

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2019-00880
U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749 B2

**PATENT OWNER'S SECOND SET OF OBJECTIONS TO
ADMISSIBILITY OF EVIDENCE SERVED BY PETITIONER INTUITIVE
SURGICAL, INC. IN *INTER PARTES* REVIEW**

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b), Patent Owner Ethicon LLC, hereby objects as follows to the admissibility of evidence filed by Petitioner Intuitive Surgical, Inc. in *Inter Partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749 (IPR2019-00880).

Evidence	Objections
Exhibit 1015	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p> <p>Patent Owner maintains the objections made during the deposition of Dr. Awtar.</p>
Exhibit 1016	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p>

Evidence	Objections
Exhibit 1017	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p>
Exhibit 1018	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p>
Exhibit 1019	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues,</p>

Evidence	Objections
	undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.
Exhibit 1020	<p>Lack of Foundation: Petitioner has not provided sufficient explanation of what the exhibit is or what it allegedly shows.</p> <p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit’s probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p> <p>FRE 802: The exhibit is inadmissible hearsay if offered to prove the truth of any matter allegedly asserted therein.</p> <p>FRE 805: The exhibit contains improper hearsay within hearsay.</p> <p>FRE 901: Petitioner has not produced evidence sufficient to support a finding that the exhibit is what Petitioner claims it is.</p>

Evidence	Objections
Exhibit 1021	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p>
Exhibit 1022	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues, undue delay, wasting time, or needlessly cumulative evidence.</p>
Exhibit 1023	<p>FRE 402: The exhibit is not relevant to any ground upon which trial was instituted.</p> <p>FRE 403: The exhibit's probative value to any ground upon which trial was instituted is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusing the issues,</p>

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.