relative to --

5 JUDGE WEATHERLY: I recall.

6 MR. BEJIN: -- kind of an unusual supplemental declaration that was  
7 submitted and I think under the guidelines that was denied properly at that  
8 time but the Law 360 article that I read this morning in the guidelines  
9 suggested that the Board would have authority to grant surrebuttals. So I  
10 wanted --

11 JUDGE WEATHERLY: By surrebuttal do you mean to refer to a  
12 surreply brief?

13 MR. BEJIN: No, I mean the last word.

14 JUDGE WEATHERLY: The last word during the hearing?

15 MR. BEJIN: Yes. So that's what was discussed in the 72 hours of  
16 commentary about the --

17 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Sure.

18 MR. BEJIN: -- new guidelines that was raised, we had asked for the  
19 surreply before and so as a replacement we're seeking --

20 JUDGE WEATHERLY: You'd like to have the last word today.

21 MR. BEJIN: We'd like to have the last word.

22 JUDGE WEATHERLY: And you discussed it with Petitioner's  
23 counsel?

24 MR. BEJIN: Yes, sir.

25 JUDGE WEATHERLY: Okay. And what's your position, if  
26 anything, on that?

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.