

PUBLIC VERSION

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2019-00880
U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749

DECLARATION OF DR. SHORYA AWTAR

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. PRIORITY DATE AND LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART3

III. QUALIFICATIONS4

IV. RELEVANT LEGAL STANDARDS5

V. OVERVIEW OF THE TECHNOLOGY DISCLOSED IN THE 749 PATENT7

 A. Firing Drive10

 B. Retraction Assembly14

VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION20

 A. “firing member”22

 B. “retraction assembly”22

 C. “firing drive”26

 D. “closure drive”29

VII. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART CITED BY PETITIONER31

 A. Shelton II (IS-1004).....31

 B. Swayze (IS-1005).....38

 C. Shelton I (IS-1006).....39

IX. SHELTON II DOES NOT ANTICIPATE OR RENDER OBVIOUS THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT59

PUBLIC VERSION

A. Shelton II Does Not Anticipate Claims 1 or 3 Because It Does Not Disclose the Claimed Retraction Assembly60

 1. Shelton II Does Not Anticipate Claims 1 or 3 if Its Retraction Spring Becomes Disconnected64

 2. A POSITA Would Not Immediately Envision the Claimed Retraction Assembly68

B. Shelton II Does Not Render Obvious the Claimed Invention of the 749 Patent80

X. SWAYZE DOES NOT ANTICIPATE OR RENDER OBVIOUS THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT84

 A. Swayze Does Not Anticipate Claims 1 or 3 Because It Does Not Disclose the Claimed Retraction Assembly85

 B. Swayze Does Not Anticipate Claims 1 and 3 if Its Retraction Spring Becomes Disconnected.....87

 C. It Would Not Have Been Obvious to a Person of Ordinary Skill To Remove the Retraction Spring From Swayze’s Device89

XI. SHELTON I CANNOT ANTICIPATE OR RENDER OBVIOUS THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT98

XII. JURAT99

PUBLIC VERSION

I. INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Dr. Shorya Awtar. I have been retained by counsel for Patent Owner Ethicon LLC (“Ethicon”) in the above captioned *inter partes* review to consult with counsel, review documents, form opinions and prepare expert declarations, and be available to testify as to my opinions.

2. I understand that Petitioner Intuitive Surgical Inc. (“Intuitive”) has asserted that Claims 1 and 3 of U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749 (the “749 Patent”) are invalid as anticipated and/or obvious. I have been asked to give expert opinions and testimony related to the issue of the validity of Claims 1 and 3 of the 749 Patent, including the background of the technology at issue, and the scope and content of the prior art.

3. My opinions are based on reviewing the relevant portions of the documents listed below:

IS-1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749 to Schall, et al. (“749 Patent”)
IS-1002	Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the 749 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
IS-1003	Declaration of Dr. Knodel, including Curriculum Vitae
IS-1004	US Patent Publication No. 2006/0175375 (“Shelton II”)
IS-1005	US Patent Publication No. 2005/0178813 (“Swayze”)
IS-1006	U.S. Patent No. 8,322,455

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.