

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

QUALCOMM INCORPORATED,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-01249
Patent 7,693,002 B2

Record of Oral Hearing
Held: October 10, 2019

Before TREVOR M. JEFFERSON, DANIEL J. GALLIGAN, and
SCOTT B. HOWARD, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Case IPR2018-01249
Patent 7,693,002 B2

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

KEN HOOVER, ESQUIRE
W. KARL RENNER, ESQUIRE
TIMOTHY W. RIFFE, ESQUIRE
WHITNEY A. REICHEL, ESQUIRE
Fish & Richardson P.C.
1000 Maine Avenue, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20024
202-626-6447

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

DAVID B. COCHRAN, ESQUIRE
JOSHUA R. NIGHTINGALE, ESQUIRE
Jones Day
North Point
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-1190
216-586-7302

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, October 10, 2019, commencing at 3:58 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 - - - - -

3 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Thank you. You can be seated we'll wait for
4 the other judges to join us, although I think they can hear us.

5 JUDGE GALLIGAN: This is Judge Galligan in the Texas Regional
6 Office. Can you hear me?

7 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Yes, I can.

8 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Great.

9 JUDGE HOWARD: And this is Judge Howard, can you hear me?

10 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Yes; yes, we can. You can proceed, Judge
11 Galligan -- or, Judge Howard, I'm sorry.

12 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Great. Thank you. Good afternoon, I'm
13 Administrative Patent Judge Galligan; and I'm joining from the Texas
14 Regional Office as I said. Before you is Judge Jefferson; and on video is
15 Judge Howard. This an IPR, an Inter Partes Review in IPR 2018-1249; U.S.
16 Patent 7,693,002. Petitioner is Apple, and Qualcomm is the Patent Owner;
17 and we issued an oral hearing in this case allocating 45 minutes of argument
18 to each party; and now I'd like to ask Counsel for each side to come forth
19 and make appearances at the podium and please make sure the green light is
20 on, on the microphone. Petitioner, please, first.

21 MR. RENNER: Good afternoon, Your Honors. This is Karl Renner
22 from Fish & Richardson; and I'm joined by several colleagues -- Tim Riffe,
23 Ken Hoover, and Whitney Reichel on behalf of Apple.

24 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Great. And while I have you up there, how
25 much rebuttal time would you like to reserve of your 45 minutes?

1 MR. RENNER: Thank you, Your Honor; we'll reserve 15 minutes.

2 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Okay; thank you.

3 MR. RENNER: Also we have printed demonstratives. May we
4 approach Judge Jefferson with them?

5 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Yes.

6 MR. RENNER: Thank you.

7 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Patent Owner?

8 MR. COCHRAN: Good afternoon. Dave Cochran from Jones Day
9 on behalf of the Patent Owner, Qualcomm. With me today is an associate
10 from Jones Day, Josh Nightingale. We also have our trial technician, Alan
11 Eaton; and with us in the audience we have Ron Zhang, Ken Vu, Steve
12 Worth, and Yi Tang who are representatives of Qualcomm.

13 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Thank you. And would you like to reserve
14 sur-rebuttal time?

15 MR. COCHRAN: Yeah; I'd like to reserve 10 minutes; and we also
16 have a set of demonstratives for Judge Jefferson if you'd like to receive
17 those.

18 JUDGE JEFFERSON: Thank you.

19 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Thank you, Counsel. Petitioner, you may
20 proceed first; after that Patent Owner may respond. Petitioner, you'll get
21 your 15 minutes of rebuttal time if you have that much left; and then Patent
22 Owner, you are entitled to your sur-rebuttal time. Because Judge Howard
23 and I are remote, please identify with particularity and for the purpose of the
24 record, the transcript, anything you cite -- for instance, the demonstratives
25 and the briefing. We have access to everything. Just please state the slide

1 number, or the page of the petition, or whatever you're looking at. And with
2 that, Petitioner, you may begin.

3 MR. HOOVER: Good afternoon, Your Honors. My name is Ken
4 Hoover; along with my colleagues Tim Riffe, Karl Renner, and Whitney
5 Reichel. We represent Petitioner, Apple.

6 Slide 2 -- Your Honors, during our presentation today, we plan to
7 focus our time on several distinct issues that have arisen during the briefings
8 in this IPR rather than repeating an element-by-element analysis of the
9 petition. I will be providing an overview of the '002 Patent itself, and
10 addressing issues 1 and 3; my colleague, Tim Riffe, will address issue 2.

11 Slide 3 - First, I'd like to provide a very brief overview of the '002
12 Patent. On slide 4, the focus of the '002 Patent is on a wordline driver
13 system for memory arrays; and in particular, figure 1 of the '002 Patent
14 provides the most high level illustration of the patent's content. The '002
15 Patent, itself, describes figure 1 as a block diagram of a particular illustrative
16 embodiment of a wordline driver system, including a plurality of groups of
17 wordline drivers associated with the memory array.

18 On slide 5, we see that Qualcomm's expert, Dr. Pedram explained
19 during his deposition that figure 1 is a functional block diagram and as such
20 a POSITA wouldn't understand such drawings to provide the artisan with a
21 functional illustration of a system; and is not intended to illustrate the
22 specific circuit implementation of that system.

23 Slide 6 - So we intend to begin with issue 1, with the Asano/Itoh
24 ground. We're beginning with what is the second ground from our petition
25 because it's the most straightforward one of the two grounds presented and

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.