Paper No.	
Date filed: February 20,	2018

### Filed On Behalf Of:

Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation

By:

Nicholas N. Kallas NKallas@fchs.com ZortressAfinitorIPR@fchs.com (212) 218-2100

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFI	CE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOAR	D

# WEST-WARD PHARMACEUTICALS INTERNATIONAL LIMITED, Petitioner,

v.

# NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION, Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-00507 Patent 8,410,131

## PATENT OWNER NOVARTIS'S RESPONSE TO PETITIONER WEST-WARD'S MOTION FOR JOINDER



Patent Owner Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation ("Novartis") does not oppose the January 17, 2018 joinder motion of West-Ward Pharmaceuticals International Limited ("West Ward") on the conditions regarding the conduct of the joint proceeding set forth in West-Ward's joinder motion: (i) Ward-Ward will act as a silent understudy in the joint proceeding for so long as the Petitioner Breckenridge Pharmaceutical, Inc. ("Breckenridge") in *Breckenridge* Pharmaceutical, Inc. v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation, IPR2017-01592 (the "Breckenridge IPR") is in the joint proceeding; (ii) West-Ward consents to consolidated filings for all substantive papers, not exceeding the normal word count or page limits for a single party as set forth in the rules, and agrees that West-Ward will not file, or request to file, any separate briefs beyond the consolidated filings in the joint proceeding; (iii) West-Ward consents to consolidated discovery in the joint proceeding and agrees that West-Ward will not request additional cross-examination or redirect time; and (iv) unless the Breckenridge IPR has been terminated with respect to Breckenridge, West-Ward agrees that Breckenridge will be responsible for the oral argument presentation before the Board and West-Ward will not request any additional time to independently argue before the Board or attempt to submit its own demonstratives. (Paper 3 at 7-10.)



Novartis respectfully requests that the Board order West-Ward to comply with the aforementioned conditions in the joint proceeding. Precedent exists for those limitations. See, e.g., Bungie, Inc. v. Acceleration Bay, LLC, IPR2016-00934, Paper 11 (July 8, 2016) at 13-14 (granting Bungie's motion for joinder, ordering that petitioners consolidate all briefing under the page limits of 37 C.F.R. § 42.24, and ordering that Bungie not file any additional pages to address points of disagreement with the Activision petitioners without first moving for and obtaining the Board's permission); ZTE USA, Inc. v. Evolved Wireless LLC, IPR2016-01280, Paper 8 (Dec. 21, 2016) at 4 (consolidating identical IPR petitions sua sponte, and ordering that petitioners "will share all time permitted for depositions and will file all papers, except for papers that do not involve the other petitioner, as a consolidated paper, and that consolidated papers will not be given additional pages or words unless otherwise authorized by the Board."). Cf. Teva Pharms. USA, Inc. v. Viiv Healthcare Co., IPR2015-00550, Paper 11 (June 25, 2015) at 6 (denying joinder where joinder raised the prospect that the parties and the Board would have to manage burdensome additional pages of briefing); Famy Care Ltd v. Allergan, Inc., IPR2017-00566, Paper 12 (July 12, 2017) at 9-10 (denying joinder where petitioner did not concede to taking a "silent understudy" role).



### Respectfully submitted,

Dated: February 20, 2018

/ Nicholas N. Kallas /
Nicholas N. Kallas
Registration No. 31,530
Lead Counsel for Patent Owner
FITZPATRICK, CELLA, HARPER
& SCINTO
1290 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10104-3800
Tel. 212-218-2100



#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of Patent Owner Novartis's Response To Petitioner
West-Ward's Motion For Joinder was served on February 20, 2018 by causing it to
be sent by email to counsel for Petitioner at the following email addresses:

Keith A. Zullow (kzullow@goodwinprocter.com)

Marta E. Delsignore (mdelsignore@goodwinprocter.com)

Dated: February 20, 2018

/ Nicholas N. Kallas / Nicholas N. Kallas Registration No. 31,530 FITZPATRICK, CELLA, HARPER & SCINTO 1290 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10104-3800 Tel. 212-218-2100

