

PUBLIC VERSION

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2019-00880
U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749

PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. THE 749 PATENT	6
A. Overview	6
B. The 749 Patent’s Novel Retraction Assembly	9
C. The Challenged Claims	14
III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	15
A. “firing member”	16
B. “retraction assembly”	16
C. “firing drive”	21
D. “sole retraction motion”	23
E. “closure drive”	24
IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL	24
■ [REDACTED]	
■ [REDACTED]	
■ [REDACTED]	
VI. THE PRIOR ART	41
A. Shelton II	42
B. Swayze.....	46

C. Shelton I47

VII. GROUND 1: SHELTON II DOES NOT ANTICIPATE THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT47

A. Shelton II Does Not Disclose a “Retraction Assembly” As Required By Claims 1 and 3 of the 749 Patent48

B. Shelton II Does Not Anticipate Claims 1 and 3 if the Retraction Spring Becomes Disconnected.....52

C. A POSITA Would Not Immediately Envision the Claimed Retraction Assembly56

VIII. GROUND 1: SHELTON II DOES NOT RENDER OBVIOUS THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT63

A. Shelton II Cannot Be Used Under 35 U.S.C. § 10364

B. Shelton II Does Not Render Obvious the Claims of the 749 Patent67

1. Petitioner Has Failed to Demonstrate a Motivation to Remove Shelton II’s Retraction Spring67

2. Removing the Retraction Spring in Shelton II Changes its Principal of Operation.....70

3. Removing the Retraction Spring of Shelton II Would be Inconsistent with the Conventional Wisdom in the Art.....72

4. Shelton II Would Be Ineffective at Retracting the Firing Member if the Spring Were Removed72

IX. GROUND 2: SWAYZE DOES NOT ANTICIPATE THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT73

A. Swayze Does Not Disclose the Claimed Retraction Assembly73

B. Swayze Does Not Disclose the Claimed Retraction Assembly Based on Patent Owner’s Infringement Contentions74

X. GROUND 2: SWAYZE ALONE OR IN COMBINATION WITH SHELTON II DOES NOT RENDER OBVIOUS THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT76

 A. A POSITA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Remove Swayze’s Retraction Spring77

 B. Petitioner’s Purported Motivations to Remove Swayze’s Retraction Spring Fail to Demonstrate a Motivation to Combine78

XI. GROUND 3: SHELTON I IS NOT PRIOR ART TO THE 749 PATENT81

XII. CONCLUSION.....82

PATENT OWNER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit #	Description
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ex. 2010	U.S. Patent No. 5,465,895 (1995)
Ex. 2011	U.S. Patent No. 5,632,432 (1997)
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ex. 2016	<i>In the Matter of Certain Reload Cartridges for Laparoscopic Surgical Staplers</i> , Inv. No. 337-TA-1167, Order 15: Construing the Terms of the Asserted Claims of the Patents at Issue (January 7, 2020).
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.