

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE  
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS LTD.,

Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2018-01133, Patent 9,538,152 B2,  
Case IPR2018-01140, Patent 9,402,032 B2  
Case IPR2018-01146, Patent 9,568,712 B2<sup>1</sup>

---

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING  
Held: October 8, 2019

---

Before MARC S. HOFF, BRYAN MOORE, and MONICA ULLAGADDI,  
*Administrative Patent Judges.*

Case IPR2018-01133, Patent 9,538,152 B2,  
Case IPR2018-01140, Patent 9,402,032 B2  
Case IPR2018-01146, Patent 9,568,712 B21

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

MICHAEL S. PARSONS, ESQUIRE  
DAVID O'BRIEN, ESQUIRE  
Haynes Boone LLP  
2505 North Plano Road  
Suite 4000  
Richardson, TX 75082

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

MARC A. FENSTER, ESQUIRE  
NEIL A. RUBIN, ESQUIRE  
Russ August & Kabat  
12424 Wilshire Blvd.  
12th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90025

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, October 8, 2019, commencing at 9:30 a.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia, before Donna Jenkins, Notary Public.

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 - - - - -

3 JUDGE ULLAGADDI: Good morning. Welcome to the  
4 Patent Trial and Appeal Board. We are here today for oral argument in Inter  
5 Partes Review matter No. 2018-01133, 2018-01140 and 2018-01146, cases  
6 in which Apple is the Petitioner and Corephotonics is the Patent Owner.  
7 Your panel for the hearing today includes myself, Judge Moore to my left  
8 and Judge Hoff to my right. I would like to start by getting the appearances  
9 of counsel. Who do we have on behalf of Petitioner?

10 MR. PARSONS: Your Honor, Michael Parsons on behalf of  
11 Petitioner Apple. I'm from Haynes & Boone.

12 MR. O'BRIEN: David O'Brien from Haynes & Boone also on  
13 behalf of Apple. We also have two colleagues in the gallery, Ms. Hong Shi  
14 and Mr. Jordan Maucotel, as well as our client Mr. Aron (indiscernible) is  
15 here.

16 JUDGE ULLAGADDI: Thank you. And who do we have on  
17 behalf of Patent Owner?

18 MR. FENSTER: Good morning, Your Honors. Marc Fenster  
19 with Russ, August & Kabat on behalf of Patent Owner Corephotonics.

20 MR. RUBIN: Good morning, Neil Rubin also of Russ, August  
21 & Kabat on behalf of Corephotonics.

22 JUDGE ULLAGADDI: Thank you all and thank you all for  
23 joining us today. I have a few administrative matters that I'd like to go over

Case IPR2018-01133, Patent 9,538,152 B2,  
Case IPR2018-01140, Patent 9,402,032 B2  
Case IPR2018-01146, Patent 9,568,712 B21

1 before we get started. Each party will have two hours and fifteen minutes to  
2 argue their cases and the way we'd like to break this up is we would like to  
3 address the two related cases first, so Petitioner you would get ninety  
4 minutes, Patent Owner ninety minutes and Petitioner can reserve whatever  
5 portion of that ninety minutes for your rebuttal. We'll take a brief break and  
6 then we'll return for the final case where we will take 45 minutes and 45  
7 minutes.

8           So we're going to hear first from Petitioner. Petitioner, you will  
9 present your arguments in chief. Patent Owner you'll be then permitted to  
10 present your arguments. Petitioner, for the first two cases would you like to  
11 reserve any time for rebuttal?

12           MR. PARSONS: Your Honor, I just want to clarify. Would  
13 you like us to address both the 1140 and the 1146 case within that 90  
14 minutes so, in other words, in my original would you like me to address all  
15 the issues across those two cases and then have opposing counsel do their  
16 presentation on the same two cases?

17           JUDGE ULLAGADDI: That is correct.

18           MR. PARSONS: Okay. Thank you. In that case I think I  
19 would like to have an hour and then I would like to reserve 30 minutes for  
20 rebuttal.

21           JUDGE ULLAGADDI: Okay. Thank you. Let me just get the  
22 timer set here.

23           MR. O'BRIEN: Your Honor, we didn't frankly thought that you  
24 might go down like that. We're going to reshuffle our counsels, backup

1 counsel for the one set of cases (indiscernible) at the table. Is there a time  
2 that you'd like to let us do that?

3 JUDGE ULLAGADDI: Whenever you're comfortable doing  
4 that. Sure.

5 MR. PARSONS: Your Honors, I have slide decks and papers if  
6 you would like to have copies of those.

7 JUDGE ULLAGADDI: I think we have the electronic copy,  
8 we're okay.

9 MR. PARSONS: Okay.

10 MR. FENSTER: Your Honor, the court reporter would  
11 probably --

12 MR. PARSONS: She has a copy of it.

13 MR. FENSTER: Excuse me, Your Honor. So just to clarify  
14 the oral order for the hearing determined that the two lens cases, the 032 and  
15 the 712, would not be consolidated but would be heard differently because  
16 they address different issues, different prior art, different claims. Counsel  
17 had both prepared to do the 032, then the 712. I would suggest that if it's  
18 okay with the Board then we proceed that way because then, you know,  
19 you'll hear responsive arguments on the 032 back and forth and then the 712  
20 as opposed to having them intermingle. I just want to throw that out there as  
21 it seemed to be what the Oral order had contemplated the hearing, the order  
22 for oral argument had contemplated and that's the way we had prepared for  
23 it. We think that makes more sense but happy to do it however the panel  
24 feels.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.