

Paper No. ____

Date Filed: Sep 6, 2017

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ULTRATEC, INC.
Petitioner

v.

SORENSEN IP HOLDINGS, LLC,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2017-01394

Patent No. 9,336,689

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	THE '689 PATENT	2
III.	THE '801 PATENT FINAL WRITTEN DECISION IS NOT DISPOSITIVE OF THE ISSUES PRESENTED IN THIS PRELIMINARY RESPONSE.	11
IV.	THE SKILLED ARTISAN	15
V.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	15
VI.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW THAT THERE IS A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT CLAIMS 1-12 AND 19 OF THE '689 PATENT ARE OBVIOUS.	16
A.	The Standard for Instituting <i>Inter Partes</i> Review on a Given Claim	16
B.	The Standard For Determining Obviousness Under 35 U.S.C. § 103	18
C.	Claim 1 Is Patentable Over The Combination of Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes.	21
1.	Detailed Description of Evidence in the Petition	23
2.	The Combination of Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes Does Not Disclose A “First Processor” that Performs the Recited Operations.	28
3.	The Combination of Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes Does Not Disclose a “Second Processor” that Performs the Recited Operations.	34
D.	Claims 2-12 are Patentable Over the Combination of Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes.	38
E.	Claim 5 is Patentable Over the Combination of Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes	39
F.	Claim 19 is Patentable Over The Prior Art.	40
1.	Engelke 2-Engelke 1 and Cervantes	42
2.	Engelke 2-Engelke 1, Cervantes, and The Florida Policy	46
3.	Engelke 2-Engelke 1, Cervantes, and Hutchins.....	54
VII.	CONCLUSION	57

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Apple Inc. v. Contentguard Holdings, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00451, Paper 9.....	13, 27, 56
<i>In re Bigio</i> , 381 F.3d 1320 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	46
<i>In re Clay</i> , 966 F.2d 656 (Fed. Cir. 1992)	46, 47
<i>In re Deminski</i> , 796 F.2d 436 (Fed. Cir. 1986)	46
<i>Dominion Dealer Sol., LLC v. Autoalert, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00225, Paper 15.....	12, 27, 56
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co.</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	46
<i>Hopkins Mfg. Corp. v. Cequent Performance Products, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00616, Paper 9.....	12, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 27, 56
<i>Kingbright Elec. Co. Ltd. v. Cree, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00746, Paper 8.....	13, 28, 56
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	18
<i>Nike, Inc. v. Adidas AG</i> , 812 F.3d 1326 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	12
<i>PAR Pharm., Inc. v. TWi Pharms., Inc.</i> , 773 F.3d 1186 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	18
<i>Sci. Plastic Prods. v. Biotage AB</i> , 766 F.3d 1355 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	47
<i>Verizon Servs. Corp. v. Cox Fibernet Va., Inc.</i> , 602 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	46

Wowza Media Sys., LLC v. Adobe Sys. Inc.,
IPR2013-00054, Paper 12.....13, 27, 56

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 10318, 38
35 U.S.C. § 103(a)18
35 U.S.C. § 3131
35 U.S.C. § 3141
35 U.S.C. §314(a)16

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. 42.104(b)(4).....28, 56
37 C.F.R. 42.108(c).....16
37 C.F.R. § 42.6(a)(ii).....59
37 C.F.R. § 42.6(a)(3)24
37 C.F.R. §42.22(a)(2).....28, 56

LISTING OF EXHIBITS PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.63(e)

Exhibit	Description
Ex. 2001	Declaration of Benedict J. Occhiogrosso
Ex. 2002	Curriculum Vitae of Benedict J. Occhiogrosso
Ex. 2003	The IEEE Standard Dictionary of Electrical and Electronics Terms (6 th ed. 1996)
Ex. 2004	Microsoft Press Computer Dictionary (3 rd ed. 1997)
Ex. 2005	NVRA Certifications

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.