

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ENFORCEMENT VIDEO, LLC

(d/b/a WatchGuard Video)

Petitioner

v.

DIGITAL ALLY, INC.

Patent Owner

Case IPR2017-01401

Patent 9,325,950

**PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE
TO PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
A.	Related Matters	1
B.	Summary of the '950 Patent	1
C.	Summary of the Cited Prior Art.....	2
1.	Pandey (Ex. 1002).....	2
2.	Monroe (Ex. 1003).....	3
3.	Sony User's Guide (Ex. 1004).....	4
D.	Summary of the Arguments for Patentability	5
E.	Level of POSITA	7
II.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	8
A.	"Encode" and "Decode"	8
B.	Other Claim Terms for Which WatchGuard Proposes a Construction.....	10
C.	Claim Terms Allegedly Governed By 35 U.S.C. § 112, ¶ 6.....	11
III.	GROUND 1: PANDEY IN VIEW OF MONROE AND THE SONY USER'S GUIDE DOES NOT RENDER CLAIMS 1-3, 13, AND 15-16 OBVIOUS	13
A.	Ground 1, Claims 1 and 13: The Cited Prior Art Does Not Teach the Claimed "a first video <i>camera</i> configured...to <i>associate</i> the encoded video with a first	

unique camera identifier” or “a first video <i>camera</i> ...configured to... <i>stamp</i> the encoded video with a first unique camera identifier”	13
B. Ground 1, Claims 1 and 13: The Cited Prior Art Does Not Teach the Claimed “second video camera configured to capture and encode video of the event”	28
1. Pandey Does Not Teach a Second Video Camera	30
2. It Would Not Have Been Obvious to Include a Second Video Camera	34
3. The Proposed Combination of Pandey and Monroe Would Not Have Rendered the Second Video Camera Obvious.....	42
C. Ground 1, Claim 1: The Cited Prior Art Does Not Teach a “central control unit configured to...timestamp”	47
D. Ground 1, Claims 2 and 15: Pandey Does Not Teach the Claimed “high speed bus”	50
E. Ground 1, Claims 3 and 16: The Cited Prior Art Does Not Teach a “hub”	53
IV. CONCLUSION.....	57

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Advanced Display Systems, Inc. v. Kent State Univ.</i> , 212 F.3d 1272 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	44
<i>Apple Inc. v. ContentGuard Holdings, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00445, Paper 9 (PTAB Jul. 9, 2015)	48
<i>Belden Inc. v. Berk-Tek LLC</i> , 805 F.3d 1064 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	35
<i>Biotec Biologische Naturverpackungen GmbH & Co. KG v. Biocorp, Inc.</i> , 249 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2001)	12
<i>Cuozzo Speed Techs. v. Lee</i> , 136 S. Ct. 2131 (2016)	9
<i>InfoBionic, Inc. v. Braemer Manuf., LLC.</i> , IPR2015-01704, Paper 11 (PTAB Feb. 16, 2016)	34
<i>InTouch Techs., Inc. v. VGO Commc 'ns, Inc.</i> , 751 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	35
<i>Mentor H/S, Inc. v. Med. Device Alliance, Inc.</i> , 244 F.3d 1365 (Fed. Cir. 2001)	12
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Proxyconn, Inc.</i> , 789 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	9
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	10
<i>Williamson v. Citrix Online, LLC</i> , 729 F.3d 1339 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	13

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 112(f)..... 12
35 U.S.C. § 313..... 1

Regulations

37 C.F.R § 42.5 61
37 C.F.R. § 42.24 60
37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b) 9

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.